

VOLUME 33

2006



"True Lies" and Political Sincerity:

An Examination of Arnold Schwarzenegger's Credibility
as Reflected in JoinArnold.com

If it Worked for Aristotle, it Should Work for Us:

Introducing Mimesis to the Contemporary Classroom

A Touch of the Wild Side: A Fantasy-Theme and
Feminist Analysis of the Twins III

Epideictic Rhetoric in the New York Times:

Announcements of Lesbian and Gay Commitment Rites

No Trespassing Allowed:

Print Media Reproduces the Othering of the Hmong

Engaging Communication in Community

An Exercise in the Creative Process for High School
Theatre Design Students

Speech Buddy Assignment x 3

The Application Interview: Engaging Education Majors
in Communication Course Material

Nonverbal Communication: A Frequent Guest on the
Tonight Show with Jay Leno

COMMUNICATION & THEATER ASSOCIATION OF MINNESOTA
JOURNAL



COMMUNICATION AND THEATER ASSOCIATION OF MINNESOTA JOURNAL

Volume 33

Summer 2006

2006 Annual CTAM Conference

Mankato, MN

September 15-16, 2006

EDITOR

Nanette Johnson-Curiskis
Minnesota State University, Mankato

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

David Beard, University of Minnesota, Duluth
Mark Braun, Gustavus Adolphus College
Christa Brown, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Verna Corgan, Hamline University
Dan Cronn-Mills, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Kristen Cvancara, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Mike Dreher, Bethel University
John Katsion, Regent University
Kathryn Kelley, Metropolitan State University
Tom Kuster, Bethany Lutheran College
Desiree Rowe, Arizona State University
Warren Sandmann, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Tom Kuster, Bethany Lutheran College
Larry Schnoor, Minnesota State University, Mankato
Sara Wolter, Gustavus Adolphus College

CTAM ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS

Dan Cronn-Mills, MN State University, Mankato, President	daniel.cronn-mills@mnsu.edu
Jill Lofald, Duluth Denfeld High School, Past President	jill.lofald@duluth.k12.mn.us
Sandy Nieland, Rochester John Marshall, President Elect	sanieland@rochester.k12.mn.us
Larry Schnoor, Retired, Treasurer	lgene9535@aol.com
Nanette Johnson-Curiskis, MN State University, Mankato, Journal Editor	johnsn3@mnsu.edu
Cynthia Carver, Concordia College, Historian	carver@gloria.cord.edu
Karen P. Wilson, St. Olaf College, Secretary	wilsonk@stolaf.edu
Sarah Wolter, Gustavus Adolphus College, Newsletter Editor	swolter2@gustavus.edu

CTAM Website: www.mnsu.edu/spcomm/ctam/ctam.html

The Communication and Theater Association of Minnesota Journal is published annually, usually in the summer, by the COMMUNICATION AND THEATER ASSOCIATION OF MINNESOTA. Regular membership in CTAM includes the journal subscription. CTAM membership information may be obtained from any of the officers or by visiting the CTAM website at www.ctam.us/. Single issues of the CTAM Journal may be purchased by contacting the treasurer or editor. Academic institutions or departments may place advertisements in the Journal by contacting the editor.

COMMUNICATION AND THEATER ASSOCIATION OF MINNESOTA JOURNAL

Volume 33

Summer 2006

TABLE OF CONTENTS

General Interest Section

- "True Lies" and Political Sincerity: An Examination of Arnold Schwarzenegger's Credibility as Reflected in JoinArnold.com*
— Eric M. Fife 5
- If it Worked for Aristotle, it Should Work for Us: Introducing Mimesis to the Contemporary Classroom* — Deneen Gilmour 23
- A Touch of the Wild Side: A Fantasy-Theme and Feminist Analysis of the Twins III* — Richelle Maciej 35
- Epidictic Rhetoric in the New York Times: Announcements of Lesbian and Gay Commitment Rites* — Jeffrey A. Nelson. 51
- No Trespassing Allowed: Print Media Reproduces the Othering of the Hmong* — Julie M. Novak. 71

Teacher's Workbook Section

- Engaging Communication in Community*
— Christa Brown and Lynn Kuechle 83
- An Exercise in the Creative Process for High School Theatre Design Students* — Dan Dimond 89
- Speech Buddy Assignment x 3* — Louisa A. Eckert 97
- The Application Interview: Engaging Education Majors in Communication Course Material* — Karin-Leigh Spicer. 101
- Nonverbal Communication: A Frequent Guest on the Tonight Show with Jay Leno* — Amy J. Wolff 111

CTAM JOURNAL MISSION STATEMENT

The *Communication and Theater Association of Minnesota Journal* (CTAMJ) is the scholarly journal of the Communication and Theater Association of Minnesota (CTAM). The journal is an outlet for articles related to issues of discipline-related importance including articles discussing innovative teaching methods. All theoretical and methodological approaches are welcome.

Authors should submit a **digital** copy of their work as a Word document by e-mail to the editor. A separate, digital title page should include a 100-125 word abstract of the article, author's name and professional title, job title, the school or institutional affiliation of the author/s, a mailing address, and an e-mail address. Care should be taken that author identification has been removed from the manuscript itself for review purposes. **All manuscripts should be prepared according to current APA or MLA guidelines.**

CTAMJ encourages contributions from scholars and practitioners, who comprise all segments of the journal's readership, including K-12 educators, graduate school, community college, and college or university groups. The journal welcomes theoretical and applied articles from both the theater and communication disciplines. Capable scholars in the appropriate field will blindly review all general manuscripts.

No work will be accepted or rejected purely on the basis of its methodology or subject. Author sex, race, ethnic background, geographical location or work affiliation (secondary/college level, department, etc.) of the author(s) are never considered in making editorial judgments. The demands of the disciplines of speech communication and theater are key factors in the editorial judgments made. All editorial decisions attempt to balance these demands with the needs and interests of the journal's readers.

The journal is guided by three key principles:

- *To provide an outlet for the expression of diverse ideas.*
- *To publish high quality scholarship in the disciplines of Speech Communication and Theater.*
- *To meet the journal-related needs of CTAM and its members.*

EDITORIAL POLICY

The call for Manuscripts goes out in the fall of the year and the deadline for submissions is in March of the following year. Details of how to submit are given in the Call which is sent to all members, departments, and announced in SPECTRA. Book review ideas should be queried with the editor in advance of the submission date. Book reviews are generally published if accepted on a space available basis. All articles are read anonymously by at least two associate editors. All author identification markings are removed from the articles and no editor reads the work of a colleague. Associate editors may submit articles to the journal, but their work must go through the process of blind review, just as any other submitter. The journal editor facilitates the process and makes final decisions based on the associate editor's recommendations and comments. If there are any questions about the process, please direct them to the journal editor.

PERMISSIONS STATEMENT:

CTAM encourages scholars to use and make reference to work published in our journal. Scholars may quote, without permission, in order to document their own work. The *Journal* assumes each scholar shall be responsible in acknowledging and properly documenting such uses. Teachers may reproduce and distribute, free of copyright charges, portions of this journal solely for educational purposes. Any reproduction and distribution must acknowledge in writing the Journal as the primary source of the material.

CALL FOR MANUSCRIPTS VOLUME 34, SUMMER 2007

www.mnsu.edu/spcomm/ctam/ctam.html

The Communication and Theater Association of Minnesota Journal is seeking manuscripts for Volume 34, scheduled for publication in summer 2007. The journal welcomes theoretical and applied articles and teaching suggestions from theater, communication and forensics professionals from secondary and collegiate levels. All general articles will undergo a blind review process by a minimum of two reviewers. Manuscripts may be submitted for one of two sections: general interest research and essays, and teacher's workbook. Please indicate whether the manuscript is intended for the general interest research and essays section, or the teacher's workbook section. Contact the editor concerning book review proposals.

Authors should submit a **digital** copy of their work as a Word document by e-mail to the editor. A separate, digital title page should include a 100-125 word abstract of the article, author's name and professional title, job title, the school or institutional affiliation of the author/s, a mailing address, and an e-mail address. Care should be taken that author identification has been removed from the manuscript itself for review purposes. **All manuscripts should be prepared according to current APA or MLA guidelines.**

Authors are reminded to keep the *Journal* audience in mind: students and teachers at the high school, community college, private college, and university levels. All manuscripts must be submitted by March 31, 2007. Please e-mail manuscripts and any questions to Nanette Johnson-Curiskis, Editor, *Communication and Theater Association of Minnesota Journal*, 230 Armstrong Hall, Speech Communication Department, Minnesota State University Mankato, Mankato, MN 56001; 507-389-2213, nanette.johnson-curiskis@mnsu.edu or johnsn3@mnsu.edu.

***“True Lies” and Political Sincerity:
An Examination of Arnold Schwarzenegger’s Credibility
as Reflected in JoinArnold.com***

Eric M. Fife

Assistant Professor

School of Communication Studies

James Madison University

Harrisonburg, VA 22807

fifeem@jmu.edu

Abstract

The JoinArnold.com web site is discussed as a case study of the use of political campaign web sites to enhance candidate credibility. Arnold Schwarzenegger’s primary campaign site used both images and text to enhance his perceived goodwill, trustworthiness and expertise. The rhetorical challenge for this candidate was to mark him as a serious politician, both in a special recall election and for ongoing political ambitions, despite apparently very limited related experience. The web site largely succeeded in its goals, though it could have improved its efforts in establishing goodwill through more successful and creative interactivity.

Introduction

Unquestionably, the internet has been a vitally important tool for political candidates in spreading their message. Although the internet has not yet surpassed television as the persuasive medium of choice for politicians, still reliance on the web as a means of reaching a wide audience has grown dramatically since the 1996 presidential election, the first in which all of the primary hopefuls developed web sites (Klinenberg & Perrin, 2000). As internet usage has increased in this country, so has the importance of candidates viewing the web as an additional medium to reach potential voters.

To date, most of the research in how candidates use the internet has focused on presidential elections (e.g., Klinenberg & Perrin, 2000; Margolis et al, 1997; McKeown & Plowman, 1999). As political campaigns increasingly utilize the internet, web sites become more important for a larger category of elections — including statewide and even local elections. Howard Dean’s remarkable success at recruiting supporters and raising

funds online (Price, 2004) will surely accelerate this process further. As increasing numbers of candidates at various political levels employ the internet, it becomes more important for researchers to examine how they are using such sites.

One candidate who benefits from an online presence is California Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger, whose campaign site (<http://JoinArnold.com>) gave Californians an opportunity to learn more about the man most of them knew only from such movies as *Terminator* and *True Lies*. Formally launched in late August of 2003, the web site claimed many visits even prior to its official beginning (*JoinArnold.com*, 2004). Also, at least early in the short campaign, a large percentage of campaign contributions were secured via the web site (*JoinArnold.com*, 2004). Clearly, the web site was a significant part of the candidate's rapid push for the governorship in the special recall election.

This paper will use a case study methodology to examine the *JoinArnold.com* web site in detail, including its use of carefully chosen rhetoric and visual images. The focus of this analysis will be on the credibility of the candidate as constructed on the web site, with particular attention paid to how Schwarzenegger emphasizes three primary dimensions of credibility: expertise, goodwill and trustworthiness. It considers the strategic choices made by the Schwarzenegger campaign in highlighting some aspects of his credibility through the web site, while downplaying other elements of his well-known past. Therefore, the paper begins with a discussion of its conceptualization of credibility.

Literature Review

Credibility

From the time of Aristotle, personal credibility has been conceptualized as consisting of multiple dimensions. Roughly, the global term refers to the believability of an individual as seen through the eyes of a particular audience (Gass & Seiter, 2003). The exact nature of the dimensions of credibility, as well as their relative importance, has been the matter of continuing debate (see McCroskey & Teven, 1999; Thweatt & McCroskey, 1998; Gass & Seiter, 2003). This paper will employ a definition of credibility which seems both suitable for political analysis and supported by empirical research; specifically, credibility for this paper will be seen as consisting of perceived trustworthiness, goodwill (or caring) and expertise (McCroskey & Teven, 1999). Factor analytic research conducted as part of a process of constructing a measure for goodwill has provided strong evidence for the

existence and importance of all three dimensions (McCroskey & Teven, 1999). Political candidates will highlight and emphasize those aspects of credibility which best portray them as believable figures; each candidate will face different challenges in this endeavor. Credibility is accepted by researchers as a vital part of the persuasion process, contributing significantly to message acceptance (e.g., Chebat et al, 1990; Gass & Seiter, 2003). Lacking any obvious political experience/expertise, a candidate like Arnold Schwarzenegger used his web site to highlight other kinds of expertise, as well as underscore his trustworthiness and goodwill.

In addition to the personal credibility for which politicians strive, an analysis of the individual's believability as seen on the web would not be complete without a discussion of the credibility of that medium. The way in which a person evaluates political information on the web is related both to the content of the site and an individual's perception of the medium through which the site is accessed — the internet. As Johnson and Kaye (1998) suggested, "Credibility is crucial if the public is going to continue to embrace and accept the internet" (p. 325); this statement is particularly true for the proliferation and believability of political information. If "the internet is the equivalent of a political Wal-Mart," with a wide variety of political information available, it is important to understand how viewers use and evaluate the information found through this medium — as opposed to information gathered through other media (Johanson & Kaye, 2002).

Several studies have evaluated various aspects of internet credibility, which media researchers generally define as believability, though they vary in terms of operationalizing specific dimensions of that construct (e.g., Flanagin & Metzger, 2000; Johnson & Kaye, 2002). Overall, internet information is viewed as being as believable as information presented in most other types of media, with the exception of newspapers — which are seen as more credible (Flanagin & Metzger, 2000). Not all information is viewed as equally credible; internet users find commercial information less credible than news, reference and entertainment. Also, internet users do not frequently strive for independent verification of facts found on the web (Flanagin & Metzger, 2000).

In addition to information type, various aspects of internet users tend to impact their evaluation of web site credibility. According to Robinson & Kaye (2000), reliance on the internet tends to predict perception of its credibility. That is, people who rely on the internet for information (including, in the Robinson & Kaye (2000) study, online news sources) are more likely to believe it credible. Politically interested individuals seem to appreciate using the wide variety of political sites on the web, presumably

including candidate web sites, because "they can get the information they want from a wide variety of places when they want it and without having that information filtered by the [traditional] media" (Robinson & Kaye, 2000, p. 864). Also, the overall credibility of political content on the internet has increased from 1996 to 2000 (Johnson & Kaye, 2002).

Since Democrats and Republicans appear to use the internet in approximately equal numbers (Robinson & Kaye, 2000), both parties have an increasing interest in establishing and maintaining credible web sites which emphasize those aspects of their parties/candidates desired by the campaign. To date, researchers have primarily focused their attention on the use of web sites by candidates in presidential primaries and campaigns.

Previous analysis of campaign web sites

Klinenberg & Perrin (2000) in analyzing the use of web sites during the Republican primary identified six functions of the campaign sites. The first of these, *organization, networking and fundraising*, emphasizes the ability of a candidate site to cheaply reach and recruit a large number of people into the fold. *Political education and substance* refers to the dissemination of a large volume of material online, more cheaply than could be accomplished by other means (e.g., Holdren, 1995). *Community-building* involves using the site "to build identification with the campaign" (Klinenberg & Perrin, 2000, p. 20). *Cyber-celebration* highlights the power of the internet generally, while *links to other sites* allow users to visit sites the author of the candidate web page thinks would be of interest.

Finally, *interactivity* gives users the opportunity to "provide information to the campaigns or their web sites and to receive meaningful responses" (p. 21). Other authors have argued that these newer forms of mediated communication have tremendous potential to transform the nature of the American political landscape. London (1995) pointed out that "interactive telecommunications can foster increased civic participation in the democratic process" (p. 6). Similarly, Sakkas (1993), in an early analysis of online interaction focused on Clinton's 1992 presidential campaign, observed a "higher level of discussion" than he believed was typical of political exchanges (p. 8).

All of these functions have direct implications for a candidate's credibility, though some are more interesting than others for the current analysis. In the 1996 election, candidates' cyber-celebration involved a discussion of the newest technology (including, and apart from, the internet), thus increasing one aspect of their perceived expertise. In fact,

the Dole campaign, in particular, wanted to emphasize how their candidate was familiar with and used that technology (McKeown & Plowman, 1999). As is well known, the Gore campaign in 2000 went so far as to claim he had a significant role in the invention of the internet. Since the continuing spread of internet-based competence, it seems unlikely that today's candidates would emphasize this aspect of their expertise.

Clearly, the *political education and substance* portion of a site can contribute to the perception of a candidate's expertise and trustworthiness. A candidate might use carefully selected political materials to emphasize his political skills and experience, as Dole did effectively during the 1996 Republican primary (Klinenberg & Perrin, 2000). A candidate might also use such materials to establish a consistent voting record, showing the trustworthiness of a politician who can be counted on to consistently endorse a political ideology.

The *interactivity* potential of the candidate web site also can clearly contribute to an audience's impression of the candidate's goodwill. McCroskey and Teven (1999) suggested that goodwill consists of several components: understanding ("knowing another person's ideas, feelings and needs"), empathy (appreciation of those ideas, even those with which one disagrees), and responsiveness (reacting to another's messages) (p. 92). True interactivity, in which a person might type in a question or express a political opinion and receive an individualized response, can contribute to all of these facets of goodwill. A candidate (or staffer, more realistically) could show understanding by paraphrasing those ideas, and could show empathy by reacting thoughtfully to those ideas - even those with which the politician might disagree. Finally, merely replying can show responsiveness.

Analysis of past use of candidate web sites suggests that candidates have generally failed to provide a workable interactivity. McKeown and Plowman, in their analysis of the 1996 presidential campaign, suggested that "campaigns did not go beyond traditional communication practices for involving voters in campaigns, but demonstrated how this new medium could be used for increasing the amount of in-depth information available to voters" (1999, p. 344). Klinenberg and Perrin would agree, suggesting that "in 1996 political campaigning on the internet was merely an alternative way of publishing traditional campaign materials" (p. 34); they suggested that a "casual observation" of the 2000 sites implied a similar usage. However, Barnes (2003) pointed out the successful use of the internet to recruit supporters for the Bill Bradley presidential campaign, and noted that "Jesse Ventura of Minnesota credits the internet as a significant factor

in his campaign victory" (p. 302).

Candidates in the 2004 presidential primaries and elections appear to have utilized greater interactivity. As Price (2004) points out, Howard Dean "used the internet to organize supporters, publicize campaign events, raise funds and even seek advice" (p. 2). The drafting of Wesley Clark as a presidential candidate also involved internet interactivity. Both the Kerry (*JohnKerry.com*, 2004) and Bush (*GeorgeWBush.com*, 2004) web sites encouraged contacting candidates; in fact, the Kerry site added a screen which encourages visitors to provide contact information - before even reaching the main site! Although interactivity clearly is not the only way to show a candidate's goodwill, it likely will be an increasingly popular way to do so.

Research Question

Past research has examined the way in which presidential candidates have used the internet to enhance campaigning; however, less research has examined how candidates for other offices use the internet. Also, internet usage by candidates is constantly evolving, and published studies have not yet examined internet use by candidates in the most recent elections. Finally, Arnold Schwarzenegger faced a unique challenge - that of establishing and maintaining political credibility for a man who, until the special recall election, had never held any elected public office and only one unimportant political appointment. Considering the gaps in the literature outlined above, the following research question will be explored:

RQ: How did the *JoinArnold.com* web site, through use of text and images, attempt to influence the audience's perception of the candidate's credibility?

Method

This research employs a case study methodology (Yin, 1989), following a similar study conducted by McKeown and Plowman (1999). As Yin (1989) suggests, a case study is an appropriate method of answering "how" questions in contemporary situations in which the researcher has no control over events. Although a single case study does not necessarily allow generalization to many additional cases, it certainly allows a researcher to shed light on a particularly interesting example. The case study technique is also valuable in this instance because it allows a researcher to explore an event as it unfolds, as suggested by McKeown and Plowman (1999).

The data from this study emerged from an examination of the "JoinArnold.com" web site. Initial, informal observations occurred shortly after the site became "official," in the fall of 2003, and periodically for the following several months; more formal, detailed observations occurred over a two-week period in September 2004 (months after the candidate's successful campaign). During the formal observation, the researcher tracked the "top story" changes, and visited every primary link on the front page of the site, taking detailed notes. The researcher examined the graphic content as well as the text of the site, with an eye toward considering how the intentional choice of such material functions to bolster the perceived credibility of the candidate. The researcher also searched the site to uncover some elements which may have been displayed during the recall campaign. Also, the researcher tested interactivity elements of the site, a process which will be described below.

One significant limitation of this study involves the time period during which the web pages were examined. Because archived pages are not readily available, the researcher was forced to study the site formally after the recall election, although certainly much of the material remained following that election. Thus, although the recall election took place in the fall of 2003, the period of formal analysis did not begin until the fall of 2004. Some pages (i.e., the *Agenda* section) could be unearthed via careful searching of pages that apparently still exist, but are no longer prominently featured on the site. Another limitation involves the relatively short two-week period of formal analysis; the web site was thus treated as a static text, as opposed to a dynamic document. However, this limitation is minimized by the fact that apart from the "top stories" section, changes were minimal over that time period; the informal analysis prior to intensive study of the site also did not suggest major changes in content or images.

Results/Discussion

Arnold Schwarzenegger's rhetorical challenge

On July 24, 2003, Lieutenant Governor Cruz Bustamante, as required by California state law, issued a proclamation establishing October 7 as the date for a recall election. Activists had gathered sufficient signatures to force a special election to consider the continuing status of Governor Gray Davis, a widely unpopular Democrat. The proclamation set off a free-for-all, with 135 candidates eventually proclaiming their interest in the governorship (University of California at Berkeley library web site, 2004).

Arnold Schwarzenegger officially declared his candidacy August 6,

on the *Tonight Show* (University of California at Berkeley library web site, 2004). He immediately became the best-known individual running to replace Davis, but was faced with a challenge: How was he, as a man never appointed or elected to any significant political office, going to establish his credibility as a politician? Lacking the traditional credibility of a competitor like Bustamante, who had been Lieutenant Governor, how could he get voters to see him as a serious candidate who could solve the problems facing California, and not just another name (bigger than most) throwing his hat in the ring? His web site served as one tool to help establish this credibility; through it, the rhetorical strategies of the campaign are reflected.

JoinArnold.com

The establishing of credibility evident in the website begins with its very name. The standard name for a candidate web site features the name of the candidate — e.g., *JohnKerry.com*, *GeorgeWBush.com*. Likely, the primary reason for the choice of “*joinArnold*” as a name stems from the simple fact that Schwarzenegger is very difficult to spell. Also, this candidate is well-known to the public on a first-name basis, as there really are not too many famous people with the first name of Arnold. And, finally, emphasizing the first name makes a candidate seem less formal — more like one of us (or as much like one of us as a multimillionaire action hero can be). The *join* part of the title suggests a grassroots effort with which one should become involved.

During the examination period, the site itself had a very simple design. The top banner displayed title information, as well as two images of Arnold: *Smiling Arnold* (with a wise, all-knowing-yet-friendly grin) on the left and *Stern Arnold* (with a serious, more formal demeanor) on the right. At different places in the site, the left-hand image changed, but *Smiling Arnold* was always in evidence to welcome users. The left-side, featured links included first a link to the California Recovery Team, an aptly named group including the governor and some powerful friends. The goal of this group is to advance and/or inhibit ballot initiatives facing that state. The next left-side link was *get informed*; under this link, other possible links included about Arnold, leadership, endorsements, newsroom, and opinion. The *get informed* links contained the most graphic and textual information about the candidate, and are therefore the primary focus of this paper. The next link was *Join the Team*, which included *contribute*, *advocacy*, and *share your views*. The final left-side link was entitled *Services* — and included links for images, multimedia, downloads, searches, the privacy

policy and contact information. Other featured links (boxes, in this case) included another contribution link, the California Performance Review Report, the official governor's web site, and Maria Shriver's first lady web site. Some of these links, the first lady web site link in particular, were not added until after the recall election victory.

The page was dominated by the top news story, with initial paragraphs of that story as well as a picture of the governor. This story changed several times during the two-week formal observation period in September, 2004; it was first a glowing story about the governor's speech at the Republican National Convention, followed by a story about his initiative to encourage small businesses to move (Arnold is shown moving heavy boxes for someone). The next top story highlighted an opinion piece in *Wired* magazine, entitled "The New American Idol." This piece, of course, presented a glowing account of the governor's early-term achievements.

Formal analysis of links begins with the *About Arnold* text, featured prominently as the first link on the site. The banner changes for this page; *Smiling Arnold* always remained, but the right-side image of *Stern Arnold* was replaced by a picture of Arnold with what are presumably his parents. In fact, the *About Arnold* page begins what becomes a trend on the site — an emphasis on children. Of four images on this page, three were of children, and the text highlighted his accomplishments with children. It described the candidate's accomplishments as, reigning over the world of bodybuilding, being a successful businessman, rocketing to the top of the movie charts as an action hero, and, perhaps most importantly to Arnold, helping children through the Special Olympics, his Inner City Games Foundation, and leading the campaign to pass California's Proposition 49 to increase funding for after-school programs.

