Building a Collaborative Learning Environment

Stacey Van Gelderen, MS, RN
Assistant Professor
School of Nursing

Debate Environment

Student Debate Topics
- Moral
- Ethical
- Legal

Debate Structure
- Honor Pledge
  - Opening Statement:
    - Group A: 8 minutes
    - Group B: 8 minutes
  - Rebuttal:
    - Back and forth between the two groups: 10 minutes
- Closing Statement:
  - Group A: 2 minutes
  - Group B: 2 minutes
- Jury:
  - 5 minutes for decision
DEBATE 1: Moral Issue

You are working in a pediatric intensive care unit on an oncology floor. Your patient, Cassandra, is 9 months old and has an aggressive form of acute lymphoblastic leukemia. She is terminal. Her devoted parents are at her bedside. They are crying and begging you to give her more morphine and let her drift peacefully from this earth. They do not want her to suffer any more. You assess Cassandra and see that she is fidgeting, whimpering and periodically crying. She is drawing her knees up to her chest. Her respirations are 35, heart rate 148, and blood pressure is 60/30. You last gave morphine 10 minutes ago. She may receive morphine every 30-60 minutes as needed for pain. Do you give Cassandra the morphine?

Group A: Give Morphine vs. Group B: Withhold Morphine

DEBATE 2: Ethical Issue

You are working as a nurse on a pediatric unit when you admit a 16 year old boy, Johnny, with right flank abdominal pain. You auscultate his bowel sounds and find high pitched hypo active bowel sounds in all four quadrants. The doctor believes he has a paralytic ileus, requiring a placement of an NG tube through the nose into the stomach to help relieve abdominal distention and vomiting. The boy tells you he does not want the procedure performed because he is part of a faith healing group. He only wants to be treated for pain. You understand that your state law states that children under 16 years or older may make their own health care decisions. You also understand that if he does not have the NG tube placed the ileus may cause paralytic ileus, which will result in the intestine, the tissue may die, causing infection and possibly this condition is life threatening. What is your role as his nurse?

Group C: Treatment vs. Group D: Non-treatment

DEBATE 3: Legal Issue

You are working in a newborn nursery caring for 2 hour old, Jaycee. Jaycee was born during a precipitous vaginal birth and her mother has an active case of gonorrhea. Your orders read that you are to give prophylactic erythromycin ophthalmic ointment. Her mother is refusing all immunizations and erythromycin ointment for Jaycee. You understand that if you do not provide the ophthalmic ointment, it is likely that Jaycee will become blind. As Jaycee's nurse, do you give the ointment?

Group E: Treatment Vs. Group F: Non-treatment

Debate Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria Description</th>
<th>Points Possible</th>
<th>Points Awarded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written Argument</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective Communication</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevance of Evidence</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Evidence</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical Conclusion</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coherence of Argument</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Points: 50
Collaborative Work Skills: Peer Review Form

- Contributions towards group work
- Time-management
- Preparedness
- Working with Others
- Attitude
- Quality of Work

Student Feedback of Debate Experience

Evaluation Questions

1. I feel I understand the nurse's role within a moral conflict between family members and nurses.
2. I feel I understand the nurse's role within an ethical conflict between family members and nurses.
3. I feel I understand the nurse's role within a legal situation between family members and nurses.
4. I understand my responsibilities as a nurse to adhere to the American Nurses Association (ANA) Code of Ethics.
5. I understand it is important to validate my legal responsibilities through the MN Board of Nursing's Nurse Practice Acts.
6. Overall, I would recommend this debate experience for future students.

Student Comments about Debate Experience

- I really enjoyed this activity!
- I enjoyed the debate! Good switch up from class to learn.
- It was a good experience and it put us in situations that we will have to eventually deal with.
- Making a valid argument for a side you don't agree with is very hard.
- Excellent activity—very thought-provoking.
- Went really well, it was a fun activity. I would recommend you continue the debate.
- It was a nice way to research ethical, moral, and legal aspects of nursing. I am not confrontational so debates are not my thing, but I thought the debates were very enjoyable. Would like more time to prepare. Came at a busy time so it was difficult to find time to get it done.
- I think the entire class should participate as the jury for each debate rather than splitting up in groups.
- Make sure each jury group knows what they are voting on; some members changed their mind for their vote. But, it was fun!

Student Feedback of Debate Experience

[Graph showing evaluation scale]

- Ethical
- Moral
- Legal
- ANA Code
- MN Board of Nursing
- Other