Arnold's education was also discussed, and a link was provided to his entertainment web site for more information about his movies (a brief discussion of Schwarzenegger's other web sites is provided in the conclusion of this article). Still, the primary emphasis was on the candidate's work with children, enhancing his perceived goodwill by showing he cares for children just as the users of the site would. As McCroskey and Teven (1999) suggested, goodwill is often conceptually defined as perceived caring, and what kind of perceived caring could be more important than caring for children?

Perhaps the most interesting aspect of the *About Arnold* text is what was NOT discussed — his role as action hero. Clearly, most potential voters in California remembered Arnold as "The Terminator," not as someone actively involved in Special Olympics. The goal of the link, and of the site

overall, was to emphasize those aspects of the candidate not as well known to viewers; the site can take for granted that the user has at least a passing familiarity with Schwarzenegger's movie career. Because people have trouble separating actors from roles, Arnold is likely viewed as a decisive, take-charge individual, and thus there is no need to emphasize this aspect of Schwarzenegger's persona. Instead, the goal of the *About Arnold* link, and indeed much of the remainder of the site, was to alter the credibility of the candidate to include a softer side — not just a willingness to “terminate the terrorists,” as the candidate himself said at the Republican National Convention, but an eagerness to embrace children.

Unlike many of the other candidates in the recall election, Arnold was granted a certain credibility as an actor who was not merely famous, but tended to play a particular role — one which involves a decisive defeat of evil forces. Thus, Arnold's expertise, in the minds of the *About Arnold* readers, exists in both his acting success and as borrowed from some helpful movie scripts. Therefore, the site works to emphasize goodwill, trustworthiness and other, lesser-known aspects of his expertise — such as his business success.

The next link explored, *Leadership*, led the user to a page headlined, “Schwarzenegger, the American Dream and Leadership.” Again, Schwarzenegger emphasized his leadership role in children's organizations; his challenge is to imply how his expert, trustworthy leadership in the roles described would translate into a leadership role as governor. Thus, he emphasized a variety of types of leadership, from his high-profile (but largely ceremonial) position as Chairman of the President's Council on Physical Fitness to his work with Special Olympics and other charitable organizations. Thus if he does not have the formal expertise of a lieutenant governor, he nevertheless has other kinds of leadership experience.

The *leadership* section did not merely list his positions, however; it noted how he was able to redefine those offices. For instance, referring to the President's Council, the page noted that Schwarzenegger “took what many regarded as a ceremonial post and made the position meaningful and important.” If Arnold can transform a leadership position, as he did on that occasion, perhaps he could also help restore the credibility of an office currently filled with a strongly disliked governor.

Again, the governor's film career was not formally discussed in the leadership section; instead the emphasis was on his leadership roles and business successes. Clearly, the authors of the site did not want to restate the obvious, that the governor had been an action hero; they viewed the site as an opportunity to list other accomplishments. Anyone expecting a

web site replete with images of *The Terminator* or the *Last Action Hero* would have been disappointed, as Schwarzenegger clearly wanted to be taken seriously as a candidate - and, of course, succeeded in that regard.

Other sections of the web site included the *image center*, which provided only images from the Republican Convention speech during the period of formal analysis, and the *endorsements* section. This section listed a range of people and organizations, from city council members to the California Republican Party, who endorsed Arnold in the recall election. The section was noteworthy primarily for its length, since it seemed to include virtually every citizen or group of California of any stature which supported Schwarzenegger. Arnold Schwarzenegger must be a very trustworthy individual, if all of these people and organizations familiar with him through the years endorsed him.

Three additional sections of the site need to be described. First, the *Arnold's agenda* section provided an exhaustively detailed discussion of his platform on a variety of issues. Previous analyses of presidential primary or campaign sites (e.g., Klinenberg & Perrin, 2000; McKeown & Plowman, 1999) suggested that this is one of the most important, prevalent functions of the candidate site: to provide a formal, unfiltered, lengthy discussion of a candidate's position. As discussed above, Klinenberg and Perrin (1990) refer to this capacity of a campaign web site as *political education and substance*. For Schwarzenegger, this material is particularly important because it suggests that he does have well-considered positions on a variety of issues. It is unlikely that even the most dedicated political junkie would read through all of the pages of text; however, the pages were conveniently organized by topic, including economy, education, energy, environment, immigration, reform, and workers' compensation. Again, much like the lengthy list of endorsements, credibility may be enhanced merely by providing this depth of information. It is also significant that Arnold shows his goodwill toward Californians by understanding that the economy is the most significant issue facing that state.

Finally, the *interactivity* components of the site encouraged contacting the candidate with ideas, as well as (of course) provide contributions. The researcher's attempts to utilize the site's interactivity were unsuccessful; the "contact" e-mail feature is apparently not maintained. The contribution features might, however, still be operational; the researcher did not test those.

Conclusion

The *JoinArnold* web site largely succeeded in fulfilling what may be the most obvious function of a campaign site: providing information about the candidate's history and issues, in a manner unfiltered by traditional mass media outlets (Klinenberg & Plowman, 2000). It also highlighted aspects of the candidate's credibility in a variety of ways, as summarized below.

The expertise of the candidate was highlighted through the discussion of leadership roles beyond the traditional political positions, including in business ventures and for charitable causes. In this campaign, the nontraditional political leadership roles may actually have been a strength of his — clearly, he is not a career politician of the type that got California into economic difficulty in the first place. Expertise was also emphasized through slightly accenting the physicality of the candidate — images on the site included Arnold moving boxes and posing as a bodybuilder. Before ever examining the site, users likely would have a mental image of the candidate as a physically strong individual who used that power in his action roles to vanquish various sorts of easily identified evildoers. In Arnold's major movie roles, only once was he cast as a true villain — and he overcame that characterization by appearing as a hero in the sequels. In his analysis of presidential images, Erickson (2000) noted that "Presidents enact a variety of fictive personae (personal and public) in order to heighten their authority and to avoid imposed characterizations" (p. 142). Arnold's fictive persona was already established, prior to the campaign — he is "The Terminator," and although he did not over-emphasize his Hollywood connections, still the site cleverly encouraged a user to think of Arnold in these physical terms, bringing to mind the decisive action heroes of his movie days.

Still, the site was careful not to overemphasize the candidate's two most obvious claims to fame: his Hollywood action roles and his marriage into one of the nation's leading political families. Only a few images of Maria Shriver appeared on the site, and the discussion of his film career was largely limited to brief allusions and links to his commercial movie site. Rather than emphasizing the obvious, the site instead chose to focus on the aspects of the candidate which may have been less familiar, while subtly reminding users of the better-known aspects of the candidate's persona.

The trustworthiness of the candidate also was emphasized in movie roles. According to McCroskey and Teven (1999), trustworthiness is characterized by "character, sagacity, safety, honesty" (p. 90). In his

prominent movie roles, Arnold did what he said he would do ("I'll be back") despite great odds — showing character. As suggested above, the site alluded to those roles through images of physicality and brief textual notes, but did not directly discuss them in any detail. Instead, the site emphasized the character of the family man, who cares about children and will be an honest politician.

Indeed, the continuing emphasis on the candidate's work with children, featured much more prominently than a discussion of Schwarzenegger's film roles, framed both his trustworthiness and goodwill. He is depicted as a man of character, who works extensively with children — showing his perceived caring for them through the kinds of personal sacrifices which have won him a variety of humanitarian awards. The candidate's goodwill was emphasized in other ways as well, including the implication that the economy is the most important issues facing California. Since the campaign cannot highlight typical elements of a candidate's expertise, it instead chose, through the web site at least, to emphasize other elements of expertise, trustworthiness, and goodwill, as discussed above.

The site may be making one significant mistake with respect to goodwill, however. A user might be frustrated by the fact that at least some of the interactivity components of the site no longer worked (if, in fact, they ever did — see the limitations section which follows). Interactivity has the potential to contribute substantially to perceived goodwill, as candidates can show their understanding, empathy and responsiveness through their internet conversations with potential voters. The Schwarzenegger site was not alone, however, in not accenting interactivity, and thus failing to fulfill both the idealistic hopes of some internet scholars (e.g., McKeown & Plowman, 1999; Sakkas, 1993) and the more pragmatic aspirations of public relations researchers (e.g., Taylor, Kent & White, 2001).

The primary function of the site seemed to be the careful, well-chosen reproduction of mediated material which is largely available in other places, from the California Recovery Team report to quotes from the Republican National Convention. However, some of the content was likely unique to this site, such as the *About Arnold* section, and this material was carefully chosen, written and edited to emphasize those aspects of credibility discussed above. Instead of providing a space for interactive discourse with fellow supporters or officials in the campaign, the site was designed to provide carefully structured information about the candidate to internet users who may not have seen that material elsewhere.

Other websites related to Schwarzenegger

In addition to the *JoinArnold.com* site, Schwarzenegger maintains several other sites which make their own contribution to his perceived credibility. Though the focus of this article is on the *JoinArnold* site, two of those other sites deserve a brief mention — if only to focus on how they differed from the site analyzed above. The *Schwarzenegger.com* site, created and maintained by the same organization responsible for the *JoinArnold.com* site, is somewhat limited. However, a link labeled *Schwarzenegger.com archive web site* takes the viewer to a different, earlier template — one with a great deal of information about the candidate's pre-political career. The site was the best source of information about Schwarzenegger's movies, but the content was somewhat hidden by the political content (very limited) which adorned the front page of the site. Because the most extensive content of the site was the entertainment information, this site probably predated the candidate's political career and seemed to be designed primarily for his movie fans.

The site also contained a link to the official governor's web site (*governor.ca.gov*) - though neither site contains a link to *JoinArnold.com*. The official site, as expected, provided links to state programs and information, including biographies of state officials and former governors. This site, of course, is maintained by the state of California, and is designed for citizens to find important official information about their state and its governor. Though two of the sites are maintained by the Cimarron group, a "creative advertising agency" (Cimarron, 2005), the three sites have distinct presumed audiences. The *JoinArnold.com* site was designed to be the past, present and future web base of the governor's campaigns, and as such is largely dedicated to informing current and possible future supporters of those efforts. The state site was designed to provide information to anyone who needs access to it, while the commercial site (*Shwarzenegger.com*) seemed designed primarily for fans.

Limitations/Directions for future research

The most significant limitation of this study is the time period during which the web pages were examined; this limitation is explored in some detail above. Another limitation concerns the dynamic nature of credibility, which clearly changes over time (in the case of politicians, sometimes a very short period of time). Thus, it is impossible for any single study, apart from an historical overview, to accurately describe the credibility of a prominent public figure. By the time a reader examines this text, Schwarzenegger may be a political afterthought — but at the time of

initial analysis, there was serious consideration of his eventual run for even higher office.

This paper contributes to existing research on campaign sites by expanding analysis beyond the presidential level to a state office. Future research could extend this analysis further to the consideration of web sites of other types of candidates, perhaps even at a local level. Also, researchers should continue to track the use of interactivity in political sites, with the hope that sites will become more truly interactive over time, fulfilling the potential of campaign web sites to make an even more significant contribution to a democratic society.

This paper also makes a significant contribution by extending McCroskey and Teven's (1999) recent conceptualization of credibility. McCroskey and Teven referred to goodwill as the "lost dimension" of credibility, describing how that aspect of the broader concept seems to have been ignored by scholars over time. Following McCroskey and Teven's conceptual and operational definition, researchers have found that three-dimensional approach useful in examining interactions in instructional (e.g., Thweatt & McCroskey, 1988; Myers, 2004) and organizational (e.g., Cole & McCroskey, 2003) contexts. However, the concept has not yet been extended for use beyond an immediate, interpersonal focus; this analysis is one of the first to extend their specific definition of credibility beyond immediate interpersonal interactions.

This three-dimensional approach to credibility provides a useful vocabulary for the analysis of political messages in general, and political web sites in particular. Other approaches to examining political credibility, such as Logue and Miller's (1995) concept of "rhetorical status" clearly also can play a role in the analysis of the intentional efforts on the part of politicians to enhance credibility. However, McCroskey and Teven's (1999) framework conceptually defines and operationalizes those three very specific dimensions in a way that the more rhetorical approaches (with the exception, of course, of a Neo-Aristotelian perspective) do not. Thus, it is also possible to apply McCroskey and Teven's approach quantitatively, in a manner which is not possible with a purely rhetorical focus. In retrospect, it would have been very interesting to track how people inside and outside the state of California viewed the three aspects of Schwarzenegger's credibility as he dealt with a variety of political crises.

Finally, as this article is published candidates are starting to prepare for the 2008 presidential election. Currently, several high-profile prospective candidates (such as Arizona senator John McCain and former Virginia governor Mark Warner) are endorsed by a variety of "unofficial" web sites

advancing their presidential hopes. It would be fascinating to examine how these sites try to establish the three-dimensional credibility of their candidates over time, particularly as their fortunes rise and fall in the time period leading up to the primaries. Such an analysis, beginning in the near future, could also avoid some of the limitations of the present study. As web sites continue to grow in importance for current and future politicians, they should be more carefully monitored, and studied through any of a number of conceptual lenses.

References

- Barnes, S. (2003). *Computer-mediated Communication: Human-to-Human Communication Across the Internet*. Boston: AB Longman.
- Bush-Cheney 04 (2004). <http://georgewbush.com/>. Retrieved September 29, 2004.
- Californians for Schwarzenegger (2004). www.joinarnold.com/en. Retrieved September, 2004.
- Chebat, J. C., Filiatrault, P., & Perrien, J. (1990). Limits of credibility: The case of political persuasion. *Journal of Social Psychology*, 130, 157-167.
- The Cimarron Group. www.cimarrongroup.com. Retrieved May 25, 2005.
- Cole, J. G., & McMroskey, J. C. (2003). The association of perceived communication apprehension, shyness, and verbal aggression with perceptions of source credibility and affect in organizational and interpersonal contexts. *Communication Quarterly*, 51, 101-110.
- Erickson, K. V. (2000). Presidential rhetoric's visual turn: Performance fragments and the politics of illusionism. *Communication Monographs*, 67, 138-157.
- Flanagin, A. J., & Metzger, M. J. (2000). Perceptions of internet credibility. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 77, 515-540.
- Gass, R. H. & Seiter, J. S. (2003). *Persuasion, social influence and compliance-gaining* (2nd ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- Governor of California Official Site (2005). www.governor.ca.gov. Retrieved May 25, 2005.
- Holdren, J. (1995, August). Cyber soapbox: The net is a new campaign medium that alters the political landscape. *Internet World*, 50-51.
- Johnson, T. J., & Kaye, B. K. (1998). Cruising is believing?: Comparing internet and traditional sources on media credibility measures. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 75, 325-340.
- Johnson, T. J., & Kaye, B. K. (2002). Webbelievability: A path model

- examining how convenience and reliance predict online credibility. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 79, 619.
- Kerry-Edwards 04 (2004). www.johnkerry.com. Retrieved September 29, 2004.
- Klinenberg, E., & Perrin, A. (2000). Symbolic politics in the information age: The 1996 Republican presidential campaigns in cyberspace. *Information, Communication and Society*, 3, 17-38.
- Logue, C. M., & Miller, E. F. (1995). Rhetorical status: A study of its origins, functions, and consequences. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 81, 20-47.
- London, S. (1995). Teledemocracy vs. deliberative democracy: A comparative look at two models of public talk. *Interpersonal Computing and Technology: An Electronic Journal for the 21st Century*, 3. Retrieved May 15, 2005 from www.emoderators.com/ipct-j/1995/n2/London.txt.
- Margolis, M., Resnick, D., & Chu, C. (1997). Campaigning on the internet: Parties and candidates on the World Wide Web in the 1996 primary season. *Press/Politics*, 2, 59-78.
- McCroskey, J. C., & Teven, J. J. (1999). Goodwill: A reexamination of the construct and its measurement. *Communication Monographs*, 66, 90-103.
- McKeown, C. A., & Plowman, K. D. (1999). Reaching publics on the web during the 1996 presidential campaign. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 11, 321-347.
- Myers, S. (2004). The relationship between perceived instructor credibility and college student in-class and out-of-class communication. *Communication Reports*, 17, 129-137.
- Robinson, T. J., & Kaye, B. K. (2000). Using is believing: The influence of reliance on the credibility of online political information among politically interested internet users. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, 77, 865-879.
- Sakkas, L. (1993). Politics on the internet. *Interpersonal Computing and Technology: A Journal for the 21st Century*, 1 (2). Retrieved May 15, 2005, from www.emoderators.com/ipct-j/1003/n2/sakkas.txt.
- Schwarzenegger Official Site (2005). www.schwarzenegger.com. Retrieved May 25, 2005.
- Taylor, M., Kent, M. L., & White, W. J. (2001). How activist organizations are using the internet to build relationships. *Public Relations Review*, 27(3), 263-284.

- Thweatt, K. S., & McCroskey, J. C. (1998). The impact of teacher immediacy and misbehaviors on teacher credibility. *Communication Education*, 47, 348-358.
- University of California at Berkeley Library (2004). California Recall. Retrieved September 28, 2004, from www.igs.berkeley.edu/library/htRecall2003.html.
- Yin, R. K. (1989). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

***If it Worked for Aristotle, it Should Work for Us:
Introducing Mimesis to the Contemporary Classroom***

Deneen Gilmour

*Media Writing Instructor, Doctoral Student
Communication Department
North Dakota State University
Fargo, ND 58105-5075
deneen.gilmour@ndsu.edu*

Abstract

The composition teacher of today is typically hesitant about adopting mimesis (imitation) as a teaching technique because many believe imitation contradicts contemporary worldviews that place importance on progress, genius, and technique. Imitation seems to contradict Americans' sense of individuality. In this essay, I assert that imitation can be a highly useful technique for beginning writers in composition, journalism, new media, or any type of writing. Teachers, particularly writing teachers, have used mimesis for more than 2,000 years, yet it has disappeared from the vocabulary and curriculum of most American teachers of today. Ancient Greek philosophers, including Plato and Aristotle, introduced imitation as a learning tool more than 2,000 years ago. Imitation, or modeling, is a technique worthy of contemplation and adoption by today's writing teachers and students.

The professor strode into the classroom and, without introducing herself, said, "Plagiarism will not be tolerated in this classroom. If you plagiarize, I will find you out. I will do everything I can to make sure you are punished, up to and including expulsion from the university." Not one student moved a muscle, and nobody said a word.

"Any questions?" she asked. "I will not tolerate plagiarism," she reiterated, picking up the waist-high oak lectern at the front of the classroom and slamming it back down on the wooden classroom floor for emphasis. Not one student moved a muscle, and nobody said a word.

The professor then spat out her full list of rules and expectations for her classroom and student conduct. She handed out and reviewed the syllabus, and performed all the housekeeping items that professors do on the first day of class. At the end of the 50-minute class period, she again asked, "Any questions?" Not one student moved a muscle, and

nobody said a word. She excused the class. Students filed into the hallway. Once outside the door and beyond her ear's reach, students buzzed to one another about what they'd seen and heard. As college students, we had each heard the "do not plagiarize" speech several times during each semester of our university experience, and we had heard it dating back to elementary school days. None of us knew why the professor had spoken so stridently about plagiarism, but in the hallway we whispered about taking care to avoid writing anything that could be construed as remotely close to something another person — living or dead — had ever written.

Finding a place for mimesis (modeling) in the modern classroom

As a journalist and journalism teacher, I have come to believe that the barrage of anti-plagiarism messages students hear (some of them harshly frightening) has inhibited students from employing mimesis, commonly known as imitation or modeling, as a drafting and writing tool. Certainly, I understand that instructors must discourage and punish plagiarism. However, the delivery manner of anti-plagiarism messages is critical. Plagiarism warnings should be presented calmly and rationally, explaining precisely what constitutes plagiarism and how it differs from imitation, modeling, quoting, and paraphrasing.

Defining Plagiarism

Plagiarism is a concept of post-printing press times. Plagiarism did not exist in ancient and medieval times largely because oral language was the chief form of learning before books became common. When knowledge was passed orally from person to person, plagiarism did not exist as a concept because repeating the words of another was the only method of sharing knowledge. However, as knowledge was preserved in printed forms, writers became more possessive about their information and ideas. Original definitions of plagiarism spun off from definitions of piracy, theft, and stealing. Today, according to the Merriam-Webster Dictionary, plagiarism usually means someone has (1) Used someone else's writing, language, ideas, or information without acknowledging the original source, or (2) dishonestly tried to pass off another person's words as one's own words. Plagiarism does not exist if a student or writer uses another's words and gives credit to the original source of the information. An honest person can avoid chances of being accused of plagiarism by scrupulously giving credit to the original source of any information used in one's writing or speech. Students, and in fact, writers of any type, must realize a fine line exists between modeling and plagiarizing. The difference between modeling and

plagiarizing lies in whether the writer appropriates another's exact words as his or her own words (plagiarism), or whether a writer uses another's writing style and structure as a blueprint by which to spin off ideas for his or her unique writing style and structure (modeling/mimesis).

Teachers, particularly writing teachers, have used mimesis for more than 2,000 years, yet it has disappeared from the vocabulary and curriculum of most American teachers of today. Ancient Greek philosophers, including Plato (428-348 B.C.) and Aristotle (384-322 B.C.), introduced imitation as a learning tool more than 2,000 years ago; they called it mimesis. Aristotle's most well-known writing on the subject of mimesis appears in his volume titled *Poetics*. Subsequently, great philosophers, teachers and rhetoricians such as Cicero (106-43 B.C.), Quintilian (35-95 A.D.), and Erasmus (1496-1536) embraced mimesis as a pedagogical method.

The technique is still applicable today. In fact, in this essay I assert that imitation can be a highly useful technique for beginning writers in journalism, composition, new media, or any type of writing. Imitation, or modeling, is a technique worthy of contemplation and adoption by today's writing teachers and students. If imitation was good enough for Aristotle, Plato, and Cicero — the world's best-known philosophers and orators — then it is probably good enough for our classrooms as well.

Encourage and Enlighten Students to Avoid Plagiarism

Unless instructors of journalism and other genres of writing take care with warnings about plagiarism, teachers will unconsciously and unknowingly dissuade students from using mimesis in their drafting process, and from incorporating quotes and paraphrases in their stories. A student's fear of crossing the line into plagiarism can prevent the student from using techniques that could and should be used in effective writing. Teachers can help by clearly explaining what constitutes plagiarism, by explaining that within the scholarly setting knowledge is built upon knowledge. Thus, citing the source of previous knowledge is important in the knowledge-building process. Secondly, teachers can help by requiring students to purchase, read, and understand the plagiarism sections of commonly used style guides for student writing. The most commonly used guides are *MLA Handbook for Writers of Research Papers* (high school students and undergraduate college students); *MLA Style Manual and Guide to Scholarly Publishing* (graduate students, scholars, and professional writers); *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association* (used for social science reports); and the *Council of Biology Editors Style Book* (for science and math reports).

Reviving Mimesis from Its Slumber

Scholars of classical rhetoric believe mimesis has declined in use because post-modern Americans were raised to be individualistic. Imitation holds little appeal in America's culture, which values individuality and uniqueness. The composition teacher of today is typically hesitant about adopting imitation as a teaching technique because many believe that imitation contradicts contemporary worldviews that place great importance on modern values such as progress, genius, and technique (Sullivan, 1989). "For a teacher to recommend that her students imitate another writer is tantamount to admitting that she does not know every aspect of the writing process," states Sullivan (p. 18).

The pedagogical culture of today grew from the pedagogical culture of the 1960s and 1970s when teachers were trained to help students find their authentic voice and to write freely. Writing teachers in the 1960s and 1970s probably would have viewed imitation as a negative process that produced conformity among students (Sullivan). However, imitation can play a valuable role in writing instruction, states Sullivan (1989). He believes that contemporary teachers' rejection of imitation has more to do with rejection of classicism's reverence for imitation than with a collective judgment that imitation is an ineffective technique to teach writing. Sullivan laments the disappearance of mimesis in most classrooms, and Clark (1948) states that imitation is every bit as necessary in contemporary writing education as it was during the Renaissance. Imitation is necessary because of the human condition, states Clark, quoting from Vives:

Although it is natural to talk, yet all discourse whatsoever belongs to an 'art' which was not bestowed upon us at birth, since nature has fashioned man, for the most part, strangely hostile to 'art.' Since she lets us be born ignorant and absolutely skill-less of all arts, we require imitation. Imitation, furthermore, is the fashioning of a certain things in accordance with a proposed model (Clark, 1948, n.p.).

As a classical rhetorical pedagogical device, mimesis was a fundamental method of instruction in ancient Greek and Roman schools and in Renaissance schools. Mimesis was the practical counterpart to rhetorical theory (Burton, 2004). In fact, mimesis was viewed as a method to connect theory and practice. Young elementary school students used imitation to learn Greek or Latin spelling and grammar, and to copy the purity of speech of favorite writers. As students advanced, they were taught parsing (finding the parts of speech), which led to rhetorical analysis of their models, such as identifying figures of speech, argumentative strategies, and patterns of arrangement. Students were told by teachers to use copybooks

to record passages from their reading that exemplified worthwhile content or form. The purpose of putting noteworthy material in copybooks was so students could imitate or quote it in their own compositions or speeches (Burton). The intention was to provide a type of literary and rhetorical apprenticeship in which the ideal methods of expression from the best models could be appropriated in a regulated, graduated fashion (Burton).

Ancient teachers viewed imitation as a bridge between student's reading, writing, and speaking. Ideally, students moved from near-exact imitations of their models to looser sorts, using models increasingly as starting points for longer, more complex compositions of their own invention (Burton, 2004). Some historians' interpretations have mistakenly portrayed mimesis as copying the style of a speaker or writer. However mimesis authorities such as Quintilian and Erasmus gave precise instructions on how students were to observe and imitate argumentative methods, and speechmakers' content. The idea was not to teach slavish repetition of the original, but, rather to teach students how to write, speak, and create by modeling their work after the great rhetoricians of their era and previous eras. Cicero, Quintilian, and St. Augustine suggested that students should read widely to assimilate the styles of great writers (Sullivan, 1992).

The use of classical rhetoric pedagogical techniques in American writing classrooms has risen and declined throughout the past two centuries (Kitzhaber, 1990). By the late 1800's rhetorical theory was largely abstract in American educational institutions. The influence of British rhetoric was waning, and a distinct form of American rhetorical pedagogy and voice had yet to emerge. Very soon, however, stylistic forces replaced the vacuum, moving rhetoric toward a period of correctness in which textbook exercises and daily theme writing were intended to produce students who were stylistically correct. "Rhetorical instruction in the early years of the twentieth century came to be dominated by an ideal of superficial correctness, of conformity to rules chiefly for the sake of conformity" (Kitzhaber, p. 188).

Kitzhaber believes that "most composition teaching today, in fact, is still being done in the shadow of rhetorical theory" that came into prominence between 1885 and 1900 (p. 226). Stiff, by-the-book rules taught in English composition classrooms at some high schools and universities do not tend to produce writers who are prone to taking risks with their writing, or imitating the work of accomplished journalists in order to improve their own writing by following the example of a role model. However, leading journalism instructors recognize the mimetic literary technique — imitation — as worthwhile for young journalists.

Imitate The Greats in Order to be Great

Chip Scanlan, a writing instructor at The Poynter Institute for Media Studies in St. Petersburg, Florida believes “you can discover your own voice by listening to other writers” (Scanlan, 2003, n.p.) Although Scanlan has been a newspaper and magazine writer for decades and teaches writing to professional writers, Scanlan so sincerely believes in mimesis that he still hand copies or types other writers’ stories, word for word, so he can pick up the rhythm of the other writer’s sentence length, word choice, paragraph structure, and cadence. He is careful to distinguish the practice of mimesis from plagiarism: This practice horrifies some respected writers and teachers; write your own damn stories, they say. But if we were visual artists, would anyone look askance at me walking across the street to the Salvador Dali Museum here in St. Petersburg, Fla., to copy the paintings of that master to see how he used color and shadow and contrast? I’m not talking about plagiarism. Rather, modeling is copying stories to gain a more intimate understanding of the variety of decisions writers make to organize material, select language, and shape sentences (Scanlan, 2003, n.p.).

Scanlan did not invent the practice of re-typing or re-writing inspirational writing in order to internalize its style and structure. In fact, in Benjamin Franklin’s autobiography, titled simply *Autobiography*, Franklin recounts how he copied by hand the works of great writers so he could improve his own writing (Clark, 1957). Similarly, Malcolm X, the black militant who championed African American rights in the 1960s and urged black racial unity, mimetically drew from the writings and speeches of others to define his views and sharpen his oratorical skills (Knoeller, 2002).

Good writers must “steal,” according to Wendy Bishop, who taught composition, rhetoric and creative writing at Florida State University. Bishop explains her use of the word steal — her colorful substitution for imitation — this way:

I find sentences to be sculptural, like clay, sometimes, things that writers bend, shape, and mold to their purposes. I think of sentences as alive, responding here when pushed there, resisting and obliging there. I’ve come to understand prose — first on the meaning level of what’s being said — but also on the literal, syntactical level, as if touching and counting a string of beads, with all my attention turned high. Then, I steal like a writer to write like a writer, using sentences to make my variation on the common themes and genres that all writers share — love story to technical report (Bishop, 1997, p. 119).

The best writers know all “the rules” and are confident enough of their ability to write correctly that they feel safe and move beyond correctness, breaking rules to achieve a higher level of meaning (Bishop, 1997, p. 121).

Bishop further describes her notion of stealing: What I want to do as a reading, stealing, writing writer is...cultivate double vision. I need both to feel the effects and also to extract the information about how those effects are achieved. I can enjoy the nursery rhyme of Wanda Wallace on Woodbine Way, but I can't write it myself — unless I analyze [look at all those Ws, listen to the rhythm] and imitate [steal?] and put together my own pleasurable prose: Randal Reader lives on Writer Road. Look what I've done here — changed gender, made a play on the subject of my paragraph and the subject of writing. Cheap thrills, but that's how a writer reads to write (Bishop, 1997, p. 120).

A precise plan for using mimesis in the classroom

Roy Peter Clark and Don Fry, among the most noted writing teachers in America and faculty members at The Poynter Institute for Media Studies, advocate the use of imitation as a story generation tool for beginners, and as an imitation tool for writers at any level. Here is Clark and Fry's prescription for employing imitation: Pick out a magazine or newspaper story that you really like by a writer you do not know. Make a list of the things that you like about it, trying to be as specific as possible. Based on your reading of this story, write a page imagining what the writer is like, as a person and as a journalist. Try to contact the writer. Share with the writer your affection for the story. Ask the writer questions about how the story was written (Clark & Fry, 2003, p. 42).

The next step, of course, is to try to imitate the writer's method and process. I like to tell writing students that imitation, or modeling, is not plagiarism. In fact, imitation is quite the opposite. Smart writers are observant and analytical enough to realize that nearly everything we have learned in life is a result of modeling after someone or something. Have you ever watched a boy walk? More often than not, the boy's stride looks much like his father's stride. How do we learn to handle those vexing algebra problems in ninth grade? We model our own calculations after the teacher's examples on the board and sample problems in the textbook. And, it is no mistake that mom's beef gravy tastes almost exactly like grandma's beef gravy. Mom learned how to make gravy by observing grandma and following her example.

In my own classroom, I explain to beginning writers that they can effectively use imitation without feeling as if they are plagiarizing if they view imitation as using another writer's work as a blueprint to set up the supporting structure of their "word house:" the foundation, exterior walls, and interior walls. Once a writer has built the story structure, he or she can choose colors,

styles, and textures. In other words, once the story structure is erected, a novice writer can stop worrying about building the framework of the story and begin choosing how to cast the tone, voice, and style of the story.

Drawing from Classical Teachers of Imitation

Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-1894), author of *Treasure Island* and *Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde*, described himself as “playing the sedulous ape” to other writers in order to learn how to write (Clark, 1957). Stevenson was describing imitation.

The whole of life is based on the desire of doing ourselves what we approve in others...thus musicians follow the voice of their teachers, painters look for models to the works of preceding painters, and farmers adopt the system approved by experience (Quintillian, quoted in Clark, 1957, p. 144).

Clark (1957) assured that imitation is equally useful for training young people to speak, think, and write well as it is to guide mature writers to a greater mastery of structure and style. Cicero, already a respected rhetor, boasted that he composed his *De oratore* “in the Aristotelian manner” (Cicero quoted in Clark, p. 145). Cicero believed imitation to be a useful and effective literary device. Further, Cicero said he used *mimesis*, based on the work of many great writers, when composing *De inventione*, one of his best known and most quoted works (Clark). Although *mimesis* was a common and practical way of teaching speech and writing in Antiquity, it all but disappeared from use during the Middle Ages. During the Renaissance, though, imitation enjoyed a resurgence and was a principle method of Renaissance learning (Abbott, 2001). Renaissance era teachers considered Cicero “first among the ancients” (Abbott, p. 158) and encouraged their students to imitate the work of Cicero. Spanish philosopher and humanist Juan Carlos Vives (1492-1540) recommended in his writings the best classical rhetoricians for students to imitate: Cicero is indeed the best, though he does not contain every merit. Nor is he the only author with good style...for an intellectual and learned circle, the speeches of Demosthenes are suited. So, too, are those to be found in Livy...For sweetness and rhythm we have Isocrates...Plato has a still higher flight (Abbott, 2001).

Putting Mimesis into Practice with Teachers and Students

Sullivan (1989) draws on the beliefs and practices of classical rhetoricians, teachers, and orators to advance his argument that *mimesis* is helpful and applicable for today’s composition teachers. For example, imitation was highly significant in Plato’s belief system. In *The Republic*,

Plato relies on imitation to distinguish levels of reality, asserting that a carpenter creates only a resemblance of a bed, and a painter only an imitation of a bed. In Plato's ontology, human construction — the arts, philosophies, institutions, and language — are imitations. Aristotle also viewed imitation as a vital force in education and in life. In *Poetics*, Plato said poetry and music are "forms of imitation." He believed it was the nature of fine art to provide a realistic imitation of certain of life's actualities.

Dionysius, a first-century B.C. rhetorician, postulated that one becomes great by emulating great writers and speakers of the past. Longinus, author of *On the Sublime*, wrote: "...there is a way that leads to the sublime And what kind of way is this? It is the imitation and emulation of the great historians and poets of the past...for many authors catch fire from the inspiration of others."

Essentially, imitation was a central aspect of many classical pedagogical theories, helping explain the nature of art and the ways in which one receives inspiration to produce great art or write beautiful poetry. Besides being a way to transmit skill, imitation was considered a way to impart cultural values.

Bender (1993) urges composition teachers to revive the all-but-lost art of imitation, and to use it to enhance democracy and diversity in today's writing classrooms:

I ask an audience of professional compositionists to consider writing practices that seem archaic, and this may trigger the impulse to let the sleeping past lie. If that is the case, alienation...becomes alienation in the heart of my reader. My subject is thus a risky one. The alien history discussed here — teaching writing by imitating writing — is, however, guided by an urgent contemporary goal. I wish to argue that certain 'ancient' writing practices can enhance a widely recognized need to make writing instruction truly democratic, aware of and responsive to culturally diver audiences within our national life.

The notion of reviving mimesis (imitation) is a good and workable one. After all, if mimesis worked well for Aristotle, Plato, and Cicero, it ought to work for today's writing students. However, teachers must first help students clear hurdles, such as Americans' typical reaction that they don't want to copy anybody, and, almost on the opposite side of the spectrum, address and ease students' fear that mimesis could cause them to accidentally plagiarize and thus find themselves with a failing grade, a trip to the principal's office, or expulsion. The solution to both problems is simple and easy for writing teachers: Explain how imitation is different

from copying, and explain how to model one's work after another's work without plagiarizing. We, as instructors, must stop lecturing and ranting at students about plagiarism. We must put ourselves in students' places to understand their viewpoints. First, many students do not fully understand what constitutes plagiarism. Teachers must explain plagiarism, and how to avoid it by properly citing sources for quotes, or by paraphrasing the work of another writer without appropriating another's scholarship word for word.

As is often the case, the past can effectively inform the present and future. As a writing teacher, I particularly appreciate and find inspiration in Clark's (1957) admonition on applying classical mimesis to the contemporary classroom: I wish to reiterate that modern teachers would make their teaching more effective if they made fuller use of the exercises of imitation. As practiced by the ancients, imitation did not stifle originality. It did not starve but rather nourished the students' own talents (p. 175-176).

References

- Abbott, D. P. (2001). Rhetoric and writing in the Renaissance in *A short history of writing instruction: From ancient Greece to modern America*, Murphy, J.P., ed. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Bender, D. (1993). Diversity revisited, or composition's alien history. *Rhetoric Review*, 12-1, 108-124.
- Bishop, W. (1997). Reading, stealing, and writing like a writer. *Elements of alternate style: Essays on writing and revision*. Portsmouth, NH: Boynton/Cook Publishers.
- Burton, G.O. (2004). *Silva Rhetoricae*. Retrieved December 10, 2005 from <http://humanities.byu.edu/rhetoric/Pedagogy/Imitation.htm>
- Clark, D. L. (1948). *John Milton of St. Paul's School: A study of ancient rhetoric in Renaissance education*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Clark, D. L. (1957). Quintillian's Declamationes in *Rhetoric in Greco-Roman education*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Clark, R.P. and Fry, D. (2003). *Coaching writers: Editors and reporters working together across media platforms*, 2nd ed. Boston: Bedford/St. Martin's.
- Kitzhaber, A. R. (1990). *Rhetoric in American Colleges, 1850-1900*. Dallas: Southern Methodist University Press.
- Knoeller, C. (2002). Book review: Saying and silence: Listening to composition with Bakhtin. *The Quarterly/National Writing Project Publications*. Retrieved December 10, 2005 from www.writingproject.org/cs/nwpp/print/nwpr/322

- Scanlan, C. (2003, October 29). *Modeling lessons*. Poynter Online Retrieved Dec. 1, 2005 from www.poynter.org/column.asp?id=52&aid=45863
- Sullivan, D. L. (1989) Attitudes toward imitation: Classical culture and the modern temper. *Rhetoric Review*, 8-1, 5-21.
- Sullivan, D.L. (1992). The decline of imitation in eighteenth and nineteenth century rhetoric. *Platte Valley Review*, 20.1, 45-62.

***A Touch of the Wild Side:
A Fantasy-Theme and Feminist Analysis of the Twins III***

Richelle Maciej

Doctoral Student

University of Minnesota, Morris

Morris, MN

maci0047@morris.umn.edu

Abstract

Two methods of rhetorical criticism, fantasy-theme analysis and feminist criticism, were applied to The Twins III (2004), an oil painting by contemporary Minnesota artist Margo Selski, to determine how the arrangement of visual elements in the painting serves to persuade viewers. Both methods concluded similar results. Selski's painting informs and persuades her audiences of an inherent truth about women: women have dual natures, embodied by the self that conforms to patriarchal society, and the self that is wild, relational, intuitive and free. The artist also implies that the ideology of domination is harmful to women, but that women subvert it by elusively asserting the true, wild aspect of their identities.

Art museums around the world contain paintings, sculptures, tapestries, photographs, and other artwork that is pleasing to the eye. However, aesthetic pleasure is not the only reason artwork is created. Clarissa Pinkola Est s (1992) states that...art is important for it commemorates the seasons of the soul, or a special or tragic event in the soul's journey. Art is not just for oneself, not just a marker of one's own understanding. It is also a map for those who follow after us. (p. 15)

On the surface, a work of art can appear purely as a depiction of a scene, a story frozen in time. Yet, as one looks closer at its color(s), form, technique, and the scene or event it depicts, deeper purposes may be revealed. Indeed, artwork can resonate with viewers, depending on the subject(s) in the work of art or how they are arranged. Viewers can even identify with works of art because they see themselves reflected in who or what is illustrated.

Artists infuse their artwork with meaning, as Rudolf Arnheim (1974) indicates, stating that they use "categories of shape and color to capture something universally significant in the particular" (p. 2). W. Eugene

Kleinbauer (1971) also states that “an artist may deliberately or even unconsciously conceal or transfigure his [sic] intentions, thoughts, and experiences in his [sic] work” (p. 68). These meanings can be used to persuade the audience of a particular viewpoint or idea, an action that is the focus of the study of rhetoric.

Foss (1982) states that art is rhetorical because it is “the production or arrangement of sounds, colors, forms, movements, and other elements in a manner that affects or evokes a response” (p. 55). Art, therefore, can be studied using methods of rhetorical criticism. Conducting a fantasy-theme analysis, feminist criticism, or any type of rhetorical criticism, on non-discursive rhetoric such as artwork can be very helpful in understanding particular works of art, and is also beneficial to the field of rhetoric. A majority of the published studies utilizing fantasy-theme criticism have studied discursive artifacts, yet some have studied non-discursive forms of rhetoric. Benoit et al. (2001) studied political cartoons concerning the investigation, trial and impeachment of President Bill Clinton to determine whether individual rhetors (the cartoonists) could create a rhetorical vision. McCormick and Weiss (2002) examined a graffiti-style mural to investigate how a subversive art form like graffiti can purport positive and socially acceptable opinions of controversial issues. Likewise, most studies using feminist criticism have analyzed discursive artifacts, but some have investigated non-discursive forms of rhetoric as well. Foss (1988) examined Judy Chicago’s installation artwork *The Dinner Party* to delineate the strategies used to empower women’s voices.

Artists may not explicitly state that their artwork is rhetorical, yet the elements that comprise their work often indicate otherwise. Contemporary Minnesota artist Margo Selski states that her work “reads as placidly narrative storytelling” (2004, artist statement). However, as viewers explore her art, she believes her work “reveals itself over time... [and the images] become curious, uncomfortable and perhaps even dangerous” (2004, artist statement). In fact, Selski’s paintings, particularly *The Twins III* (also known as *Flora and Fauna III*), become vehicles through which she articulates the life experiences of women — including her own — and can even encourage women to recognize certain aspects of their identities they may not have acknowledged before. *The Twins III* places into visual form the duality of women’s lives — the self that has conformed to the domesticated ideal of a woman that patriarchal society has enforced for thousands of years, and the self that yearns to be independent and wild, that yearns to be in touch with the woman’s true nature. Selski shows the dichotomy of being bound and boundless at the same time.

This essay will first provide a brief biography of Margo Selski, followed by a description of *The Twins III* and the context in which it was created and displayed. Next, the methods used to analyze Selski's painting—fantasy-theme analysis and feminist criticism—will be described, followed by an analysis of *The Twins III* using the methods and a report of the results and findings. Finally, this essay will conclude with a discussion of the essay's contribution to rhetorical theory, as well as suggestions for future research.

Biographical Information

Margo Selski's impetus to create art started at an early age and likely came as the result of a learning disability. She was born in Minnesota in 1960, but lived in a small Kentucky town for most of her childhood (Tomson, 2005, p. 11E). Diagnosed as "extremely dyslexic," and labeled a "slow learner" by teachers, according to Ellen Tomson (2005, p. 11E), Selski still finds reading and even telling time difficult. However, Cynde Randall (2005a) states that throughout her life, Selski "has relied on her fertile imagination to reconcile the differences between what she sees and what she needs to know" (p. 19).

In 1987, she graduated from Berea College in Berea, Kentucky, with a bachelor's degree in art education, and taught art in public schools for over a decade after her graduation (Tomson, 2005, p. 11E; Selski, curriculum vitae, 2003). In 1992, she earned her master's degree in art education from SUNY Brockport in New York, only one year after she was named National Art Teacher of the Year (Selski, curriculum vitae, 2003; Randall, 2005b, n.p.). In 1994, Selski gave up teaching to focus on her art, and entered graduate school at the University of Minnesota, studying painting and, in 1998, earning a master of fine arts degree (Randall, 2005b, n.p.; Tomson, 2005, p. 11E). She is married to neuroscientist David Selski and has three children—Matheo, Nikolai, and Tatianna (Tomson, 2005, p. 11E).

Selski's early work dealt with "the literal concealment of information," or as Randall (2005a) put it, "an extended kinesthetic meditation on dyslexia" (p. 19). However, the birth of her first child, Matheo, in 1999 transformed her painting. Matheo was a colicky baby, and with his incessant crying and her sleep deprivation, Randall (2005a) states that Northern Flemish influences "spontaneously appeared" as Selski painted (p. 19). This Flemish style remains an integral part of Selski's work even today, and she also credits the work of Jan Vermeer and Petrus Christus as important influences for her work (Randall, 2005a, p. 19; Tomson, 2005, p. 11E). Mary Abbe (2005) states that Selski's paintings are considered "quasi-autobiographical" and "surrealistic" (p. E20). Tomson (2005) also

states that Selski's paintings "are open to interpretation," and that she "has a fascination with ambiguity, hidden meanings and secret agendas" — a theme which has been consistent throughout all of her work (p. 11E). One of the paintings which exhibits hidden meanings and ambiguity is *The Twins III*, the artifact studied in this essay and which will now be described.

Description of Artifact and Context

The Twins III, also known as *Flora and Fauna III*, was shown with other oil paintings by Margo Selski in a joint exhibition with sculptor Davora M. Lindner at the Cargill Gallery in the Minneapolis Institute of Arts (MIA) in Minneapolis, Minnesota, from July 8 to September 4, 2005. The walls of the Gallery, a small exhibition room located on the first floor of MIA, were painted a rich forest green, accenting the lighter colors and figures in the paintings and sculptures. A digital reproduction of the painting may be found online at www.mnartists.org/. Search the site using "Selski" as the search term.

Completed in 2004, *The Twins III* is approximately 30 inches by 40 inches. The painting's title indicates that it is part of a series, but only one other painting, *The Twins*, has been exhibited that appears to be directly related to *The Twins III*. In *The Twins III*, two women, who look almost identical, are depicted in full-length frontal poses on a black and white checkered floor in front of a dark beige wall covered with dark green plant and flower designs. Both women have braided, auburn-colored hair and are wearing off-white dresses with full, bell-shaped skirts, huge starched collars (called ruffs), and ruffled sleeves. The woman on the viewer's left holds the hand of the woman on the right, although both palms are facing upward. Their other hands fall to their sides, but the hand of the woman on the right appears to be slightly pinching or lifting up the material of her skirt. Gold-colored Greek words are located to the left of the woman on the left, and to the right of the woman on the right, as if identifying them.

The woman on the right wears a skirt covered with a variety of flowers, including primroses, hyacinth, tulips, crocus, roses, lily of the valley, and poppies. She also wears red shoes that look like Dutch clogs. The woman on the left has a human head, but the arms, hands and feet are of a wolf. Her hair is braided to look like a wolf's pointy ears, and her skirt is covered with small representations of the following animals: an unidentified bug, beetle, flamingo, grasshopper, hare, hedgehog, horse, hyena, king snake, kiwi, koala, komodo dragon, monkey, moth, octopus, rooster, salmon, scorpion, shark, sperm whale, starfish, tortoise, turtle, and a unicorn.

Both women are situated on the canvas in an open and symmetrical

fashion, facing us at a slight angle and looking out at the viewer. The lines of the checkered floor appear to recede into the background, exhibiting linear perspective and giving the two-dimensional surface of the painting an illusion of depth. Shadows on the women's faces, hands, under their feet, and in the folds of their dresses also give the appearance of three-dimensionality.

The medium Selski used for this painting is oil, which naturally adds warmth and vibrance to a painting. However, she purposely ages the canvas to give it an antiquated look. To obtain this look, according to Tomson (2005), Selski...melts a layer of beeswax onto her painting. To create an aged, cracked effect on the surface, she painstakingly scratches through the beeswax with a sharp dental tool. Later, she presses paint into the cracks, then sets the painting aside to 'cure' (p. 11E)

This technique, although time-consuming, Tomson maintains, gives Selski's paintings the appearance of works of art that have survived for hundreds of years.

The variety of subjects depicted, as well as how they are depicted, causes viewers to wonder what *The Twins III* is actually about. Conducting a fantasy-theme analysis and feminist criticism, which will be described in the following paragraphs, will shed light on what the artist intended her painting to represent.

Description of the Methods

Fantasy-theme analysis

The first method used to study *The Twins III*, fantasy-theme analysis, was created by Ernest Bormann and has its foundations in Symbolic Convergence Theory. Symbolic convergence, according to Benoit et al. (2001), is a process that includes the "sharing of symbols between humans, which eventually leads to shared perceptions" and a shared symbolic ground or reality (p. 380). Bormann (1972), analyzing the work of Robert Bales and his colleagues, who studied communication in small groups, found that groups would engage in a practice called group fantasizing or dramatizing. Group fantasizing occurs when members find an aspect or aspects of a message that resonate with them, and that they can participate in by creating a fantasy theme or themes in their communication to formulate a common culture. Fantasy themes, as Foss (2004) states, "tell a story about a group's experience that constitutes a constructed reality for the participants" and "are designed to create a credible interpretation of experience — a way of making sense out of experience" (p. 111).

Fantasy theme creation is not limited to small groups, however.

Individuals can also develop fantasy themes if they discover a feature of a message that provides meaning for them, causing them to attach to and participate in actions related to that feature. Fantasy themes, Foss (2004) explains, are also "charged...with meanings and emotions that can be set off by an agreed-upon cryptic symbolic cue...[such as] a code word, phrase, slogan, or nonverbal sign or gesture" (p. 110). These signs allude to the fantasy that group members have already shared and "arouse the emotions associated with that fantasy" (Foss, 2004, p. 110).

Fantasy themes consist of three types, which are "the three elements necessary to create a drama," according to Foss (2004, p. 112): setting themes, character themes, and action themes. Setting themes describe the place(s) where the actions are occurring. Character themes describe the characteristics, qualities, and motives of the actors taking part in the drama. Action themes, as its name indicates, describe what is actually taking place in the drama, or what Bormann (1972) calls the "playing out of a dramatic situation" (p. 397).

A group of fantasy themes that are related to each other or exhibit a pattern often outline a rhetor's rhetorical vision. According to Bormann (1972), a rhetorical vision amalgamates fantasy themes relating to characters, setting and actions into a symbolic drama that "provides a sense of meaning and significance for [an] individual" (p. 400). Rhetorical visions also often inherently contain motives that compel its adherents to do particular actions. Bormann (1972) states that "motives do not exist to be expressed in communication but rather arise in the expression itself and come to be embedded in the drama of the fantasy themes that generated and serve to sustain them" (p. 406). Even if a rhetor's rhetorical vision does not contain an impetus to do a particular action, the rhetorical vision outlines the rhetor's worldview.

To conduct a fantasy-theme criticism, the critic must first discover the fantasy themes that are present in an artifact by carefully analyzing and listing the settings, characters, and actions that are contained in it. Next, the critic constructs the rhetor's rhetorical vision by finding the patterns among the various fantasy themes and linking them to the settings, characters, and actions in an artifact. Sometimes, more than one rhetorical vision can be present in an artifact (Foss, 2004, p. 115).

Fantasy-theme criticism is not used solely for studying small groups or a group of artifacts. Foss (2004) states that fantasy-theme criticism "can be applied...to all kinds of rhetoric in which themes function dramatically to connect audiences with messages" (p. 109). Since, as mentioned before, art evokes a response in an audience and can be used to persuade viewers

of certain worldviews, fantasy-theme criticism is an appropriate method to analyze non-discursive rhetoric like art.

Feminist criticism

Feminist criticism, the second method used to analyze *The Twins III*, is rooted in the feminist or women's liberation movement that started in the nineteenth century and continues today (Foss, 2004, p. 151). Feminism encompasses many different definitions, some more specific and some eliciting more negative responses among people than others. However, all feminists, according to Foss (2004), are "committed to eliminating relations of oppression and domination," assuring equality, and improving conditions of life, especially for women (p. 153).

The publication of important essays in the 1970s by feminist communication scholars introduced feminism into rhetorical studies, arguing that "feminism necessarily transforms rhetorical constructs and theories," according to Foss (2004, p. 155). More studies focused on the rhetoric and communication of women, and the very foundations of rhetorical study, transforming traditional rhetorical theories. Feminist rhetorical scholars hope to, in the words of Foss, "transform the [rhetorical] discipline," by introducing and perpetuating "novel theories" and incorporating more "inclusive understandings of rhetoric" to include rhetoric not only of women, but other oppressed groups of people (2004, p. 157).

Feminist criticism, according to Foss (2004), analyzes rhetoric to "discover how the rhetorical construction of gender is used as a means for domination and how that process can be challenged" (p. 157). Feminist criticism can also be used to analyze the "construction of domination" based on other aspects of identity, including but not limited to race, class, and sexual orientation (Foss, 2004, p. 157). Conducting feminist criticism allows a critic to determine what the artifact suggests about how the ideology of domination is constructed and how the artifact challenges or reinforces that ideology. Artifacts generally studied using feminist criticism are the rhetoric of marginalized groups that present a viewpoint on any aspect of identity — gender, race, class, etc. However, since identity is a common subject for many artifacts, any artifact can be studied using feminist criticism to show how the construction of identity "is implicit in these artifacts," according to Foss (2004, p. 158).

To conduct feminist criticism on an artifact, the critic must first analyze how women and men, or femininity or masculinity, are shown in the artifact. Women and men are subject to many standards, particularly those of behavior, and the critic's concern is to determine what the artifact

says about the norms and standards of women and men. The rhetor of the artifact also usually attempts to influence the audience to see the world or the artifact in a certain way, so another step in conducting feminist criticism is to look at how the artifact provides a "preferred viewpoint" (generally either feminine or masculine) for the audience to observe from (Foss, 2004, p. 158). Next, the critic must determine how the artifact illustrates the ideology of domination. If the artifact sustains the ideology of domination, then the critic's analysis should show how that domination is constructed and reinforced. If the artifact challenges the ideology of domination, then the critic can analyze how individuals can ignore that ideology and construct rhetoric assuming their own agency through articulating their own experiences and engaging "in acts of self-definition or self-determination" (Foss, 2004, p. 160). A critic's results from feminist criticism will vary widely depending on how the ideology of domination is present in the artifact.

Analysis of the Painting Using Fantasy-Theme Analysis and Feminist Criticism

Fantasy-theme analysis and feminist criticism result in the same findings when applied to *The Twins III*, demonstrating that each method's results confirm those of the other method. Both rhetorical analyses will be presented together in this section to avoid repetition of the results. First, a description of the setting will be given in order to articulate the context for both the characters and their actions, followed by a description of the characters and actions. Included within the discussion of the setting, characters, and actions is information regarding how gender is constructed in the painting. Then, an outline of the various themes that make up the artist's rhetorical vision will be provided, including implications for the construction of gender.

Setting

Temporal settings

Elements of the past and present are located throughout the entire painting. The past is indicated by the elegant, old-fashioned dresses the two women wear. The cracked paint surface and the darker colors used also give the painting an antiquated feel. Furthermore, the black-and-white checkered floor is reminiscent of the black-and-white marble floors Johannes Vermeer included in many of his paintings. Dutch genre paintings from the middle to late seventeenth century, Janson (2001, n.p.) states, include many representations of these marble floors. Elements of the past are depicted to

show that painting's meanings were applicable in the past.

The variety of animals and flowers portrayed are indicative of both the past and present, since virtually all existed in the past and continue to do so today. The unicorn, although an imaginary animal, is a symbol of the both the past and present because it has been a subject of past legends and folklore, and is still present in contemporary society. Also, both female figures represent the present by gazing straight at viewers, commanding their immediate attention. Elements of the present are used to show that the meanings inherent in the painting exist and are still relevant today.

Even though the dresses, animals, flowers and women appear to be bound to past and present temporal settings, Selski suggests they are also timeless. The sheer volume of the dresses would create large shadows underneath them, completely dimming the feet of the women and floor beneath them, but there are no shadows, save for the slight shadows between each woman's feet. Also, the animals and flowers appear to "float" on the skirts, not disappearing into the folds of the fabric as they would have if they were a part of the fabric. This suggests that the women, animals and flowers, are ethereal and not bound by time. These objects and their meanings are meant to persist throughout time.

Attire and room

The dresses the women wear and the room in which they are situated not only symbolize the past and present; they signify a constructed setting, the presence of patriarchal society. The volume of the dresses in the painting make the female figures appear incredibly stiff, posed and unnatural. This indicates that the women can mask their true selves by putting on garments that society and tradition have forced upon them — that they are hiding their true selves with projected selves. Similarly, the room they stand in gives the entire painting a claustrophobic feeling because of the dark hues used to color the walls and floor, and because the room has no windows. This stifling room reflects the domesticity that women have been assigned in the past and today, and the pressure society places on them to conform to its ideal image of a woman. Both female characters in the painting have become products of the ideology of domination.

Characters

The two main characters of this painting are "the twins" themselves — the two women who look alike. Since they have the same face and appear alike through similar dress, this suggests that they are actually fragmented selves of the same woman. This idea is further reinforced by

the symmetrical placement of the two female figures. Also, because the two main characters are female, this implies that the painting focuses on the lives, experiences, and perspectives of women. Therefore, both female characters are representative of the dual selves present in all women.

Flora and flowers

The character on the right, Flora, wears the dress covered with flowers. Although the flowers are depicted as a way to identify Flora and are indicative of her personality or what she represents, the flowers are also characters themselves. Each of the species included in the painting has, over time, been cultivated in gardens and greenhouses, indicating that they have become domesticated and are no longer wild. This associates Flora, and one of the two selves every woman possesses, with domesticity, showing that they have conformed to patriarchal society and its expectations of women — docile, submissive, and an object for men to look at.

Fauna and animals

The character on the left, Fauna, is half-woman, half-wolf. Clarissa Pinkola Estés (1992) states that women and wolves share many characteristics: keen sensing, playful spirit, and a heightened capacity for devotion. Wolves and women are relational by nature, inquiring, possessed of great endurance and strength. They are deeply intuitive...[and] are experienced in adapting to constantly changing circumstances; they are fiercely stalwart and brave (p. 4).

However, Estés further elaborates that, like wolves, women have been misunderstood, mainly by society and men: both have been hounded, harassed, and falsely imputed to be devouring and devious, overly aggressive, of less value than those who are their detractors. They have been the targets of those who would clean up the wilds as well as the wildish environs of the psyche, extinguishing the instinctual, and leaving no trace of it behind (1992, p. 4).

Because women traditionally have been deemed less worthy than men, they have been forced to become submissive in a male-dominated society. Misunderstandings and misrepresentations of women's true natures by patriarchal society forces women to cover those characteristics which are so natural to them: intuition, bravery, passionate creativity, awareness, playfulness, and strength. Women lose their wildness and power and become docile, forcing their hidden selves to remain in check. Fauna, therefore, represents the wild nature women are forced to keep hidden.

This idea is further reinforced by the presence of the animals covering

Fauna's skirt. All of the animals represented, although some are fictitious, are wild and not domesticated for human use. This associates Fauna with wildness and instinct — the other self women possess, which they are forced to subvert. Each animal can also be considered a distinct personality trait associated with the wild self.

Greek words

The two final characters in the painting are not living characters, but lexicon characters. Greek words accompany Flora and Fauna, located to the sides of their heads. One word means "flora" and the other means "fauna" (Watts, 2000, pp. 288, 292), but the Greek word for "flora" is located by Fauna, and the Greek word for "fauna" is located by Flora. By identifying each character as the wrong name, Selski portrays the common characteristics of dyslexia: switching the order of words around, and seeing representations of items that do not reflect reality. However, virtually all viewers of the painting will not know what the Greek words mean. Since dyslexia is a disability that does not manifest itself to other people readily, Selski includes words that no one knows to attest to the nature of dyslexia, allowing her to disguise it from viewers.

Actions

Hand-holding

The most apparent action in the painting takes place in the center. Flora and Fauna are holding hands, demonstrating the inherent relational nature of women. This action also indicates unity, implying that they are two halves of the same woman.

Flora's hand position on skirt

Flora appears to be daintily grasping her skirt with the fingertips of her left hand, as if to lift it up slightly. This demonstrates that she is being the "proper" self that adheres to societal norms, which parallels the flowers on her dress representing domesticity. Flora is following societal guidelines for how women should "act," further reinforcing that she represents the domesticated self all women possess.

Facial expression and gaze

The facial expressions of Flora and Fauna are straight-faced, with closed lips and a serious expression in their eyes. Their faces bear an uncanny resemblance to the face of the young girl portrayed in Petrus Christus' *Portrait of a Young Lady* (c. 1468). Joel Upton (1990) states that

the young girl in Christus' painting seems impatient, which is evident in her "alert and asymmetrical glance" (pp. 30-31). Furthermore, he asserts that the portrait addresses the issue of "the viewer's self-conscious involvement in the scene portrayed and, conversely, the subject's awareness of the viewer's presence" (p. 30). *Portrait of a Young Lady* shows the lady's and the artist's recognition of the viewer, a recognition that is also apparent by looking into the eyes of the two female characters in Selski's *The Twins III*.

Both Flora and Fauna directly look out at the viewer. By confronting the viewer through their gazes, they become more active within the painting's setting and assert their existence. They do not become the passive objects their attire tries to make them become. The viewer's returned gaze into their eyes asserts his or her recognition of the selves' existence.

Pose

Furthermore, the poses of Flora and Fauna resemble those of the two female figures in *The Two Fridas* (1939) by Frida Kahlo. This painting visualizes the two different dimensions of Kahlo's identity. Both female figures in that painting are self-portraits of Kahlo, seated on chairs facing viewers, but symmetrically positioned, like the female characters in Selski's painting. They are dressed in different attire, identifying distinctive aspects of Kahlo's identity (Grimberg, 1998, p. 98). Both *Fridas* also hold hands, as do Flora and Fauna in Selski's painting, indicating that they are two selves of the same woman. In *The Twins III*, Selski evokes the various similarities to Kahlo's *The Two Fridas* to show that all women, including her, each have two selves that make up their identities.

Rhetorical Vision and Implications of the Construction of Gender

Through the setting, characters and actions Selski places in *The Twins III*, she establishes many dichotomies throughout the work — boundlessness within boundaries, wild touching domesticated, freedom against control. She uses these dichotomies to present her rhetorical vision concerning the identities of women. Women have dual natures — the self that is wild, intuitive and free, and the self that is domesticated and has conformed to patriarchal society. Selski presents an illustration showing women who they truly are, allowing female viewers to see both sides of themselves via the female characters in the painting.

One of the central themes to this rhetorical vision is that of women's identities and how they function within society and are representative of the positions they have been "assigned" in society. Flora represents a woman's self that has become the patriarchal hierarchy's domesticated

definition of a woman, and Fauna represents the self that embodies the true, free nature of women. The setting the characters find themselves in (and wearing) indicates patriarchal society, but is also a social construction. Flora and Fauna both developed their selves within the confines of a male-dominated culture.

However, just because Flora and Fauna wear, literally, the trappings of a patriarchal society does not mean that they are passive. Both characters face the viewer and gaze directly at them, asserting to viewers their existence and identities and experiences. Viewers looking at the painting return the gaze of the two selves, increasing the likelihood that they will realize the experiences of those selves — and of all women — and will recognize that women's status in society has forced them to develop dual identities.

Elements of the past and present in the painting point out the fact that women have developed their identities from a male perspective for thousands of years and continue to do so because men still dominate most societies. Furthermore, by indicating the timelessness of the characters through the lack of shadows they create, the artist implies that as long as society is dominated by a male hierarchy, women will continue to develop their identities in reference to that hierarchical culture. This also implies that the ideology of domination is harmful to women, forcing them to subvert one-half of their identities just so they have a place in this patriarchal society, albeit an unequal and objectified one.

Even though women are trapped from fully exposing the wild aspects of their identities, they still do so, but quietly. Fauna, the wild self, represents this through her depiction as half-woman, half-wolf, and the animals represented on her dress. Also, her skirt, compared to that of Flora, is more transparent. This references the way women have asserted their wild selves since the dawn of male-dominated civilization — elusively, under the radar, imperceptibly. Being more vocal would cause men to feel threatened, thereby causing them to confront women, reinforce their “place” in society, and further subjugate them. Fauna represents what women have done and will continue to do in order to prevent their wild selves from eradication and to resist the ideology of domination — assert that wildness subtly so the male “powers” do not take notice and oppress women even more.

Selski's painting also includes a theme that comes directly from her own life. *The Twins III* examines the effects of dyslexia, particularly how the artist sees the world, and also demonstrates its nature. Because most viewers would not know what the Greek words by Flora and Fauna mean, or recognize that they have been switched, Selski attests the often hidden

nature of that learning disability. Dyslexia also forces a person to realize and accept that s/he sees the world in a different way than other people.

Contribution to Rhetorical Theory and Directions for Future Research

Over the past two decades, rhetorical analyses have focused more on non-discursive discourse, such as artwork. This study provides another analysis that scholars can consult when doing future research, showing that artwork can be rhetorical. Fantasy-theme criticism also appears to be an analytical method that has waned in popularity as more scholars prefer methods like cluster and metaphorical criticisms. This analysis provides another example showing how fantasy-theme criticism can be an extremely useful tool in discovering how a rhetor aims to persuade the audience through his or her discourse. Furthermore, fantasy-theme criticisms typically study many rhetorical discourses to "look for patterns of characterizations...of dramatic situations and actions...and of setting," as Bormann (1972, p. 401) states, reconstructing the rhetorical vision from the fantasy themes present in the artifacts. This study shows that a fantasy-theme criticism can be applied to just one artifact, showing how the rhetor can use elements in his or her discourse to create a rhetorical vision.

Feminist rhetorical criticism is a method that has, since its inception, grown in popularity. As with fantasy-theme criticism, this analysis will provide another study scholars can consult when conducting feminist criticisms. Applying feminist criticism to artwork, as this study did, can help critics determine what artists imply about gender and the ideology of domination through their work.

Future research would benefit from continuing to analyze more non-discursive forms of rhetoric, providing a wider body of literature scholars can reference in their own studies. This would also show how beneficial studying non-discursive rhetoric can be, especially to the field of rhetoric, because, as Foss (1982) states, "the symbolism of the visual image needs to be studied as much as verbal discourse...[and] we can no longer confine ourselves to the study of verbal symbols" (p. 55). Studying visual rhetoric, like artwork, will only enhance the formation and application of rhetorical theory.

Also, Selski includes many repeated elements in her artwork, such as women wearing "heavy brocade or gauzy gowns with huge starched collars" (Abbe, 2005, p. E20), and characters such as Hen Woman, Flora, Fauna, and various Queens and infant Sirens (Randall, 2005a, p. 19). Studying a larger body of her paintings will provide more insight into her work, and will also show how the repeated elements constitute or symbolize her rhetorical vision or aims.

Conclusion

By creating and exhibiting *The Twins III*, Margo Selski strives to inform and persuade her audience of an inherent truth about women: women have dual natures. Conducting fantasy-theme and feminist analyses of these paintings illustrates how the artist shows this truth through the visual elements in her painting. The main characters in her painting represent women's contradictory selves: the self that has conformed to patriarchal society's ideal of the perfect woman, and the self who yearns to break free of the societal chains that constrict her so she can fully rely on her instinctive, relational nature that society wants her to ignore. This idea of women being bound and boundless at the same time is reflected in the setting, characters, and actions of the painting.

The Twins III also implies that the ideology of domination stifles women's experiences and realities, forcing them to subvert who they truly are in exchange for attempting to fit into society's standards for women. However, women have gone against the grain of dominant culture by elusively asserting their wild natures within the culture. Women have done this in the past and continue to do so in the present, because it has been the only way they have been able to resist masculine ideology without further oppression by men.

Selski's painting, like other works of art, is more than just a pleasing scene or display. *The Twins III* provides a visual representation of the reality of women's lives, allowing women to acknowledge the fact that their identities are made up of two different selves — wild and domesticated, liberated versus bound, free against controlled. This acknowledgement will cause women to take agency of their own lives and consider what path their lives will take — which "self" they will become. Selski's painting provides a map for women, showing them where they have come from, where they are now, and where they can go in the future.

References

- Abbe, M. (2005, July 8). Fiercely female. *Star Tribune*, p. E20.
- Arnheim, R. (1974). *Art and visual perception: A psychology of the creative eye* (New Ed.). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Benoit, W. L., Klyukovski, A. A., McHale, J. P., & Airne, D. (2001). A fantasy theme analysis of political cartoons on the Clinton-Lewinsky-Starr affair. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 18 (4), 377-394.
- Bormann, E. G. (1972). Fantasy and rhetorical vision: The rhetorical criticism of social reality. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 58 (4), 396-407.

- Bormann, E. G. (1982). Fantasy and rhetorical vision: Ten years later. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 68 (3), 288-305.
- Estés, C. P. (1992). *Women who run with the wolves: Myths and stories of the wild woman archetype*. New York: Ballantine Books.
- Foss, S. K. (1982). Rhetoric and the visual image: A resource unit. *Communication Education* (31), 55-66.
- Foss, S. K. (1988). Judy Chicago's *The Dinner Party*: Empowering of women's voice in visual art. In S. K. Foss, *Rhetorical criticism: Exploration & practice* (3rd ed.) (pp. 168-181). Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Foss, S. K. (2004). *Rhetorical criticism: Exploration & practice* (3rd ed.). Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Grimberg, S. (1998). Frida Kahlo: The self as an end. In W. Chadwick (Ed.), *Mirror images: Women, surrealism, and self-representation* (2nd ed.). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Janson, J. (2001). *The Art of Painting by Johannes Vermeer*. Essential Vermeer Website. Retrieved October 22, 2005, from <http://essentialvermeer.20m.com/index.html>.
- Kleinbauer, W. E. (1971). *Modern perspectives in Western art history*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- McCormick, K. A., & Weiss, D. (2002). The sociopolitical messages of graffiti art. In S. K. Foss, *Rhetorical criticism: Exploration & practice* (3rd ed.) (pp. 140-147). Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.
- Mohrmann, G. P. (1982). Fantasy theme criticism: A peroration. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 68 (3), 306-313.
- Randall, C. (2005a, July/August). In the balance. *Arts: Magazine of the Minneapolis Institute of Arts*, 28, 18-19.
- Randall, C. (2005b). "In the balance." Exhibition brochure. Minneapolis, MN: Minneapolis Institute of Arts.
- Selski, M. (2003). Curriculum vitae.
- Selski, M. (2004). Artist's statement. Retrieved August 30, 2005, from www.mnartists.org/work.do?jsessionid=B97C43A8EA7F9195933859C707EE2AC2?rid=11710
- Tomson, E. (2005, August 7). Family helps bring painter's life into balance. *St. Paul Pioneer Press*, pp. 1E, 11E.
- Upton, J. M. (1990). *Petrus Christus: His place in fifteenth-century Flemish painting*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Watts, N. (2000). Fauna. In *The Oxford Greek Dictionary, American Edition* (p. 288). New York: Berkley.
- Watts, N. (2000). Flora. In *The Oxford Greek Dictionary, American Edition* (p. 292). New York: Berkley.

***Epeideictic Rhetoric in the New York Times:
Announcements of Lesbian and Gay Commitment Rites***

Jeffrey A. Nelson

Associate Professor
Communication Studies
Kent State University
janelson@kent.edu

Abstract

On September 1, 2002 the New York Times began publishing in its Sunday Styles section announcements of lesbian and gay commitment rites. Treating the announcements as epeideictic, the study analyzes them over a one-year period, that time considered an ample duration for gaining a solid grasp of the rhetorical patterns favored by the Times editors. Relying on past research in epeideictic by Burke, Perelman, Condit, and others, the paper gives special attention to the role of controversy in the Times' actions, with epeideictic's connection to deliberative and forensic rhetoric receiving notice. The study analyzes not just the language in the Times rhetoric but visual components as well.

On August 31, 2002 Adrian Cecilia Ready married Michael James Pastore in a ceremony performed by the Reverend Francis F. Burch, a Roman Catholic priest, at St. Kevin Church in Springfield, Pennsylvania. The *New York Times* announcement of the wedding the next day told not only of the event itself but of the jobs held by the two individuals, universities they had attended, as well as information about their parents ("Adrian Ready," 2002).

The Ready-Pastore announcement represented nothing extraordinary for the Times since it had been reporting in its Sunday Styles, or society, section on the weddings of couples for decades. In another sense, though, the announcement did break new ground because on the same page there appeared a report on the affirmation of the partnership between Daniel Andrew Gross and Steven Goldstein, in a ceremony conducted before Rabbi David M. Steinberg at the Musée des Beaux-Arts of Montreal. As in the Ready-Pastore case, the newspaper noted the jobs held by the two persons, where they had received their college educations, and some basic facts about their parents ("Daniel Gross," 2002). Thus the *Times* made its first announcement ever in its Styles section of a same-sex commitment ceremony.

The paper had notified its readers on August 18 of its intent to provide reports on lesbian-gay commitment rites. In a reference to the epideictic nature of such reports, the article quoted executive editor Howell Raines: "We acknowledge the newsworthiness of a growing and visible trend in society toward public celebrations of commitment by gay and lesbian couples — celebrations important to many of our readers, their families and friends" ("Times Will Begin," 2002, p. 30). While granting the joyous nature of these celebrations, Raines assured readers that the *Times* would not neglect to report on the controversy associated with lesbian-gay relationships: "We recognize that society remains divided about the legal and religious definition of marriage, and our news columns will remain impartial in that debate, reporting fully on all points of view" ("Times Will Begin," p. 30). In the above remark Raines implied that any argument regarding lesbian-gay alliances would be left on the news and editorial pages. In his very next sentence he confirmed that the Styles section would focus exclusively on the jubilation engendered by gay and lesbian commitment ceremonies: "The Styles pages will treat same-sex celebrations as a discrete phenomenon meriting coverage in their own right" ("Times Will Begin," p. 30).

The friction brought on by the *Times*' plan for announcing lesbian-gay unions came through in a short but telling letter to the editor — obviously alluding to a widespread view of gays and lesbians as undesirable deviants, following the newspaper's declaration that it would print such announcements. In that missive Kari Wells (2002) wrote: "You are supporting and promoting the idea that marriage is not sacred by condoning same sex 'commitments'" (p. A18). Wells was voicing a fear held by many Americans, that lesbians and gays were intruding upon a hallowed status that had traditionally been reserved for, and should continue to be designated for, heterosexuals only. The people's concerns over the issue are evidenced even today in the often tense debate on the matter being carried out throughout the nation.

It should pose no surprise that an opponent of lesbian and gay "weddings" would express special concern about these events being covered in the *Times*. As one of the world's most powerful, influential newspapers, it can impress upon large numbers of people certain images which may impact their societal view (Proctor, 2000; Shepard, 1996). Indeed scores of other American papers carry announcements of lesbian and gay commitments but none has the might of the *Times* (Morris & Hallett, 2002).

This study works to uncover how the *Times* announcements rhetorically operate. Since the study treats the announcements as epideictic rhetoric,

an initial section advances a detailed explication of the epideictic genre. Following a brief discussion of marriage comes the actual analysis of the newspaper's rhetoric over a one-year period, that time considered an ample duration for gaining a solid grasp of the rhetorical patterns favored by Times editors. The analysis focuses on how the editors actually described the couples, including biographies and special insights. The final section draws conclusions and suggests how the study may prove valuable for future researchers.

The Epideictic Realm

From the time of Aristotle to the present, while critics have seemingly devoted the great majority of their efforts to deliberative and forensic rhetoric, they have not neglected epideictic. Though they have clearly appreciated the import of studying argument in the political and judicial realms, they have also shown a concern with messages emphasizing praise or blame. And since the objective of epideictic discourse has often been seen as inspiration of the audience, it seems appropriate that this kind of discourse is often associated with occasions of celebration.

Many observers have claimed that since epideictic's major goal allegedly centers on emotionally moving the readers/listeners, the rhetor has no need to add to their information base — the rhetor's success or failure lies primarily with the canon of style (Burgess, 1902/1987). Though agreeing that style plays a prominent role, Condit (1985) asserted that the critic must view an epideictic act from a broader perspective. She stated that the rhetor for such an act has three possible functions to carry out for an audience: understanding, entertainment, and sharing of community. In helping the audience members understand, the agent works to explain to them the significance of "a social world" (Condit, p. 288) and through entertaining, the agent endeavors to please the assembly through the use of "beauty and power" (Condit, p. 290) in language. In an effort to build community, the rhetor concentrates on "expressing and reformulating our shared heritage" (Condit, p. 289).

The epideictic writer/speaker generally has little interest in changing the values already held by the receivers. Instead the agent appeals to the "particular values recognized by the audience," "traditional and accepted values" (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969, p. 51). For the most part then the rhetor strives to reinforce attitudes already held by audience members. She/he acts to strengthen an individual and communal "identity by expressing and restructuring the symbolic repertoire around special events, places, persons, or times" (Condit, 1985, p. 292). Epideictic aims

to unite, not divide a group of receivers. However, the fact that epideictic's function seems rather conservative does not mean that this kind of rhetoric cannot be used to help the audience adjust to cultural change (Condit).

In fact Perelman (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969) stated bluntly that epideictic "forms a central part of the art of persuasion" (p. 49). Crable and Vibbert (1983) alluded to this persuasive theme as they demonstrated how Mobil Oil used Sunday newspapers in running a series of *olios* – institutional advertisements – epideictic in nature and appealing to an American populist sensitivity, in order to influence the readership. The *olios* took the form of short essays, and though using a different approach each week, all focused on the notion that Mobil and the American people agreed that the nation's magnificent natural resources should be celebrated – and protected. Crable and Vibbert noted that the *olios* "are interesting because they are messages aimed at correcting what Mobil feared was a problem of public acceptance and sympathy" (p. 384). According to the writers Mobil tried to build in the audience's minds fresh premises which would ultimately induce those individuals to honor certain claims made by the oil conglomerate, especially regarding the wise use of the country's resources. A premise, or warrant, forms the connection between established data and a claim, or conclusion, in an argument. A rhetor sometimes sets out to show, through a significant number of examples as Mobil did, that the use of a novel warrant appears to lead from selected data to a conclusion attractive to both agent and receivers (Crable & Vibbert; Toulmin, 1974). Even more, the writer-speaker in advancing such a warrant may be cementing values in the audience members in such a way that they will later open themselves more readily to hard arguments related to those values (Condit, 1985).

Though the ethos of the rhetor certainly has an important role in deliberative and forensic communications, in epideictic this property may hold even more vital worth. For it is not just the agent's values that are being celebrated but those of virtually the whole community of readers/listeners. Especially in this circumstance those receivers look for a communicator with an outstanding reputation and remarkable rhetorical skills – an individual capable of paying a lofty tribute to concepts prized greatly by the people. Perelman relied on philosopher Simone Weil to carry the point: "If one hears this [widely valued] thought expressed publicly by some other person, and especially by someone whose words are listened to with respect, its force is increased a hundred-fold and can sometimes bring about an inner transformation" (quoted in Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969, p. 53).

Weddings

It is difficult to find a more venerated term in the American lexicon than "family." If an ideograph (McGee, 1980) represents for a culture a sacred expression signifying a people's unquestioned commitment to a particular vision, then "family" stands in the highest order of ideographs for the United States. According to American legend the ideal family includes a woman and man, often with children, all the members being truly devoted to one another (Bernardes, 1997). Still another term, "marriage," remains as the foundation for family in the nation. Though a married couple no longer exists within many of the country's families, most Americans continue to revere the term "marriage," the word signifying the source from which all that is good in the family allegedly flows (Bernardes; Collins & Coltrane, 1995; Cott, 2000; Gelles, 1995).

The wedding, the ceremony at which the couple enters into the married state, has turned out to be "one of our [Americans'] most enduring social and religious rituals," an event at which the two parties announce before witnesses their intention "to love and honor each other forever" (Anderson, Browning, & Boyer, 2002, p. 3). Often "the couple takes on the trappings of royalty" (Anderson et al., p. 3) for the occasion which has likely seen meticulous planning, sometimes for a year or more. Americans enjoy fantasizing that "every wedding is the culmination of a great love story" with its own special "happy ending" (Brady, 2002, front dust jacket). Weddings then are supposed to be joyous affairs, certainly not times for serious argument but for celebratory rhetoric, for the epideictic mode.

New York Times Announcements

As the *New York Times* began publishing reports of lesbian-gay commitment rites, it made one simple change in a caption for its Sunday Styles section: the heading for the "Weddings" department became "Weddings/Celebrations." In the reports themselves some words needed to be substituted, for example "partnership" for "marriage" and "commitment ceremony" for "wedding." But the editors made all else about both kinds of announcements virtually the same. For one thing, the reader could not predict the arrangement of the reports. If 40 total accounts occurred on a Sunday and 3 of them dealt with lesbian-gay occasions, those might be listed in the 1st, 17th, and 23rd places or just as easily in the 8th, 29th, and 32nd spots.

In fact of the 53 Sunday *Times* editions from September 1, 2002 through August 31, 2003, 32 of these included at least one gay or lesbian announcement. The greatest number of these announcements in a single issue was 4, happening twice over the year-long span. Of 1,566 total

reports, 52 or around 3.3% focused on lesbian-gay events. Thirty of the 52 centered on gay males, 22 on lesbians. With 4 columns to a page, the column lineage devoted to gay and lesbian ceremonies proved also to be approximately 3.3%, having 1,418 of a total 42,448 lines.

Through its work the *Times* was clearly promoting a state of inclusion for gays and lesbians with the heterosexual majority. Whereas previously the paper by omission of any reports on lesbian-gay commitment ceremonies had emphasized heterosexual-homosexual differences, it now was stressing a consubstantiality between the two groups. The *Times* was moving gays and lesbians from a category of scapegoat, or unworthy personage (Burke, 1969), to a status equal with the rest of the population. The paper was, in Burke's words, "identifying your ways with his" (p. 55).

Biographies included in all the *Times* announcements reinforced this sense of gay-lesbian identification with mainstream society. Both opposite-sex and same-sex reports offered similar kinds of background information. Thus the September 29, 2002 edition told readers of the marriage of Dr. Suzanne Carroll Diehl, the daughter of Bill and Lorraine B. Diehl, to Douglas Scott Brooks, a son of Marilyn and Dr. Robert Brooks ("Suzanne Diehl"). Rabbi William Kloner had officiated at the wedding. Dr. Diehl, a practicing child psychologist and instructor at Harvard Medical School, had degrees from Clark, Fordham, and Yeshiva Universities. Her father was an entertainment correspondent for ABC Radio and her mother wrote a weekly feature for the *Daily News* in New York. Scott Brooks worked as an associate at Kelly, Libby & Hoopes, a Boston law firm. His degrees came from Emory and Harvard Universities. His father taught at Harvard Medical School and his mother headed the Latin American studies program at Brandeis University.

If readers were impressed with the pedigree of the Diehl-Brooks families, they might be just as taken with the credentials of the Stein-Deutsch families ("Melissa Stein," 2002). The same September 29 issue announced the commitment ceremony of two women, Dr. Melissa Rachel Stein and Elena Fanny Deutsch, with Rabbi Nancy H. Wiener officiating. Dr. Stein, a chief resident in internal medicine at Montefiore Medical Center, had graduated from the University of Chicago and Cornell University. Her father was a professor at Cornell Medical School and her mother owned a restaurant. Elena Deutsch served as the director of tobacco control for the American Cancer Society in Manhattan, and she had degrees from the University of Michigan and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Her late father had been a partner in the Manhattan law firm of Bobick, Deutsch & Schlessner and her mother was a retired psychotherapist.

The two accounts described above illustrate well the tendency of the *Times*' Styles section to favor reports on couples connected to elite universities and professions (see Morris & Hallett, 2002; Sandler, 2002). Considering Americans' fascination with rich, powerful people, the paper looks to have been adapting to the wants of its audience. If one purpose of epideictic is to entertain (Condit, 1985), then the *Times* worked at fulfilling that function for its readers by titillating them with vivid descriptions of prominent, presumably wealthy families.

On the other hand Americans also love a story about a person brought up in modest circumstances who makes it big. Thus occasionally the *Times* printed a report such as that announcing the marriage of Anika Ayanna Bent to Todd Albert ("Anika Bent," 2002). Readers found that Albert, a criminal defense lawyer who had graduated from Boston University and Brooklyn Law School, had a retired cab driver for a father and a substitute teacher for a mother. Similarly, in reporting on the affirmation of the partnership between Aileen Bernice Friedman and Dr. Sharon Fertitta ("Aileen Friedman," 2002) the newspaper noted that the deceased father of Fertitta, a clinical psychologist with a doctorate from the Wright Institute in Los Angeles, had managed two laundromats with no occupation listed for her mother.

Cheney (1983) referred to the importance of an individual seeing "his or her 'reflection' in the social mirror" of another person if that individual was ultimately to identify with the person (p. 147), and Burke (1969) in writing on identification went to Aristotle as a source in stressing the import of the concerned parties sharing "either personally, or through... family, or somehow" (p. 55). What the *Times* was attempting to do through its Weddings/Celebrations department was to show that families can be remarkably alike regardless of the sexual orientation their members have, that assorted kinds of families deserve honor and praise. And if one of the purposes of epideictic rhetoric is to provide understanding, especially "when some event, person, group, or object is confusing or troubling," with the rhetor called upon to "explain the troubling issue in terms of the audience's key values and beliefs" (Condit, 1985, p. 288), then the *Times* worked toward that goal.

Besides providing basic information on the happy couple, in limited cases the *Times* also told a story of the road they took to their day of celebration. For instance, readers discovered that Regina Alexis Crawford and Kevin Matthew Gannon first met in Bruges, Belgium where each had stopped on a European trip. "I saw her right outside the train station," Gannon remembered, and he especially noticed her "very pale skin and

long hair." He went on: "Something inside me clicked and said, 'Wait! What was that?'" ("Regina Crawford," 2003, p. 14). Later the couple toured Amsterdam together but then lost track of each other. Six years following, in Bay Head, New Jersey, where both were summer vacationing, they spotted each other at a house party and after that day began dating. "Three months into it, I remember having a little epiphany," Crawford recalled. "I thought, 'He is handsome and sweet, and has all the characteristics that I want in a man-I'm going to marry this guy'" ("Regina Crawford," p. 14).

As with Crawford and Gannon, *Times* readers could also get to know Wallace McPherson Alston III and Nicholas Gottlieb. The two men had met in August 1992 on a blind date set up by a mutual friend. "She had already set me up with two guys, but my attempts at romance with them were a catastrophe," Alston noted. "She assured me that Nick was the one for me, and I figured, 'What did I have to lose?'" ("Macky Alston," 2002, p. 15). And the couple did have a promising date, to say the least. "We said goodbye, and as I turned from him, I was smiling so hard my cheeks hurt," Gottlieb remarked ("Macky Alston," p. 15). Immediately they began going together and soon Alston invited his newfound companion to MacMahan Island in Maine where the Alston family had vacationed for many years at their summer home. "It was taking him to my sacred spot, and truly meant that I liked him a lot," Alston commented ("Macky Alston," p. 15).

These stories of couples told by *Times* reporters not only gave the audience a fuller understanding of those couples but highlighted the shared experiences, or sense of community, they had. By being exposed to tales of courtship and affection, readers could come to appreciate the heritage and values these couples, whether heterosexual or homosexual, held in common (Condit, 1985; McGee, 1975). In American custom lesbian/gay partners have been excluded from such a community but now the *Times* was attempting to bring them into the fold.

The *Times* narratives of couples offered a form of entertainment in addition to that provided by the vivid stories described above. Though the language used in telling the narrative could not be described as eloquent in the sense of coming from a brilliant wordsmith, it could be called eloquent in its display of "a unique capacity of humanity" (Condit, 1985, p. 290) — caring and love. Readers were "allowed to stretch their daily experiences into meanings more grand, sweet, noble, or delightful" (Condit, p. 290) by encountering the touching romantic wording used to portray the couples every Sunday. Contrary to the longstanding American impression of heterosexual and homosexual couples being "at odds with one another," (Burke, 1969, p. 22), the *Times* narratives showed them to be remarkably alike.

The paper highlighted an even richer identification between opposite-sex and same-sex couples on August 3, 2003, then again on August 24. On the first date the *Times* provided an otherwise standard account of the commitment of two men but began with: "Marvin Yost Schofer and James Rosenthal were married on Wednesday at the Metropolitan Community Church in Toronto" ("Marvin Schofer," 2003, p. 10). The second instance proved similar, with the opening sentence stating: "Peter Freiberg and Joe Tom Easley were married in the wedding chambers of Toronto's City Hall on Wednesday" ("Peter Freiberg," 2003, p. 10). The paper, choosing in these two circumstances the words "were married" instead of a phrase such as "affirmed their partnership" indeed was publishing an accurate report since a recent court ruling in Ontario, Canada had made lesbian-gay marriage legal in that province. But for those readers who did not know of the court decision, the Styles editors made no effort to inform them of it. In this case the *Times* was adhering strictly to an epideictic theme. To tell of the court's conclusion would have been to bring onto the Weddings/Celebrations pages a flavor of the controversy surrounding gay and lesbian marriage, and superior rhetors have generally considered direct reference to controversy an improper consideration in epideictic communication (Condit, 1985; Murphy, 1992; Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969). The paper was sticking with a strategy that had apparently worked well for others.

Times editors arranged to have many of the wedding announcements accompanied by photographs, usually showing the couple being married but occasionally just the bride. These shots, generally around 5.25 square inches, came with 763 of the year's 1514 accounts, or in approximately 50.4% of the cases. The paper offered the same consideration to gay and lesbian reports, with 27 of 52 announcements having a photograph, a 51.9% rate. Sixteen of the shots featured gay male couples and 11 depicted lesbians. If readers could see a beaming Ilene Rosenzweig and Rick Marin in a photograph attached to the report of their wedding ("Ilene Rosenzweig," 2003), they could also view a broadly smiling Marian Schwindeman hugging Paula Romano in a photo accompanying the account of their commitment ceremony ("Marian Schwindeman," 2003).

Contemporary critics have not shown much interest in visual images associated with epideictic rhetoric, an understandable posture since epideictic has traditionally been perceived as an action primarily involving language usage. Yet visuals, including photographs, can make major contributions to a celebratory event as they invite acclaim for the occasion. While they cannot replace words, they "can elucidate, educate, and enrich our view of history" (Stepan, 2000, p. 11). Further, photographers, through

their selection of exactly what will appear in a picture and through the use of varied photographic techniques, can control the image brought to the audience's attention. They can "encourage a particular reading" (Alvarado, 2001, p. 155).

The *Times* photos of apparently blissful lesbian-gay couples offered to many readers a new way of looking at gays and lesbians. Those readers were "given access to alternative ways of knowing: ones that offer the possibility of understanding, differently, matters of self, Other, history, and culture" (Hughes & Noble, 2003, p. 6). The photographs also implied a freshly found affinity between heterosexuals and homosexuals, a "communal visual environment," a "shared environment" (Lubin, 2003, p. B13) that had not existed before these photos began to appear on the *Times* pages. Instead of being excluded gays and lesbians now became an integral part of the Sunday festivities. Further, the photos almost certainly provided "pleasure and fascination" (Savedoff, 2000, p. 2) for many in the paper's readership. Through viewing the photographs those readers in a way became part of a joyous commemoration, applauding a couple they had just come to know.

If the *Times* honors selected couples by publishing reports of their marriage or commitment ceremony in its Weddings/Celebrations department, then it lionizes some unions by covering them in its Vows segment. This feature "is one of the most coveted spots in the paper" (Sandler, 2002, p. 15), having a huge readership (Brady, 1997; Sandler). The editors choose just one couple each week for this privileged space, included in the Weddings/Celebrations department but serving as a kind of centerpiece for all other announcements. The Vows coverage begins at the top of a page with a bold headline and generally spreads over almost half of the page. While other accounts average around 27 lines, the Vows report has approximately 100. Instead of a single relatively small photograph, there appear two imposing photos, one about 13.5 square inches and the other around 54 square inches.

On August 10, 2003 the Vows audience could read of the wedding of television anchors Kara Sundlun and Dennis House. The two had lived in adjacent apartment buildings in Hartford, Connecticut and eventually began joining together in activities such as working out at the gym and just running errands. House, for a time in competition with another man for Sundlun's affection, was about to concede to his competitor when he happened to run into her mother at the bakery in a grocery store. The mother encouraged him: "Hang in there, Dennis, I think you're better for her" ("Kara Sundlun," 2003, p. 11). House took the advice, and ultimately Sundlun accepted his

proposal of marriage at the Grand Hotel on Mackinac Island, Michigan. The smaller photo accompanying the *Times* announcement showed an attendant adjusting the bride's veil – Bruce Sundlun, the bride's father and former governor of Rhode Island, looking on. The larger photograph depicted the wedded couple leaving St. Augustine Church in Newport, Rhode Island as the bridal party gathered round.

From September 2002 through August 2003 one Vows report did not focus on a married couple but instead on two men, editor Mark Harris and playwright Tony Kushner, as they celebrated their partnership in a formal ceremony. In the May 4, 2003 account readers learned of Harris' impression upon first meeting Kushner at a party five years earlier: "I thought Tony was cute and extremely shy. I was touched by how tentative he was." The *Times* readership also came to know Kushner's feelings about Harris as they talked online later that evening: "His grammar was perfect...That was a turn-on" ("Mark Harris," 2003, p. 15). Most of the couple's dates occurred either in bookstores or theaters and when the two began planning their commitment rite, they went to Tiffany's for rings and Saks for complementing gray suits. The smaller photograph attached to the article featured Kushner and Harris holding hands and fondly watching one another as a smiling Rabbi Ellen Lippmann, the ceremony officiator, looked on. In the larger photo Harris and Kushner, looking elated, appeared together, surrounded by guests.

In fact it would have been foolish for *Times* editors to include lesbians-gays in its Weddings/Celebrations department while excluding them from the Vows segment. For such an omission would have indicated that the paper believed somewhat but not fully in values that demanded the honoring of lesbian-gay commitments. An omission would have marked a division between the kinds of homage due heterosexual and homosexual celebrations of partnership. The best epideictic rhetors focus on a theme of unity and do not hedge on values they prize. Moreover, making gays and lesbians a part of Vows reinforced the message sent through the standard Weddings/Celebrations announcements. The more often key values are reinforced in audience members through effective epideictic rhetoric, the more likely it is that they will firmly embrace those values and ultimately act on them (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969).

And it was family values that the *Times* was underscoring in its reports on couples — not family values just in the sense of a man and woman getting married but in the sense of two loving human beings choosing to join their lives. If strong opposition existed among the paper's readership to the *Times*' definition of family values, that opposition did not surface

in its pages to any significant degree. The only objection came in the form of the brief Kari Wells letter mentioned earlier, published in the editorial section, not the Styles pages. Certainly the editors must have realized that large numbers of Americans like Wells had little enthusiasm for the *Times'* Weddings/Celebrations policy. Nonetheless the paper elected to proceed with its inspirational rhetoric. Indeed "Inspiration is needed during hard times, hard times run parallel to struggles, and struggles often accompany controversy" (Matthews, 1995, p. 277). For the many opposed to its policy, the *Times* was displaying a kind of "epideictic dissent," challenging their interpretation of the matters at hand "by offering alternative definitions of the issue, audience, and moral policy" (Matthews, p. 278). As a journalistic source often thought by scholars to be the most prestigious internationally, widely respected and admired on a popular level likely more than any other newspaper (Mnookin, 2003; Proctor, 2000; Shepard, 1996), the *Times* found itself well positioned to carry out its rhetorical plan.

And though the *Times* rhetoric clearly could not be labeled forensic or deliberative, its connection to those genres can be seen in this commentary on epideictic coming from Braden and Mixon (1988):

Just as the legislative speaker or the lawyer creates enthymemes by drawing upon what is present in the minds of his listeners, so the ceremonial orator creates "proofs" by evoking images and values already existing in the consciousness of his listeners, thus drawing them actively into the rhetorical process. (p. 53) The two authors went on to say that in numerous instances then epideictic rhetors have suasive aims as they endeavor to reinforce or even change attitudes already held by the audience members (Braden & Mixon). Thus the *Times* in its reports on lesbian-gay commitment ceremonies was appealing to a universal value of human love and was proclaiming to readers that the sex of the two partners made no difference regarding the sacredness of their pledge of devotion to one another. Moreover, the editors were in a fashion fulfilling Perelman's (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969) and Condit's (1985) claims that epideictic often functions by trumpeting values that could ultimately play a key role for the listeners/readers in their backing of judicial and legislative arguments. With all the court and legislative activity regarding same-sex marriage and civil unions now going on in this country, at the state and national levels, the *Times* commitment accounts represented the kind of rhetoric that could exert significant influence.

Though logic surely plays a role in epideictic, "The intensity of the adherence sought is not limited to obtaining purely intellectual results, to a declaration that a certain thesis seems more probable than another"

(Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca. 1969, p. 49). An effective epideictic rhetor seeks a visceral response, one in which audience members involve their full range of feelings on an issue. Thus the texts and photos in the *Times*' Weddings/Celebrations department might cause readers to reach into their own memories and revive fond sentiments relating to love and family, sentiments connecting the readers to the couples featured.

It would be naive to conclude that most Americans, exposed to epideictic rhetoric such as that in the *Times* honoring lesbian-gay commitments, would not have conflicting values relating to the issue. Such a condition is common in epideictic situations (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969; Rudolph, 1982). While probably the great majority of the people have a fondness for a good love story, many of them believe that such a wholesome story cannot exist with two people of the same sex since allegedly such a relationship is in opposition to natural and/or divine law. The Styles section's editors refused to be drawn into a debate regarding which values should prevail in the readers' minds. But the editors certainly did set "out to increase the intensity of adherence to certain values," to "establish a sense of communion centered around particular values recognized by the audience" (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, p. 51). The paper then was taking a firm stand on "which values should be recognized and which values should have priority" (Rudolph, p. 332). It was making a strong suggestion on which direction the audience should take, a direction favoring high regard for lesbian-gay commitments.

In fact, by publicizing lesbian and gay commitment ceremonies the *Times* was proclaiming a major shift in the priority of its values. Previously, by omitting any accounts of such ceremonies, the editors were declaring that those events did not merit attention and certainly not alongside marriage announcements. By remaining silent on a social issue the rhetor frequently conveys the message that society's handling of that issue is proceeding satisfactorily and needs no change (Noelle-Neumann, 1974). Just as lack of words can make a difference, so can lack of visual images. Public photos celebrating one kind of event, with another kind ignored, can intimate that the second kind deserves no notice, that it does not merit the people's attention (Stepan, 2000). Further, if the public is kept from finding out about events in which certain kinds of persons play vital roles, the public gets much less of an opportunity to identify with those persons. By moving from muteness to grand announcements regarding lesbian-gay partnership affirmations, the *Times* was expanding considerably the window for the public's bond with gays and lesbians.

It should be clear by now that epideictic rhetoric cannot be considered

neutral since it applauds particular values that suggest how the audience should act. Epideictic “expresses approval [of a certain attitude], and, indirectly, a standard.” It “expresses a prayer, a supplication” (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969, p. 160) that the listeners/readers behave in accord with that standard, leading in the long term to their support for specific societal actions (Condit, 1985; Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca). For the case studied here, *Times* editors were in a manner imploring their readers to back a social policy holding in high regard the union of lesbian-gay couples:

In making their supplications the editors did not employ what Toulmin (1974) would label “warrant-using” appeals but they did utilize “warrant-establishing” petitions (p. 121). Crable and Vibbert (1983) in their excellent analysis of Toulmin’s work summarized a warrant-using appeal as one that “relies upon an already established bridge between claim and data (something commonly accepted and usually unchallenged), so that the focus of investigation is not on the link between claim and data, but is instead upon either claim or data” (p. 384). Thus one could start out with basic data, for instance the fact that Laura Bilodeau was married to John Overdeck (“Laura Bilodeau,” 2002). With the warrant being that the marriage of a woman and man is a cause for celebration, one could make the claim that the joining of Bilodeau and Overdeck should be celebrated. In this case the warrant, calling for a celebration of marriage, would generally not be disputed by Americans. Only if there were a problem with the claim or data – for example, a marriage license never existed, making the whole ceremony a sham – could the argument be deemed faulty.

As opposed to a warrant-using petition, Crable and Vibbert (1983) noted, a warrant-establishing appeal “hinges on the acceptability of a novel link between claim and data.” In such situations “the novel warrant is applied to a number of cases where the claim and data are not the source of argument; instead, the warrant, the ‘bridge’ between them, is ‘on trial’” (p. 384). Thus in the same issue in which it reported on the Bilodeau-Overdeck wedding, the *Times* also announced the commitment ceremony of Amy Duddlestone and Hilary Schroeder (“Amy Duddlestone,” 2002). Starting out with the data that Duddlestone and Schroeder’s partnership was being affirmed, one could make the claim that the event ought to be celebrated – but only if one accepted the warrant that the joining of two women was a cause for celebration. And a great many Americans seriously doubt that premise. What the *Times* attempted to do from September 1, 2002 through August 31, 2003 was to present a significant number of cases, 53 to be exact, in which it celebrated the affirmation of partnership between lesbian-gay couples, the paper demonstrating to readers that from

its point of view those partnerships deserved to be celebrated.

The paper's editors then let devices such as formal logic, measurement by degree of probability, creating enthymemes, play no significant part in their rhetorical plan. Instead, through dozens of examples they sought to bring to the fore among readers "values that had been overlooked or played down," to "increase the intensity of adherence to certain values, which might not be contested when considered on their own but may nevertheless not prevail against other values that might come into conflict with them" (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca, 1969, pp. 50-51). New times, new situations call for individuals to review long-held values and decide how they should be applied in order to provide for the broadest human benefit, and the editors were clearly challenging their readers on this matter. By offering so many illustrations of apparently loving gay and lesbian couples joining themselves together, their stories intermixed with those of similar types of heterosexual partners, the *Times* was working at what Isaac Newton called "rendering a proposition general by induction," "using our observations of regularities and correlations as the backing for a novel warrant" (quoted in Toulmin, 1974, p. 121). Tradition-laden antipathy toward homosexual unions, heterosexual alliances being the only wholesome ones according to past practice, needed to be discarded in search of a greater good that called for the honoring of all loving couples. Frequently audience members for an epideictic address must make some sacrifice in order to demonstrate their adherence to the principles featured in the address (Perelman & Olbrechts-Tyteca) and while for some *Times* readers that sacrifice was likely minimal, for others it probably proved imposing as they were being challenged to revise longstanding, treasured attitudes.

Conclusion

The evidence presented here lends credence to the notion that epideictic rhetoric must not necessarily deal only with issues on which the listeners/readers agree with the agent. Though epideictic does not argue directly, it can plant seeds that ultimately lead an audience member to intensify or revise attitudes. The instability of Americans' views on marriage and civil unions for lesbians-gays ("Gallup Poll," 2003; Polling Report, 2006; "USA Today," 2004) suggests the potential of the *Times* pieces and other important rhetoric dealing with the same theme to exert a major impact on the national vision.

This study serves as a reminder that those rhetors working to alter popular attitudes may not want to focus their efforts exclusively on the standard deductive kind of rhetoric often associated with transforming

viewpoints. Enthymematic appeals, based in logic or probability, if well done surely can wield substantial power. But so can other types of advocacy, aimed not only at the mind but the feelings/emotions as well. In a manner these latter types represent a more holistic approach than the former, grabbing at the complete being. In the case of epideictic communication, audience members are called upon to recall their values and if conflict exists among them to homage those most precious. A good number of epideictic addresses on a single topic, made available to the listeners/readers in a consistent pattern and providing a variety of explicit illustrations, offers the receivers the opportunity to use their inductive powers in making judgment.

The findings in this paper cast doubt on the traditional, commonly held position, enunciated in contemporary criticism by Braden and Mixon (1988) among others, that an effective epideictic rhetor tells audience members what they want to hear or read. That descriptor holds true in some instances but not universally. Almost assuredly a considerable portion of the *Times* audience did have a favorable attitude toward the type of message sent in the lesbian-gay announcements, but there was presumably another not insignificant part that objected. One of the standards of success for the *Times* rhetoric and similar epideictic utterances should center on the skill of the agent in motivating those receivers with a negative perspective to reconsider. In this scenario the principles underscored by the rhetor take hold of the audience and become a high priority for them.

An additional determination of the study points to the verdict pronounced so many times in the past by critics of epideictic: the credibility and prestige of the agent should stand at an extremely high level in order for success to be achieved. This prescript looks to be even more essential when that agent is taking on a topic somehow relative to controversy. Nonetheless, a potential fruitful area for further investigation might focus on rhetors lacking the greatest ethos as they begin their epideictic efforts, with the inquiry concentrating on the strategies employed to build high personal regard.

The *Times* lesbian-gay commitment announcements provoke still another consideration – that epideictic rhetoric centering on a theme not treated previously by epideictic rhetors, a fresh theme, may point not only to a changing culture but may offer a good indication of vital matters being pursued in the deliberative and forensic rhetoric of that culture. Certainly, with all the arguments regarding gays and lesbians now going on in the American scene, the liaison proves true here. Indeed future researchers ought to consider more closely the deliberative-

forensic-epideictic connection. Questions about which of the three generally appears first in a movement for cultural change, whether one begets the other with any regularity, whether a successful social transition can occur minus the appearance of one of the three types – these represent some of the considerations that may open the way for a fuller comprehension of movement in society.

References

- Adrian Ready, Michael Pastore [wedding announcement]. (2002, September 1). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 12.
- Aileen Friedman, Sharon Fertitta [commitment announcement]. (2003, August 3). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 9.
- Alvarado, M. (2001). Photographers and narrativity. In M. Alvarado, E. Buscombe, & R. Collins (Eds.), *Representation & photography: A Screen Education reader* (pp. 148-163). New York: Palgrave.
- Amy Duddleston, Hilary Schroeder [commitment announcement]. (2002, October 13). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 15.
- Anderson, K., Browning, D., & Boyer, B. (2002). Introduction to section 1. In K. Anderson, D. Browning, & B. Boyer (Eds.), *Marriage – Just a piece of paper?* (pp. 3-4). Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans.
- Anika Bent, Todd Albert [wedding announcement]. (2003, August 17). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 13.
- Bernardes, J. (1997). *Family studies: An introduction*. New York: Routledge.
- Braden, W.W., & Mixon, H. (1988). Epideictic speaking in the post-Civil War South and the Southern experience. *Southern Communication Journal*, 54, 40-57.
- Brady, L.S. (1997). *Vows: Weddings of the nineties from the New York Times*. New York: William Morrow.
- Burgess, T.C. (1987). *Epideictic literature*. New York: Garland. (Original work published 1902)
- Burke, K. (1969). *A rhetoric of motives* (California ed.). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Cheney, G. (1983). The rhetoric of identification and the study of organizational communication. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 69, 143-158.
- Collins, R., & Coltrane, S. (1995). *Sociology of marriage and the family: Gender, love, and property*. Chicago: Nelson-Hall.
- Condit, C.M. (1985). The function of epideictic: The Boston massacre orations as exemplar. *Communication Quarterly*, 33, 284-299.
- Cott, N.F. (2000). *Public Vows: A history of marriage and the nation*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

- Crable, R.E., & Vibbert, S.L. (1983). Mobil's epideictic advocacy: "Observations" of Prometheus-bound. *Communication Monographs*, 50, 380-394.
- Daniel Gross, Steven Goldstein [commitment announcement]. (2002, September 1). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 12.
- Gallup poll: Gay marriage. (2003, July 5). *Plain Dealer* (Cleveland, OH), p. B9.
- Gelles, R.J. (1995). *Contemporary families: A sociological view*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Hughes, A., & Noble, A. (2003). Introduction. In A. Hughes & A. Noble (Eds.), *Phototextualities: Intersections of photography and narrative*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.
- Ilene Rosenzweig, Rick Marin [wedding announcement]. (2003, May 25). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 12.
- Kara Sundlun and Dennis House [Vows feature]. (2003, August 10). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 11.
- Laura Bilodeau, John Overdeck [wedding announcement]. (2002, October 13). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 15.
- Lubin, D.M. (2003, November 14). Visual culture and the Kennedys. *Chronicle of Higher Education*, pp. B12-B13.
- Macky Alston, Nicholas Gottlieb. [commitment announcement]. (2002, September 15). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 15.
- Marian Schwindeman, Paula Romano [commitment announcement]. (2003, July 13). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 10.
- Mark Harris and Tony Kushner [Vows feature]. (2003, May 4). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 15.
- Marvin Schofer, James Rosenthal [commitment announcement]. (2003, August 3). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 10.
- Matthews, G. (1995). Epideictic rhetoric and baseball: Nurturing community through controversy. *Southern Communication Journal*, 60, 275-291.
- McGee, M.C. (1975). In search of "the people": A rhetorical alternative. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 61, 235-249.
- McGee, M.C. (1980). The "ideograph": A link between rhetoric and ideology. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 66, 1-16.
- Melissa Stein, Elena Deutsch [commitment announcement]. (2002, September 29). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 16.
- Mnookin, S. (2003, May 26). The Times Bomb. *Newsweek*, pp. 40-46.

- Morris, H.J., & Hallett, V. (2002, September 9). Public displays of affection. *U.S. News & World Report*, pp. 42-43.
- Murphy, J.M. (1992). Epideictic and deliberative strategies in opposition to the war: The paradox of honor and expediency. *Communication Studies*, 43, 65-78.
- Noelle-Neumann, E. (1974). The spiral of silence: A theory of public opinion. *Journal of Communication*, 24, 43-51.
- Perelman, C., & Olbrechts-Tyteca, L. (1969). *The new rhetoric: A treatise on argumentation* (J. Wilkinson & P. Weaver, Trans.). Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Peter Freiberg, Joe Tom Easley [commitment announcement]. (2003, August 24). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 10.
- PollingReport.Com (2006). *Law and Civil Rights*. Retrieved March 21, 2006 from www.pollingreport.com/civil.htm.
- Proctor, W. (2000). *The gospel according to the New York Times*. Nashville: TN: Broadman & Holman.
- Regina Crawford, Kevin Gannon [wedding announcement]. (2003, May 4). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 14.
- Rudolph, H.J. (1982). Robert F. Kennedy's University of Capetown Address. *Central States Speech Journal*, 33, 319-332.
- Sandler, L. (2002, September 23). Society page. *New Republic*, pp. 14-15.
- Savedoff, B.E. (2000). *Transforming images: How photography complicates the picture*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Shepard, R.F. (1996). *The paper's papers: A reporter's journey through the archives of the New York Times*. New York: Random House.
- Stepan, P. (2000). Image and power. In P. Stepan (Ed.), *Photos that changed the world* (pp. 6-12). Munich, Germany: Prestel.
- Suzanne Diehl, Douglas Brooks [wedding announcement]. (2002, September 29). *New York Times*, sec. 9, p. 16.
- Times will begin reporting gay couples' ceremonies. (2002, August 18). *New York Times*, sec. 1, p. 30.
- Toulmin, S.E. (1974). *The uses of argument* (2nd ed.). Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press.
- USA Today CNN Gallup poll. (2004, January 14). *USA Today*, p. 6D.
- Wells, K. (2002, August 20). Gay couples' unions [letter to the editor]. *New York Times*, p. A18.

***No Trespassing Allowed:
Print Media Reproduces the Othering of the Hmong***

Julie M. Novak

Assistant Professor

Department of Communication

Wayne State University

Detroit, MI

julie.novak@ndsu.edu

Abstract

Mass media plays a powerful role in shaping the dominant ideologies within society. Print media reflects social practice in general and through the use of written language in particular reproduces relationships between cultural and ethnic groups and the exclusionary boundaries of Othering. Through critical discourse analysis and Fairclough's (1995a) differentiation of presence and absence in text, the Othering of the Hmong is revealed in the Minneapolis-St. Paul newspaper coverage of a singular event, a deer hunting confrontation resulting in injuries and deaths. The grievous tragedy provided camouflage for ongoing and pervasive Othering, overtly explicit and insidiously subtle. Like the signs that caution hunters against trespassing, the print media reified the intolerance of ethnic groups and social practice that differs from the dominant.

Mass media plays a powerful role in shaping – whether constructing, reproducing, or restructuring – the dominant ideologies within society. Critical discourse studies contend that the media, a powerful social institution, perpetuate the dominance of the elite and the majority (Riggins, 1997). Newspaper discourse reflects social practice in general and through the use of written language in particular reproduces the dominance of ethnic majorities over ethnic minorities and the exclusionary boundaries and relationships that separate cultural and ethnic groups (Fairclough, 1995b). This paper extends critical discourse analysis to newspaper coverage in Minneapolis-St. Paul, Minnesota about a deer hunting confrontation on November 21, 2004, in Northwest Wisconsin that involved ethnic white and Hmong hunters and reveals a pervasive *Othering* of the Hmong community within the camouflage of tragedy. (See Riggins (1997) for discussion of the common terminology of “Other” in sociology and in scholarship that identifies with postmodernism and cultural studies.)

Hmong Residents as the Newcomers

The Hmong count among the non-dominant, ethnic minorities in the United States. Hmong individuals and families first arrived to the United States as immigrants, primarily as refugees, in the early 1980s, and settled predominantly in California, Minnesota, and Wisconsin (Pfeifer, 2005). Negligible numbers of Hmong lived in the U.S. prior to this mass resettlement. Yet by the year 2000, according to the U.S. census, over 40,000 Hmong individuals lived in Minneapolis-St. Paul, Minnesota, and another 5,000 were anticipated to arrive from abroad throughout 2004 (Nelson, 2005; Pfeifer). More Hmong currently live in St. Paul than any other U. S. city (Rosario, 2004).

While the number of Hmong residents continues to climb, the integration of Hmong into the general community remains rife with incompatibility. Minneapolis and St. Paul newspapers, the *Tribune* and *Pioneer Press* respectively, regularly report on the challenges and tensions encountered in metropolitan businesses, government programs, hospitals, neighborhoods, non-profit organizations, and schools due to the ever-changing demographics and cultural newcomers. Three examples in just two days in the *Tribune* indicate the existence of tensions.

On February 10, 2005, the *Tribune* reported that the first and only Minnesota Hmong state senator had not paid fines for deficiencies in her home health agency thereby jeopardizing the license to operate. Moreover, she had not even responded to the Minnesota Health Department's letters about the fines (Wolfe, 2005). Also on February 10, 2005, the *Tribune* reported about a Hmong aide to St. Paul's mayor that allegedly demanded a bribe from Hmong businessmen hoping to build a Hmong funeral home with city backing (Kennedy & McEnroe, 2005a). And, just the day before, on February 9, 2005, the *Tribune* reported that a Hmong police officer in St. Paul had plead guilty to a felony gun charge in a case that involved assault and bribery (Kennedy & McEnroe, 2005b). All three articles explicitly identified the individuals as Hmong. The three articles appear to weave cultural identities with community tensions and legal violations. Moreover, they portray that even seemingly acculturated Hmong do not behave appropriately or lawfully.

The relatively recent and ongoing arrival of Hmong refugees coupled with articles such as the preceding ones suggest an array of problems related to changing demographics within a community. The more cultures appear markedly and significantly different, as with Hmong and ethnic white cultures, the greater the perceived clash between the new cultural group and the previously existing culture and systems. Even though

third generation Hmong live in Minneapolis-St. Paul, the media seems to continue to report news that portrays Hmong residents as newcomers and, more specifically, outsiders.

Critical Discourse Analysis

Fairclough (1989, 1992, 1995a), like other linguistic and social theory scholars (Foucault, 1972, 1984; Gramsci, 1971; Van Dijk, 1993, 1998), contends that cultural groups have unique ideological-discursive formations (IDFs) and one set of IDFs from a particular cultural group and within a specified geopolitical area is usually dominant. The media, like other social institutions, act to naturalize the dominant IDFs by transforming the ideologies into apparent common sense. Naturalized ideologies thereby become the unconscious and unquestioned norm and lose the recognizable features of ideologies *per se*. To denaturalize IDFs is to reveal how social institutions/structures shape/determine social schemata and discourse, and how discourse in turn determines social structures (Van Dijk, 1993).

Critical discourse analysis views language as inseparably intertwined with interaction and social processes which results in three certain consequences as delineated by Wodak (1999). First, interaction, synonymous with discourse, always involves ideologies and power. Second, interaction is always historical. The meaning in interaction depends upon and derives from multiple and embedded contexts situated in space and time, a phenomenon referred to as intertextuality. Third, each interaction allows for numerous interpretations. Insightful and reflective interpretations rather than definitive ones reflect the inherent ambiguity of socially constructed meaning. Given the three consequences, the critical analysis of discourse attempts to denaturalize the dominant IDFs and provide an insightful interpretation that reveals interplay of power between dominant and non-dominant groups and historical events and contexts.

Written text at times consists of newspaper articles that explicitly relay the ideologies, social practices, and values of the dominant while excluding those of the non-dominant (Fairclough, 1995a; Riggins, 1997). More insidiously, written text may underscore the difference between dominant and non-dominant groups by including descriptive details about individuals belonging to non-dominant groups and imbuing the details with a sense of oddness or unacceptability against a backdrop of familiarity or acceptability, a backdrop linked to the dominant. In both cases, newspaper discourse recognizes and reinforces the constructed reality that some individuals and some groups conform and belong while others do not. The Othered, members of non-dominant groups, are lesser, socially inferior,

and undesirable when compared to members of the dominant group. Newspaper discourse, therefore, serves to perpetuate and normalize the Othering of non-dominant groups (Fairclough; Riggins). Rather than helping to cross boundaries or restructure them, newspaper discourse helps to fortify the boundaries between us and them, the dominant and the Other. The boundaries are reified.

Fairclough (1995b) proposed a critical discourse analysis method that analyses what is "there" in a text. This presence refers not only to an empirical presence but also to a conceptual presence. He differentiates between the degrees of presence through the use of a continuum, spanning from foregrounded to backgrounded to presupposed to absent. Foregrounded messages refer to what is empirically present and emphasized. This typically corresponds to the headlines and the first paragraphs in a newspaper article, which alert readers to the primary and focal content. Traditionally, information beyond the first paragraphs is secondary or supportive, an elaboration of the synopsis presented in the first paragraphs. Backgrounded messages refer to what is present but not emphasized. Although empirically present like foregrounded messages, backgrounded messages, unlike foregrounded messages, seldom appear in the headlines or first paragraphs, which make them seem less important. Messages may also be backgrounded by the use of adverbs and adjectives. The messages emanate from nuanced statements rather than declarative ones. Presupposed messages refer to suggested or implied, yet not empirically present, messages of which readers may or may not be consciously aware. More so than foregrounded or backgrounded messages, presupposed ones depend upon the intertextuality of meaning. These messages rely on meanings the reader mindlessly imbues into a text due to shared history in time and place and shared social schemata. For example, an article about a young boy could include two sentences: He was a good boy, and He did not cry. Although not without exception, many would automatically insert the idea that good boys do not cry. The suggested message results from intertextuality and the norms, beliefs, and values of the dominant culture. Finally, absent messages refer to excluded messages. Clearly the decision to write an article involves the selection of certain messages over other relevant, alternative messages. What is not said may be as insightful as what is said.

In this paper, critical discourse analysis reveals a pervasive Othering of the Hmong community within the camouflage of tragedy as reported by the Minneapolis *Tribune* and the St. Paul *Pioneer Press*. Critical discourse analysis is applied through a reading of newspaper articles for the identification of foregrounded, backgrounded, presupposed,

and absent messages. Next, the identified messages in each article are reviewed and assessed for patterns in the messages throughout newsprint coverage of a specified time period. The mix of messages in an article discloses the explicit and implicit means of Othering. The patterns suggest overall ideological-discursive formations of the dominant regarding the relationship between the dominant and the non-dominant.

The Text: The Event

On November 21, 2004, Minneapolis and St. Paul, Minnesota television news media, and subsequently newspaper print media on the following day, reported the afternoon deaths of five deer hunters and the hospitalization of three, additional hunters in Sawyer County, Wisconsin. The news coverage concurrently reported that Wisconsin police officers had apprehended and arrested Chai Soua Vang, 36, of St. Paul, Minnesota, in connection with shootings at about 5:15 p.m. in the evening near the border of Sawyer and Rusk counties. Allegedly, the deaths occurred after a confrontation over the use of a deer stand on private property resulted in shots fired (Harter, Pi a, & Friedrich, 2004). Vang was being held in the Sawyer County Jail awaiting charges. Members of the Sawyer County's Sheriff Department provided comments in the breaking news reports about their observations and preliminary assessments prior to formal investigations or any formal charges.

Newspaper articles in the Minneapolis *Tribune* and the St. Paul *Pioneer Press* provide the text. Articles in the *Tribune* were obtained through the ProQuest Newspapers database, while articles in the *Pioneer Press* were photocopied from actual editions. From November 22, 2004, until January 15, 2005, the two papers printed over 45 related articles and numerous letters to the editor. Although a grievous event with prolonged court proceedings, the coverage notably diminished after the first week. Therefore, the articles included in this analysis were the 32 printed during the first week after the event. Review of related articles throughout the first two months showed no noticeable deviations in content or form about Othering from those printed during the first week.

Headlines and Breaking News

Headlines and the first paragraphs of a newspaper article create the stage and for some readers the entire story. The headlines and first paragraphs clearly contain foregrounded messages. From the start, *Tribune* headlines "It just makes no sense" (Burcum & Oakes, 2004) and "He was picking them off," (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong, & Meryhew 2004) described

the event as an incomprehensible crime and identified Chai Soua Vang as the perpetrator. In the first paragraph of the first printed article, the *Tribune* quoted a deputy's unofficial characterization of the arrested man's actions. Tim Zeigle, chief deputy for Sawyer County's sheriff department, stated: "He was chasing after them and killing them" (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong, & Meryhew). Subsequent articles in the *Tribune* included "Wisconsin shootings" (Brown, 2004; Oakes, Burcum, & Meryhew, 2004; Sanchez & von Sternberg, 2004) as an ongoing headline and words such as "carnage" (Burcum & Oakes, 2004) in the text to quickly situate the readers back into the story. While the *Pioneer Press*' first article started with a more ambiguous headline, "Hunting dispute leaves five dead," (Harter & Majeski, 2004), subsequent articles included "Wisconsin Shooting Rampage" as the repeating, overarching headline (Nelson & Harter, 2004; Harter, Piña & Friedrich, 2004; Friedrich & Harter, 2004).

Obviously, multiple killings unlawfully committed by one private citizen against other private citizens threaten the security and social fabric of the community at large. Therefore, such headlines and text may appear appropriate for unspeakable and senseless crimes. However, in the rush to report on grievous events as they occur and include eyewitness testimonies or reactions from interested yet relatively uninformed parties, the media precipitate and perpetuate premature judgments. As a consequence, the media and the public assess the crime, victims, and alleged perpetrators before the legal system does. The alleged perpetrator is guilty when the news breaks.

The headlines portrayed Chai Soua Vang's actions as senseless, unprovoked, egregious, and unjustifiable. These repetitive and extreme headlines about Vang created the context in which he and the Hmong community were subsequently viewed. Horrendous crimes, when they involve members of a non-dominant group against the dominant group, provide opportune camouflage and relatively unchallenged context for the reification of ethnic Othering, in this case Othering of the Hmong population. In contrast, the hunters and by extension the ethnic whites were portrayed as unsuspecting, innocent victims. Foregrounded messages reinforced the individuality of the victims and their families. These individuals of the dominant group retained their unique identities and their unique stories.

The Participants

The headlines and articles in the *Tribune* and the *Pioneer Press* expressed the painfully tragic impact on the wounded victims and the families of the deceased and wounded (Bjorhus, 2004a; Friedrich, 2004; Nelson & Harter, 2004): "Hundreds of mourners gathered...Many wore blaze-

orange ribbons in his honor" (Marquez Estrada & Haga, 2004) and "Grief slowly unfurls" (Friedrich & Harter, 2004). Articles in both newspapers repeatedly foregrounded the shot victims, naming them and printing their stories. Initially, reporters relied on reflections from friends and community members to record the unique identity and experiences of each victim. As the following quotes exemplify, the articles often noted close relationships and minutia details of the victims. The owner of a local restaurant where one victim often stopped for lunch commented, "This is not supposed to happen to people you know" (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong & Meryhew; 2004). His relationship with the victims extended beyond the one victim. He played softball with another victim, bought a car from a third, and rode with yet another to put gas it. "It's a small town and everybody knows everybody" (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong & Meryhew). One victim's wife learned about the shootings after attending church where she had "prayed for a safe hunt" (Harter & Majeski, 2004). As the week progressed after the shootings, the articles foregrounded the effects of the shootings on family members and continued to include those on colleagues, community members, friends, and clergy.

In juxtaposition, the headlines and articles about Chai Soua Vang foregrounded him as a shooter throughout the first week. Likewise, both newspapers backgrounded descriptive information about Chai Soua Vang that accentuated his Otherness. He was described as "Hmong," (Grow, 2004) and a "naturalized citizen" (Brown, 2004). He lived in "East St. Paul" known to those familiar with St. Paul for having a large Hmong population (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong, & Meryhew; 2004) and raised a "few backyard chickens" (Brown). He also had a "violent past" (Nelson & Laszewski, 2004) given multiple police visits for domestic violence calls and was a trained "sharpshooter" (Brown) in the U. S. military. He had a self-identified "cultural wife" (Brown) and children from at least three or four women. The above adjectives describe and depict an individual with customs and activities unlike those of *typical* residents. These backgrounded messages created a presupposed text that invoked an image of Vang and other Hmong as having odd or unacceptable lifestyles and as being outsiders.

Unlike the stories about the victims and the victims' families, there was little coverage about Chai Soua Vang as a man, father, or community member. The first articles contained only a few comments by neighbors and were notably distinct from comments made by the victims' neighbors. Vang's neighbors, although quoted, knew relatively little about the man. One neighbor said that Chai Soua Vang "apparently moved in earlier this year,"

(Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong, & Meryhew, 2004) while another added, "We never had problems with them. We never heard a peep out of those guys, to be honest with you. We're floored. What would take a guy to that point" (Collins, Haga, Oakes, Xiong, & Meryhew). The presupposed and absent messages underscored Vang as an unknown individual, an outsider.

The paucity of personalized details as well as the backgrounded and presupposed messages about Chai Soua Vang contrasted with the foregrounded details and stories about the victims accentuate differences between the alleged perpetrator and the victims. These differences, when placed in the context of a violent crime, serve to create a cultural gulf and reinforce the perception that the victims represent a known and acceptable ethnic group while Chai Soua Vang does not.

When the Individual Represents the Group

Both papers pursued and reported responses from Hmong elders and the Hmong community regarding the alleged actions of Chai Soua Vang. Although the crime was an act committed by an individual, the ethnic Hmong were called to respond, a reality not similarly experienced by ethnic whites when an ethnic white individual commits a crime. Grow (2004), a *Tribune* reporter, provided a clear example of such reporting in the article "The group effect of one man's act: After shootings, stereotyping is painful for some Hmong." In the article, Grow explicitly acknowledged stereotypical reporting and labeled as such his telephone calls to Hmong leaders inquiring about the effect of one man's actions on an entire community. His decision, however, to print the responses by Hmong elders minimized and even discounted any irresponsibility he may have suggested about acting on stereotypes.

Rather than caught by surprise from media phone calls, the Hmong elders had already mobilized and prepared to issue statements on behalf of the Hmong community. As exhibited by the Hmong elders' actions, requests for the group to answer for the actions of one are not usual for an Othered group. However, one state senator, also Hmong, challenged Grow (2004) when he called for an interview by asking, "Why are you calling me?" She saw the crime as the action of one man and not thousands of Hmong Americans. She decried the ugly generalizations, labels, and stereotypes and simply stated, "We're truly Americans."

Grow (2004) compounded his Othering of the Hmong by concluding the article with the following commentary, "There are Minnesota Hmong who set aside Sundays for Viking games. Wisconsin Hmong who set aside Sundays for Packers games. Hmong who love the ritual of deer camp, just

as other Minnesotans and Wisconsinites have for generations" (Grow). This commentary reified the social structure of the dominant through presupposed messages. Acceptable activities, customs, and traditions are those of ethnic white and longer-term residents. Football and hunting are *the* traditions of import.

Outsiders Threaten Traditions

Many other articles repeated the theme of tradition violation. Articles contained numerous quotes and commentary that likened the Wisconsin deer hunting season to the Super Bowl and a fraternity. Similarly, quotes expressed depths of dismay and sadness about the effects of the deadly confrontation on a cherished tradition. Hunters "wait all year for this get-together" and it "normally would be a carefree time" (Oakes, Burcum, & Meryhew, 2004). One hunter lamented that "things will never be the same" (Niskanen, 2004). The mother in another hunting family that had previously hunted every Thanksgiving weekend stated, "Eventually I will probably be back out there. But not right now (Marquez Estrada, 2004).

Little diversity of national origin exists in Northwest Wisconsin, the location of the deer hunting tragedy. According to the 2000 census reports, Northwest Wisconsin counted less than 0.5 percent of the population as Asian, 1 percent as Latino, and 1 percent as Native American. Only one resident of Hmong descent resided in Sawyer county and none in Barron county (Bjorhus, 2004b). Nevertheless, hunters worried about future encounters between Hmong and non-Hmong hunters (Niskanen, 2004). The presupposed message is that the Hmong hunters are uninitiated in the ways of tradition and unwelcome violators of the tradition.

Conclusions

In 2004, Wisconsin sold over 640,000 deer hunting licenses, 15,374 of them to Minnesota residents (Harter & Majeski, 2004). On November 21, 2004, one hunter with one non-resident license, allegedly trespassed on private property and after a confrontation over the use of a deer stand shot dead five deer hunters and wounded three, more (Harter, Pi a, & Friedrich, 2004). Among the many conversations and interviews, one hunter, yet representative of many, stated, "Now I'm worried about someone coming up behind me with a gun...who wants to be the next guy in a tree stand if someone comes along shooting" (Anderson, 2004). While an unspeakably tragic event, the extreme statement reflects more about the perception of possible future actions by ethnic Other hunters than ethnic white hunters.

The application of critical discourse analysis and specifically

Fairclough's (1995b) method uncovers the tragedy within the tragedy; the tragedy of Othering in the newspaper coverage about the deer hunting event. Through patterns of foregrounded, backgrounded, presupposed, and absent messages, the news media reproduced the dominance of ethnic white majorities over ethnic Hmong minorities and fortified the exclusionary boundaries (Fairclough). The first week's coverage of the deer hunting tragedy on November 21, 2004, contained significant patterns of Othering. Members of the dominant group had identities, stories, and traditions. Members of the non-dominant group did not have personal stories, did not have identities separate from the group, did not have close relationships within the community, and did not have *normal* customs and traditions.

Like posted signs that caution hunters against trespassing, the newsprint media cautioned members of ethnic minorities against violating the naturalized ideologies of the dominant (Fairclough, 1995a). As relevant as the charged crimes, Chai Soua Vang allegedly "violated a sacred creed... do not tread on another person's land" (Sanchez & von Sternberg). He is not only "the other hunter" (Sanchez & von Sternberg), he is the Other.

References

- Anderson, D. (2004, November 22). Nearby hunter describes unusual day in woods. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Bjorhus, J. (2004a, November 23). Shooting deaths stun close-knit Rice Lake. *Pioneer Press*, p. 10A.
- Bjorhus, J. (2004b, November 26). Race tension in Rice Lake mostly subtle. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 6A.
- Brown, C. (2004, November 23). Suspect's neighbors are stunned: But police records sow some evidence of domestic violence. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Burcum, J., & Oakes, L. (2004, November 23). "It just makes no sense": 6th hunter dies as Wisconsin officials struggle with events. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Collins, T., Haga, C., Oakes, L., Xiong, C., & Meryhew, R. (2004, November 22). Wisconsin shootings kill 5: 3 others are injured after what officials call a clash over access to hunting land. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and power*. London: Longman
- Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and social change*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1995a). *Critical discourse analysis: The critical study of language*. New York: Longman.

- Fairclough, N. (1995b). *Media discourse*. London: Edward Arnold.
- Foucault, M. (1972). *Archeology of knowledge*. London: Tavistock.
- Foucault, M. (1984). The order of discourse. In M. Shapiro (Ed.), *Language and politics* (pp. 108-138). London: Basil Blackwell.
- Friedrich, A. (2004, November 25). Four funerals — and one priest. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 12A.
- Friedrich, A., & Harter, K. (2004, November 27). Grief slowly unfurls. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 10A-11A.
- Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks of Antonio Gramsci* (Q. Hoare & G. N. Smith, Eds. & Trans.). New York: International Publishers.
- Grow, D. (2004, November 23). The group effect of one man's act: After shootings, stereotyping is painful for some Hmong. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Harter, K., & Majeski, T. (2004, November 22). Hunting dispute leaves five dead. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 6A.
- Harter, K., Pi a, P., & Friedrich, A. (2004, November 24). Vang: Hunter shot first. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 7A.
- Kennedy, T., & McEnroe, P. (2005a, February 9). Tou Cha parts ways with police: He leave the St. Paul force after guilty plea in gun case. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved February 17, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Kennedy, T., & McEnroe, P. (2005b, February 10). FBI is told of \$75,000 bribe figure: Kelly aide denies allegation concerning funeral home. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved February 17, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Marquez Estrada, H. (2004, November 26). This hunt was hard: The Roppe family spends every Thanksgiving hunting in the Wisconsin woods. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Marquez Estrada, H., & Haga, C. (2004, November 27). First of 6 slain hunters is buried: Hundreds of mourners gathered for Mark Roidt's funeral. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Nelson, T. (2005, January 10). Hmong resettlement slows. *Pioneer Press*, p. 1A, 10A.
- Nelson, T., & Harter, K. (2004, November 23). Sixth shot hunter dies. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 8A.
- Nelson, T., & Laszewski, C., (2004, November 23). Suspect's alleged actions at odds with reputation. *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 9A.
- Niskanen, C. (2004, November 28). 'It's just not the same.' *Pioneer Press*, pp. 1A, 3A.

- Oakes, L., Burcum, J., & Meryhew, R. (2004, November 25). The aftermath: Some still hunting, but on high alert. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Pfeifer, M.E. Nationally aggregated Hmong data: US census 2000. Hmong Cultural Center. Retrieved January 15, 2005 from www.hmongcenter.org/hmoncenin.html.
- Riggins, S. T. (1997). The rhetoric of Othering. In S. T. Riggins (Ed.), *The language and politics of exclusion* (pp. 1-30). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Rosario, R. (2004, November 26). Accused hunter's trial a natural for venue change. *Pioneer Press*, 1B, 6B.
- Sanchez, R., & von Sternberg, B. (2004, November, 28). Tracing two paths to tragedy: A shared passion for hunting wasn't enough common ground in the Wisconsin woods. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved January 14, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1993) *Elite discourse and racism*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Van Dijk, T. A. (1998). *Ideology*. London: Sage.
- Wodak, R. (1999). Critical discourse analysis at the end of the 20th century. *Research on Language & Social Interaction*, 32(1), 185-194.
- Wolfe, W. (2005, February 10). Moua may lose license for health agency: State senator hasn't paid fines for deficiencies. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved February 17, 2005, from <http://proquest.umi.com>.

Engaging Communication in Community

Christa Brown

Instructor

Lynn Kuechle

Graduate Teaching Assistant

Department of Speech Communication

Minnesota State University, Mankato

Mankato, MN

christa.brown@mnsu.edu

lynn.kuechle@mnsu.edu

Abstract

This activity in service learning is intended for the basic communication course or public speaking course. As communication instructors, we see service learning and communication as a natural pairing. This activity will allow students to learn about the importance of service to the community while at the same time applying what they have learned in class in regards to communication. Students will research an organization in the community, report on the mission of the organization, how volunteers play a role in meeting that mission, the clientele the organization serves, how the organization meets their needs, and the various communication dynamics present in the organization. This is a two-part project with written and oral presentation components intended for group presentations and research.

Introduction

Service learning is defined as...“a structured program of community service combined with deliberate reflection and critical analysis” (Lieberman & Connolly, 1992). Communication scholars such as Sellnow and Oster (1997), Quintanilla and Wahl (2005), stress the importance of incorporating the component of service learning into communication courses. Benefits of service learning for students include possible career connections, sense of purpose, sense of social responsibility, regard for cultural differences, enjoyable experience, career or vocational clarification, and integration of theory with practice (Oster, Sellnow, Nelson & Pearson, 2004). When teaching introductory level communication courses it can be difficult to incorporate service learning techniques simple enough to use.

We created this assignment which offers students experience and exposure to service organizations and the community. The assignment is two-part and contains both written and oral presentation components intended for group presentations and research.

Objectives of the Activity

Students are required to

- 1) Conduct research about an organization in their own community
- 2) Demonstrate knowledge of the inner workings of the organization
- 3) Investigate how the organization's mission impacts the people they serve
- 4) Contribute time and talent to a local organization
- 5) Identify various communication dynamics within the organization
- 6) Present their findings in both written and oral formats

Instructor Preparation

The preparation by the instructor for this activity is essential, both for the non profit organizations and the students involved. Prior to creating the course calendar the instructor will need to contact several non profit or volunteer organizations in the area. Organizations to consider might include Habitat for Humanity, the United Way, area libraries, The Humane Society, The Salvation Army, The American Red Cross, and various organizations that cater to the elderly or disabled. It is important to find the person in charge of scheduling volunteers and speak directly with them. The contact person should be asked if the organization would be able to accommodate 4-6 students, on a scheduled day and time, to perform volunteer services for the organization. It is important to keep in mind that this project is intended to benefit the organization, not for the organization to create a project to fill the assignment. Not all organizations have a need appropriate for this project. The project days need to be included on the course calendar, available to the students at the beginning of the semester. This project should be presented to the students with an explanation of the types of organizations that are available along with a description of the activities they will be involved in doing. It is important to give students as much information up front so they can select the organization they are most interested in and decrease the amount of uncertainty they might feel about volunteering. It might also be necessary to include information on professional behavior, professional dress, group dynamics, audience analysis, and other relevant topics depending on the organization (Quintanilla & Wahl, 2005).

Assignment

- 1) Students select an organization for their project. Students should choose an organization from those presented in class by the instructor or choose their own with permission from the instructor. Students will conduct a research project working in groups of 4-6 students and will research the organization of choice. Topic areas to consider might be the organization's budget, clientele, mission, history, volunteer information, community outreach, accomplishments, etc. By conducting this research, students will gain an understanding of the structure of the organization, how the organization carries out their mission, and how the volunteer contributions will affect the organization. Each group will submit a 3-4 page paper about their findings. Class time will be given to visit the organization, conduct interviews, and conduct research. The research paper portion of the assignment is worth 30 points and is graded on the content and organization of information in the paper as well as basic grammar.
- 2) When part one is completed, students will work with the organization they researched and provide 2-4 hours of volunteer service. A summary of their volunteer activities including a personal impact statement will be presented to the class in an oral presentation along with a brief overview of their initial research project. This presentation should provide the class with an introspective view of the organization and explain what a volunteer experience with the organization is like. The speech will be an 18-20 minute group presentation with a point value of 50 points.

Assessment Tools

Upon completion, the organization will evaluate the students overall performance and indicate whether or not they would invite this group back in the future. A sample evaluation form is included (see below). This evaluation form from the organization is worth 10 points of the student's final grade for the project.

Students will be graded on three parts of the assignment. The first part is the research paper component of the project. The second part is their oral presentation of the volunteer experience and the inner-workings of the organization they chose. The third part is the evaluation from the organization on their performance as a volunteer. Finally, students will be given a formal evaluation form to assess the experience and the organization

they researched and volunteered for. A sample student evaluation form is included (see below). This final component of the grade will be worth 10 points for a total point value of 100 points for the service learning project.

Organization Evaluation Form

Service Learning Project Evaluation Form

Group Members: _____

Organization: _____

Instructor: _____

Thank you for allowing the students listed above to conduct volunteer hours with your organization recently. Please take a few moments to evaluate these students based on their performance and communication skills. Feel free to comment on any of the individual group members as well. Use the back of the form if necessary.

1. Were the group members willing to learn about the organization and assigned tasks? Yes No

Explanation if necessary _____

2. Did the group members show concern and caring for the organization and the clients? Yes No

Explanation if necessary _____

3. Were the group members professional and enthusiastic in their communication with the organization and clients? Yes No

Explanation if necessary _____

4. Did the group members perform the tasks as they were told? Yes _No

Explanation if necessary _____

5. Did the group members demonstrate responsibility by being prompt, efficient, completing hours, etc.? Yes No

Explanation if necessary _____

6. Would your organization welcome this group back? Yes No

Explanation if necessary _____

Please return this evaluation sheet in the self-addressed, stamped envelope as soon as possible as there is a component of the student grade based on your evaluation of their performance at your organization. Please feel free to contact me with any questions or concerns. Thanks again!

Christa Brown

Lynn Kuechle

Department of Speech Communication

Minnesota State University, Mankato

Mankato, MN

christa.brown@mnsu.edu

lynn.kuechle@mnsu.edu

(507)389-2213

Service Learning Project Student Evaluation Form

Your Name: _____

Group Members: _____

Organization: _____

Hours Contributed: _____

Please take a few moments to reflect on your recent service learning group project experience and answer the following questions the best you can. This evaluation form is worth 10 points of your final grade for this project. Be as honest as possible about your experience. Please use the back of this form if you need more space.

1. Did all group members contribute equally to the project? If not, how did the members differ in their tasks and responsibilities? _____

2. Were the staff at the organization helpful and knowledgeable?

3. Did the classroom discussions help in your expectation of what you would be doing at the organization? Why or why not? _____

4. Did you feel your efforts were appreciated by the organization? _____

5. Did you feel the service learning project was related to the content in class (lectures, readings, and discussions)? Why or why not? _____

6. Did your service learning experience help you understand the course content better? Why or why not? _____

7. What was the most valuable part of your service learning experience?

8. What could be done to improve this project? _____

References

- Lieberman, T.M., & Connolly, K. (1992). *Education and Action: A Guide to Integrating Classrooms and Communities*. United States of America: Campus Outreach Opportunity League.
- Quintanilla, K. M. & Wahl, S. T. (2005). Incorporating Service Learning into Communication Courses: Benefits, Guidelines, and Challenges. *Texas Speech Communication Journal*, 30, 67-97.
- Oster, L. K., Sellnow, T.S., Nelson, P.E., & Pearson, J. C. (2004). The Status of Service Learning in Departments of Communication: A Follow-Up Study. *Communication Education*, 53, pp. 348-356.
- Sellnow, T. S., & Oster, L. K. (1997). The Frequency, Form, and Perceived Benefits of Service Learning in Speech Communication Departments. *Journal of the Association for Communication Administration*, 26, 190-197.

An Exercise in the Creative Process for High School Theatre Design Students

Dan Dimond

*Resident Designer, Theatre School Faculty
Academy of Holy Angels
Richfield, MN 55423
ddimond@ahastars.org*

Abstract

The article discusses a classroom exercise designed to help students recognize and develop their personal process of creation. The students research to gather images and information to design costumes for a limited number of fairy tale characters in a given story. Emphasis is given to developing multiple ideas to be presented in a mock director-designer production meeting. Process rather than any particular end product is the key point of the exercise. The student is challenged to participate in a free flowing conversation, backed by research, to evolve and grow a synthesis of ideas at a realistic meeting of theatre artists. In practice, it engages students in a stimulating, provocative way.

Do not worry if you have built your castles in the air. They are where they should be. Now put the foundations under them.

Henry David Thoreau

Introduction

The theatrical experience is a collaboration of all of the arts with the sole purpose of conveying a story. In its simplest form, one person would meet face to face with another and tell a story. Large sets, colored lights, or elaborate costumes are actually not necessary for this very human event to happen. Considerable care needs to be given if you decide to use any of theatre's collaborative arts to enhance the story. Each design decision must be made with the consideration towards advancing and not detracting from the story.

Design in the theatre is essentially a process of creating a believable world to advance the story. Notice the word "realistic" has not been used here. It is not necessary to create a strict sense of realism, but rather an environment true and consistent with how the world of the story operates. Realism is a choice, but not the only choice. In the creation of worlds, rabbits talk and need infinitely long holes to jump down.

If the story takes place on Mars, we need to create a place aligned to the basic truths we conceive this world to possess. It may mean the people are made out of rocks, the lighting is red in tone, and the characters wear candy wrappers as clothing. We define the logic of the land and adhere to its "rules." An audience will accept many things as long as consistency is maintained.

Accomplishing this concept with high school students is challenging. The creative process remains a mysterious thing for the secondary student. If asked, most will reply how uncreative, non-artistic they are. They cannot dance, draw, or do anything even remotely considered artistic. And yet, if given the scenario of coming home late for curfew and facing angered parents, imagination is released. Whole, intricate stories are instantly fashioned with surprising and a bit scary ease. Yet by the time students reach high school, they are, unfortunately very isolated from their own creativity.

By contrast, most preschool and early primary students know the power of the creative process. When asked to draw, paint, sing, or dance, they jump at the chance. These children proceed with an uninhibited joy and courage often missing in secondary students. Average high school students are reluctant to expose themselves to their peers in this manner. They plead incompetence based partially on an anxiety about their potential skills, but based more on peer acceptance.

High school students' creative potential according to Kate Gibney (1998, p. 19) requires an element of courage. It is a risk for adolescents to expose their artistic attempts for public display both to others and themselves. Julia Cameron (1992, p. 121) describes the risk as the "probable pain of self-exposure." She discusses how we must allow ourselves to exceed the point of "assured success." There is safety in sitting within our comfort zone. There is also growth in pushing our knowledge and abilities according to Robert Marzano (1997, p. 285) and his *Fifth Dimension of Learning*. Belief and trust in their own inner vision needs to be nurtured so that their method can emerge and be known. To help instill this belief and trust, O'Connor's thoughts on the process are helpful. The creative process is an act of re-balancing, that is, moving back to the mid-point of human progression. Removing the shackles of absolute proof for every statement. To blend the possibilities arising from every statement. To be freed from the fear of ridicule. To be at one with the possibilities, that arises freely within oneself, and from there, to apply, in its proper time, the value of directed thinking. (O'Connor, 1996, p. 4)

The creative process is not a neat and organized package aligned along traditional teaching methods. Instead, it is usually loud, sloppy, involving pupils in a student, rather than teacher centered learning environment. "It means a

tolerance for ambiguity where ambiguity exists. It means the ability to receive much conflicting information without forcing closure upon the situation. (Rogers, 1989, p. 353-354)" A teacher needs to stimulate the thought and decision making of a student, not work towards any given single definitive answer.

The trick is to bend the instructional environment toward insight without becoming formulaic. Step-by-step approaches to discovery, forced or routine brainstorming and hypothesis making, and relentlessly linear Socratic questioning are unlikely to generate the spark of new understanding. Only a genuine atmosphere of inquiry will allow students to relax sufficiently to think adventurously and to take risks that lead to an authentic "Aha!" experience. (Suhor, 1999, p. 16)

It is a personal and intimate process. There is a temptation for a teacher to give answers instead of allowing the student's process to unfold in a way most conducive for each person. The individual must take ownership of the concept. Awareness can not be handed to the student. This is accomplished when students attach meaning to the connections revealed in their individual journeys.

Most importantly, an environment needs to be in place where the possibility of failure is not a hindrance. Not succeeding needs to be thought of as a natural positive step in the creative process. Each step contributes both working and non-working aspects. Oddly enough, it is the glitches that teach the most about how to get to the desired end product. Through trial and error, creative judgment is used and fostered.

This aspect is true for both the student and the teacher. It is paramount to realize that "perhaps the fundamental condition of creativity is that the source or locus of evaluative judgment is internal." (Rogers, 1989, p. 354) It is the students and the teacher who need to become adept at judging themselves within the process. "The growth process of connecting with all that we are capable of being resumes when we stop limiting ourselves and unlock some of the energy used to do the limiting." (Keyes, 1983, p. 80) It is honing one's ability to make decisions, developing a sense of artistic judgment. We need to educate the very real, creative process in a personal way. With the emphasis on educating our verbal abilities, we have not tapped our skills at handling our powerful visual language. It is the teacher's job to help discover a way to the students' path. Because students are uncertain of their own creativity, it is here they need the most careful and gentle nudge towards finding creative cognitive skills.

Application

An exercise from a theatrical design class, taught at the secondary

level, illustrates one method to help students begin to develop a better awareness to their own design process. This particular instance deals with costume design, but with slight modifications, it can be adapted to any of the theatre's collaborative arts. Appendix A is an example of a hand out given to students for this exercise.

The exercise has students, as costume designers, prepare for a first meeting to design a given story with the teacher acting as the director. This activity places students into the beginnings of the design process. It emulates the necessary interaction of an artistic staff in a simulated theatrical production situation. At this juncture, the major emphasis is on gathering the raw materials to stimulate thinking, as opposed to preparing a fully realized design. Students should be encouraged to look for a wide range of options and possibilities. They should keep in mind these initial ideas will change and morph many times before an end product emerges.

The story chosen should be a familiar one so the students have a comfortable working knowledge with it. Fairy tales generally work well. In this particular case, *Little Red Riding Hood* was used. As a first step, the whole class, as group, agrees upon the characters so everyone is working from the same baseline. For this particular example, it was decided to focus on the four main characters of the tale. The characters chosen to costume were Little Red Riding Hood, the Big Bad Wolf, Grandmother, and the Hunter.

In order to help guide past a traditional, stereotypical view of the characters' costumes, each student was required to pick a particular time period or culture for the characters to inhabit. Working with cultures and different time periods, from the ancient Greeks to the modern day Australian Aborigines to eighteenth century Japan, help to reshape preconceived notions of how to present the story. A list of possibilities was generated by the teacher while some students wanted to determine this aspect for themselves. The key is to challenge the obvious, make the student rethink the story in new, interesting terms through the lens of another mindset. The design, then unfolds according to the logic of the society or time chosen.

Next, the students sought information to help define of the world which *Little Red Riding Hood* will inhabit. The particulars of the selected culture or time need to be understood so there is a consistent and believable basis for the each character's design. The question to answer is, "What makes this world the particular flavor it is?" This portion of the project provides an opportunity to use local resources for in-depth research. A broad approach needs to be emphasized to the students. Multiple sources ought to be used, a combination of printed material and electronic data help give a larger, more comprehensive picture. Do not forget the wealth of information from interviews with the

people in the students' lives. Closets and personal memories can give flavor to a time period with more verve than any other source.

Encourage interaction between both students themselves and others outside of the classroom. Help them avoid the tendency to create in a vacuum. Ideas need to be brought out into the open for review and evaluation. Brainstorming techniques are helpful but be aware of eliminating ideas too early. The practicality of the how to accomplish the ideas is secondary at this point to the gathering of possibilities. Do not let students settle for just one idea, but ensure they continue to develop several possibilities.

As the students gather information and images, they need help to tie all of it together in a meaningful way. Teacher directed conversations guide the student through the concept of unifying themes or metaphors. What visual clues can the designer give the audience as to relationships, status, place, or times to unite this particular production? What elements make this world of *Little Red Riding Hood* believable? What can be the unifying motif? Nudge the students into asking questions of themselves to clarify and sift through the all of the information their research produces.

The next phase is to present the ideas to the teacher, acting as a director. This part is done with the remaining class as observers, not active participants. The dynamics of the conversation are easily side-tracked if the student designer has to deal with non-relevant questions or comments. There is also value observing in passively because it gives a fresh look at the different ways of handling the same technical and artistic issues. The presentation is essentially an informal talk with another artist stepping through the design process together. The approach needs to be done with an open mind, receptive to possibilities, but not with an empty mind. Ideas, thoughts, and images are brought to the table as possibilities, not as definitive solutions. The students need to be prepared to actively engage and respond to relationships by connecting with their own ideas. It becomes a merging of creative energies.

The exchange can take many forms. The ability to draw can be helpful but is not the only means for the presentation of the visuals. Images from the research can be used as they are found, as collages, or piece-meal to show each character's specific design elements. Fabric samples give good tactile information. Let the students devise a manner to best exhibit the concepts in accordance with their abilities.

Results

The exercise results in class time spent in a dynamic, interactive exchange. With guidance from the teacher as director, students experience

a practical creative environment where the expression and subsequent synthesis of ideas evolve into something greater than the individuals could have produced by themselves. The model it presents is a strong affirmation of life as a continuing learning opportunity. It can serve both the student and the teacher as an enriching engagement in human contact and growth.

There are several points at which the teacher may need to intervene to help head off problematic possibilities. Most students tend to be concerned with arriving at a single solution much less generating a host of ideas. The fear, particularly at the beginning of this exercise, is students feel they lack the creative resources to produce any acceptable outcome. Here the process needs to be emphasized over any final results. If the process is in order, the end product will take care of itself. This thought is a difficult concept to accept, especially because of the creative isolation they have experienced for most of their teenage years.

Even though students tend to be highly resistant, the issue can be addressed and overcome. Continuously remind them at any given point in the process, there will be questions and unknowns. Answers will not always be immediately present. This condition is a call for more reflective thought, interaction with others, or more digging into research for ideas. Break the isolation. Encourage students to recognize additional connections in the wealth of information available outside of themselves.

Literalism can be daunting to the young designer. At the high school level, the students often are stubbornly literal; a door is a door- nothing more, nothing less. It means a very specific thing, one thing and only one thing. The object has become more symbolic than actual. Because of the overwhelming amount of visual information received at any given time, most of the images we retain are, by necessity, symbolic in nature. They are mental shortcuts to aid in retention. The mind stubbornly clings to the abbreviated versions.

Challenge this type of thinking with a more expansive view. What does a door do that makes it a door? How can that quality be expressed with different materials or items? Does it even need to be physical? The key question is "What if?" If you get students to question their literalism, it leads to a cognitive shift opening up possibilities.

Another issue to watch for may be found in the research phase. Students tend to rely on a single source and depend on whatever information turns up immediately. If using an internet search engine, such as Google, they will use the first couple hits and consider it sufficient. Emphasis needs to be given to in-depth research in the print, electronic media, and personal interviews. They need to probe for information. Again, the first information gathered is just a jumping off point for more information, more depth,

more connections.

There will also be those students who push the other end of the research spectrum, finding so much information it will impossible to digest. Teacher intervention can help direct students to a balance between too little and too much. Helpful limiting factors are time and applicability to the assignment.

As organic as learning is, there will always be more and different dips and bends in learning's path. The teacher needs to stand ready to model this process as an energetic, responsive method of understanding.

Conclusion

Teachers are hard pressed to provide curriculum for such a diverse subject as theatre arts requires. Indeed, the teacher may be challenged to cover any more than the barest of the basics. The underlying essential lesson of this project is to expose students to their own unique process of creation. If their abilities can be developed to derive the answers to artistic challenges using an enquiry process, as opposed to a content specific one, it serves the student in not only the theatre arts, but in other areas of their lives as well. In other words, it is a way of knowing rather than knowing a way.

We, as teachers, may be uncertain of our own abilities in all aspects of the theatrical arts. We are subject to the same forces of the creative process as our students. We need to be brave enough not to have all the answers, but much more importantly, be unafraid enough to subject ourselves to the same process as we do our students. Trust in the process. It can give new and evolving understanding to what we do as teachers, artists, and human beings.

References

- Cameron, J. (1992). *The artist's way: A spiritual path to higher creativity*. New York: Putnam Books.
- Gibney, K. (1998). *Awakening creativity*. ASEE Prism, 7, 18-23.
- Ingham, R. (1998). *From page to stage*. Portsmouth, NH: Heiemann.
- Keyes, M. F. (1983). *Inward journey: Art as therapy*. La Salle, Ill.:Open Court Publishing Company.
- Marzano, R. J., & Pickering, D. J. (1997). *Dimensions of learning: Teacher's manual*. Alexandria, Va: ASCD Publications.
- O'Connor, B. (1996). The spiritual journey of the corporate warrior. *Psychology and the Business World*. Retrieved August 15, 1999 from the World Wide Web: www.cjung.com/articles/oconnor.html.
- Rogers, C. R. (1989). *On becoming a person*. New York: Houghton Mifflin.
- Suhor, C. (1999). Spirituality — letting it grow in the classroom. *Educational Leadership* 56, 12-16.

Appendix A

Class Handout Stage Design Costume Design Project Little Red Riding Hood

Using the four characters for Little Red Riding Hood, create a design for each character. Each design must be historically based. Variation can be made but the costume must be based on an image you have found in your research. Remember, every period has large variety in clothing. How can you use this fact to enhance the story?

You must have an overall design concept, unifying metaphor for a production of the fairy tale.

The characters are 1) Little Red Riding Hood, 2) Big Bad Wolf, 3) Grandmother, and 4) the Hunter. You will be assigned a time period or culture to which all designs must conform.

Each character must have:

- At least one (1) complete set of clothing with at least one alternative — including shirt, pants, dress, footwear, as needed. If there is a reason to add costume pieces or to change a costume completely, justify your choice.

- Accessories purses, jewelry, belts, etc. Details make the character more believable.

- Images from a variety of resources to demonstrate design elements.

- Design Image — what are some choices for each character's looks.

- Explanation of concepts for each character. Colors, relationships, and the way the look fits into the character and into the overall show.

Be prepared to participate as the designer in a preproduction meeting with a director. The teacher acting as the director will actively respond to your thoughts and ideas of possible design solutions.

The discussion needs to be supplemented with images, sketches, or however you feel you can best present the visual images for all of the characters. This exercise takes about ten minutes. At the end of the conversation, please turn in all materials used in presentation.

Take a breath. Good luck, and most importantly, have fun.

Speech Buddy Assignment x 3

Louisa A. Eckert

Instructor

Speech Communication Department

Minnesota State University, Mankato

louisa.eckert@mnsu.edu

Abstract

The speech buddy assignment engages students in practice, discussion and reflection in relation to public speaking in a college setting. Students often admit failing to practice and end up giving lackluster speeches. This collaborative assignment requires students to practice their speech three times, in front of three different speech buddies of their choice. Students develop skills in tweaking of speeches, listening to speech buddies comments and suggestions and further, engaging in dialogue (probing) speech buddies concerning speech patterns, topic narrowing, clarity and physical and vocal delivery behaviors. Students must submit a rubric, bibliography, outline and speech buddy worksheets (x 3) before their speech. If previous speech buddies deem inappropriate students are instructed to seek alternate buddies for more effective feedback for their next speaking assignment.

After teaching public speaking for several years I noticed students admitting to lack of preparation and procrastination in regard to delivering speeches. Because of this tendency many students were not progressing and confidence was mediocre. To promote practice and poise I developed a required speech buddy assignment. Each student is required to purchase a speech activity packet at the beginning of the semester. Packets include in/out of class activities and assignments, rubrics and speech buddy worksheets.

Before each speech students are required to seek out three different accessible people (speech buddies) they trust that will take the time to listen and time their speeches. Speech buddies are required fill out the worksheet with detailed comments and suggestions. Students are encouraged to probe speech buddies in response to questions or concerns they have about speech writing and delivery. The speech buddy assignment also assists with timing the speaker, which is often a cause of concern. After the speech is delivered the speech buddy gives detailed oral and written

feedback, dates and finally signs off on the document. Three signed speech buddy worksheets must be attached to the rubric, bibliography and outline that are required prior to their formal, videotaped speech. All documents are stapled together with the grading rubric as cover page. Students seek out speech buddies in public speaking class or may use friends, relatives, roommates or even the instructor (with appointment).

Speech grades are negatively affected if students fail to have all three signed and timed speech buddy worksheets attached to their rubric. Instructors identify writing, signatures and comments to ensure speech buddies are not fictional. After the first speech is delivered students are instructed to evaluate the buddies by analyzing creative suggestions, listening ability and recommendations of improvements through reinforcement of strengths and weaknesses. After analysis students are required to seek alternate speech buddies (if necessary) so their next round of practice sessions can be more beneficial. Changing speech buddies is deemed important if the student assessments reveal they did not receive enough feedback, if the speech buddy did not appear to take the practice session seriously or if they failed to listen and rushed the speaker.

Appropriate use of time is crucial when working with the speech buddy assignment. Taking time with this process allows for comprehensive practice and feedback sessions. Instructor recommends students to engage in thanking each speech buddy they employ. Students are encouraged to take the time and effort to describe how feedback provided helped deliver a good speech. Some students have even shared their videotaped speeches with speech buddies to show the final product, their confidence level and/or how they used the advice they were given to structure or strengthen their final presentation.

This assignment is extremely beneficial in helping student understanding of the need to practice, narrow topics, focus ideas, self-disclose, use appropriate visual aids, have a realistic concept of timing, determine proper use of language, eliminate filler words and understand distracting delivery behaviors. Confidence levels were on the rise and speeches improved after application of this required assignment. One student commented "Lou, this speech buddy thing is the best thing since sliced bread. I've got my speech down pat. Thanks. I can't wait to deliver my speech to our class!"

Attached is an example of the speech buddy worksheet. Seeing ourselves through the eyes of another (Cooley, 1912) helps learning. The theory of reflected appraisal exposes how individuals gain a sense of self in much the same way as looking into a mirror and seeing personal

reflections and individual behaviors. Speech buddies also benefit indirectly from participating with this assignment. They critically analyze speeches through effective listening. They also engage in creative invention when they can provide suggestions for visual aids, attention getting introductions and use of effective language. Watching others speak helps understand that speaking with confidence is important and how they themselves can apply the advice they are providing.

Students need to feel comfortable with each of their speech buddies ability to take time to listen and then engage in serious, honest discourse. Both participants' communication skills are strengthened through this application exercise. Data collected from students at my college found overwhelming approval of the speech buddy assignment because it discourages procrastination, forces three practice sessions with three different appraisers and encourages improvement through listening and supportive feedback provided which in turn, develops and heightens public speaking confidence and ability.

Speech Buddy Portfolio Assignment

Name _____

For each video-taped speech obtain 3 reliable speech buddies. A speech buddy is defined as a person who is willing to listen to your speech and give you supportive advice. The best way to apply the speech buddy system is to obtain three different speech buddies, giving your speech to your first buddy, and then applying their suggestions and after revising the speech using your input from this first speech buddy, move on to the second SB. After you give your second practice session to SB #2 then tweak with the helpful tips they give and finally forge ahead and give your final practice round to SB #3. Make sure to allow enough time to analyze the feedback you receive from all speech buddies and do your final practice round in the mirror or in the car or in front of one of your speech buddies.

The following framework is developed for your speech buddy to follow. Each SB needs to fill out this worksheet in detail, and sign their name at the bottom of the page. Insert into portfolio under each speech category.

1. Discuss the content of the speech. This includes topic choice, organization, intended purpose (do they stay focused) and clarity. What was difficult to follow or understand? What did you like?

Do you think they related to their audience?

2. Discuss the nonverbal behavior of the speaker. Did they pace, sway, tuck hair, or read too much? If they are reading tell them you want them to look at you more often. Do they use fillers (um, like, alright) have vocal inflection, does their voice convey excitement or concern about their topic? What about facial expression, are they smiling when appropriate?
3. Give additional advice here, things you can suggest for a more effective attention-getter, conclusion, theme, use of language etc...

Time _____

Signed _____

Reference

Cooley, C. H. (1912). *Human Nature and the Social Order*. New York: Scribner's.

The Application Interview: Engaging Education Majors in Communication Course Material

Karin-Leigh Spice

Associate Professor

Department of Communication

Wright State University

Dayton, Ohio 45435

karin-leigh.spicer@wright.edu

Abstract

Students like classroom experiences in which they can actively participate as well as see the applicable nature of the material they are learning. This paper describes an application interview education majors participate in and highlights student comments concerning the usefulness of the interview.

Research has established successful teachers have good classroom communication skills (Johnson & Roellke, 1999; Meister & Melnick, 2003; Newton & Newton, 2001). Communication and education professions have stressed the importance of future teachers' understanding those skills (Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium, 1992; National Communication Association, 1988). So how can education majors start to see the importance of using good communication skills in the classroom? Interviewing classroom teachers about their communication skills and applying it to course material can demonstrate this importance.

Today's instructors are using classroom activities that encourage students to be active participants in the learning process (Sax, Astin & Arredondo, 1996). One such participatory activity-interviewing-can make any discipline come alive encouraging students to take an active role in their class learning (Berko, 1993; Ellis, 1991; Renz, 1992; Sharp, 1994). Interviewing activities afford students the opportunity to compare classroom theoretical concepts to outside experiences, demonstrating the relevance of course material (Hale, 1995; Sears, 1990).

Research has already established interviewing activities help to develop students' listening and speaking skills (Ekhaml, 1998; Steil, Braker & Watson, 1983). Students learn how their opinions differ and what opinions they share with those they interview (Rogovin, 1998).

Providing professional expertise and experiences to students is important. Interviewing allows students to ask work-focused questions (challenges individual duties) (Garrett, 1988; Hoecherl, 1985), task-focused (outcomes expected to produce) (Bowers, 1993) or function-focused (jobs) (Harding, 1995; Isbell, 1993; McElhinney, 1994; Sharp, 1994). Students can use interviews as background research to acquire, assess, and communicate information (Hale, 1995; Sears, 1990; Susskind, 1978).

Purpose of Paper

The purpose of this paper is two-fold. First, it will describe an application interview activity in which students in the course *Communication for Teachers* participate. Instructors believed this type of assignment would achieve two goals. First, the activity provided students with the opportunity to discuss the use of communication skills in the classroom with elementary/secondary teachers. Second, the activity provided students the opportunity to apply material students gathered in the interview to the material that was discussed in class. Instructors hoped this activity would reinforce the importance of using good communication skills in the classroom. Finally, the paper highlights student comments concerning the usefulness of the application interview.

Description of the Application Interview

Each student is assigned to interview one teacher in elementary or secondary education. Students contact prospective interviewees and explain they would like to conduct an informational interview to learn about the teacher's uses of communication in the classroom. Students typically interview family members, friends, favorite former teachers, teachers working in the grade levels students are interested in, or teachers from area school systems in which they are interested in teaching. The interview typically runs one hour. If a personal interview is not feasible, interviews may also be conducted by telephone. If the teacher gives permission the interviews may be audio taped and/or the student take notes. The following questions concerning communication issues discussed in class are included in the interview:

1. What is the teacher's definition of communication?
2. What is the teacher's greatest and weakest communication skill?
3. In what area of communication training does the teacher wish he/she would have been better prepared?
4. What type of activities does the teacher do with her/his students to improve their speaking skills?

5. Overall, does the teacher feel his/her students are good listeners? Does the teacher do listening activities with his/her students to improve their skills? If yes, what types?
 6. What types of issues does the teacher usually address in a letter/E-mail to a parent(s)?
 7. How does the teacher help "quiet" children feel comfortable speaking in class?
 8. How does the teacher arrange students' desks in her/his classroom? Does s/he change the arrangement for a particular activity (e.g. reading, spelling, storytelling)?
 9. How does the teacher set up parent/teacher conferences to make parents feel comfortable communicating?
 10. Two additional communication questions of the student's choosing.
- Students are encouraged to ask open-ended questions about class communication issues that have sparked their own particular interest. Issues students may never have considered before studying communication. For example, students have asked questions concerning the uses of technology in the classroom, parent/teacher conflict, communicating with children who have special needs, if the use of color in the classroom encourages or inhibits student communication, and if they send newsletters to parents to keep them informed of classroom activities.

Students are encouraged to ask the interviewee to clarify a specific point, give an example or go into more detail. For example, if a teacher talks about his/her concerns about parent/teacher conferences the student may ask for an example of that concern. If a teacher states that nonverbal communication is important in the classroom, the student may ask for examples of the types of nonverbal communication the teacher encounters/utilizes most often

The activity is assigned and discussed in the first week of class. Detailed instructions are also listed in the class syllabus. Discussions include an overview of interviewing skills and students are referred to *Interviewing Principles and Practices* (Stewart & Cash, 2002) for more information. The completed assignment is due in the eighth week of class (10-week quarter) and is worth 20 percent of the student's total grade. Each student is required to give their interviewee a survey (Appendix A) to assess the student's communication abilities. Interviewees are asked to complete the survey and return it to the instructor. After the instructor has read the survey the survey is given to the student. A concise, businesslike thank-you note is a requirement. The thank-you note is to be sent within 48 hours after the completion of the interview.

Debriefing

Once the interview has been completed students write a paper analyzing the responses gathered during the interview. These criteria (see Appendix B for rubric) apply to the paper analyzing the interview:

1. Clarity of purpose.
2. A review of questions and answers.
3. Application of ideas expressed by the teacher to class material.

Two levels of Bloom's taxonomy are utilized (1956). First, application of material, the third level in the taxonomy, requiring students to take generalizations of principles from an abstract situation and make a concrete case. For example, students are to take the teachers' responses and make direct links to the terms and concepts discussed in class. If teachers talk about how students perceive them in the role of teacher/role model, students can make a direct link to material discussed in class on perceptions and student motivations. Second, analyze, the fourth level in the taxonomy, requiring students to breakdown the material into its constituent parts. This analytical skill is achieved through classifying the elements, and recognizing the organization of the subject in terms of its structure. For example, students examine the teacher's definition of communication. Does the teacher use the same terms, define the same ideas as the communication definition presented in class? If no, why do students think that is? If so, why do students think that is? In class, students use the terms verbal/nonverbal communication, process and meaning in defining communication. Students should discuss why the teachers they interviewed did or did not use and/or understood those same terms.

4. Presentation of relevant and sufficient evidence to support general statements.

For example, students can not make general statements such as "the teacher had similar ideas as those discussed in class." Students must give specific teacher comments that directly comparing/contrasting to class material.

After the activity is completed students discuss in class what they learned from conducting their interviews. Questions asked by the instructor include:

1. Overall, do you believe that the communication issues we discussed in class affect the elementary/secondary classroom? If so, how?
2. After interviewing your teacher, what are the communication issues in which you want to be better prepared in?
3. What surprised you most about your teacher's responses?
4. What types of communication activities that your teacher described

would you like to try in your own classroom?

5. In the interview, what do you believe were the teacher's greatest/weakest communication skills?

Appraisal

Students like classroom experiences in which they can actively participate as well as see the applicable nature of the material they are learning (Sax, Astin & Arredondo., 1996). To see if students' believed this activity was useful in demonstrating the relevance of course material questionnaires were given to 128 students in four different *Communication Teachers for Teachers* sections during the 2004-2005 academic school year.

In questionnaire responses as well as teacher evaluations, students favorably rank the interview. From the interview, students learn that the communication issues discussed in class are an integral part of the elementary/secondary classroom. Frequently students note in their papers their surprise at discovering just how many communication issues they are studying are actually used on a daily basis in the teaching field. Students write about the relevance class material has to the elementary/secondary classroom experience. The interview gives students the opportunity to develop higher levels of learning (analysis). Students analyze the interviewee's responses and determine what communication issues are being used. Through the interview, students start to see that how they communicate to their students is as important as *what* they communicate to their students. Students enjoy meeting and interacting with individuals working in their respective fields of study and seeing how they use communication daily.

Students believed the application interview was a beneficial learning experience. All 128 students either strongly agreed or agreed with the statements "This interview was beneficial as a learning experience" and "I learned about the use of communication in the classroom." Students liked comparing what interviewees said to what was discussed in class (114), talking to someone who was actually working in the field of interest (103), creating their own questions (115) and learning about the types of communication the interviewees find most valuable (87). A student wrote "I was surprised that many of the issues we talked about in class the person I interviewed actually knew and believed in." Finally, one student commented, "It was something new, it got away from the same assignments as other classes."

Students either strongly agreed or agreed with the active approach of this learning experience. They liked the freedom to select the interviewee

of their choice (112), scheduling the interview at a time that accommodated *their schedule* (98) as well as *meeting new individuals* (102). An elementary education major said, "I enjoyed meeting and interacting with a teacher who is teaching the grade level I want to teach." Students were comfortable with the execution of the activity (110). Student response was mixed when rating which questions were the most useful. One student wrote "The mandatory questions helped me to start thinking about communication issues I was interested in." Students mention traveling (4), scheduling (10), finding an interviewee (13) and not thinking of follow up questions (11) as problems they had with this activity.

Conclusions

When developing student activities instructors can feel comfortable with going right to the source-students-can be helpful. Asking students what they think about a particular activity can help instructors adapt, change or eliminate the activity all together. For example, instructors found students enjoyed asking their own questions and often asked more than the two required. This past Fall, instructors started encouraging students to ask as many additional questions concerning class communication issues of their interest that time and the interviewee would allow. This activity can easily be used in any communication class. Variations include changing or eliminating the mandatory questions, having students interview more than one individual and comparing their comments to class material, and inviting professionals into the classroom where students conduct group interviews comparing comments to class material in class discussions. Limitations can include student traveling and finding interviewees. From their students, instructors found the application interview involves them in a personal way and this involvement could be used to demonstrate the relevance of the material they taught. The application interview gave students the opportunity to link practice to theory.

Appendix A

Communication for Teachers 103

Student's Name _____ Interview Date: _____

Educator's Name _____

Please evaluate the student who interviewed you and return this evaluation

form promptly. Your evaluation is an essential element in the student's learning. This form will be returned to the student. Thank you for your participation in this project.

1. When arranging for this interview, to what extent did the student explain the assignment?
2. Briefly describe the student's communication skills during the interview (e.g. appearance, manner, clarity, listening, questioning).
3. Please identify at least one area in which you think this student could improve (even if you think the student did well).
4. Please identify at least one strength (even if you think the student did poorly).
5. From your experience as an educator what is the best advice you would give to any student on the use of communication in education?

Appendix B

Communication for Teachers 103

Application Interview Rubric

Student Name

1. Clarity of Purpose	10 points
Comments:	
2. Review of questions and answers.	10 points
Required Questions, Two Additional Questions	
Comments:	
3. Application of ideas expressed by the teacher to class material	30 points
Comments:	
4. Presentation of relevant & sufficient evidence to support general statements	30 points
Comments:	
5. Grammar, spelling mistakes, organization	15 points
Comments:	
6. Copy of thank-you note	5 points
Comments:	

References

- Berko, R.C. (1993, Winter). Getting to know and talking about it. *Communication Teacher*, 7(2), 5-6.
- Bloom, B., Engelhart, M. Furst, E. Hill, W. & Krathwohl, D. (1965). *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives: The Classification of Educational Goals* (Handbook I: Cognitive domain). New York: David McKay Company.
- Bowers, A.A., Jr. (1993, Summer). The telephone interview. *Communication Teacher*, 7(4), 4-5.
- Cash, J., & Stewart, Jr. W.B. (2002). *Interviewing Principles & Practices* (10th ed.) New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Ekhaml, L. (1998). High-tech interviewing in the classroom. *School Library Media Activities Monthly*, 14, 38-39, 45.
- Ellis, B.G. (1991, Fall). The Interview as a teaching-dynamic. *Communication Teacher*, 6(1), 2-3.
- Garrett, R. (1998, Spring). Using self-critiquing techniques to teach interviewing skills. *Communication Teacher*, 2(3), 4-6.
- Hale, S. (1995) First-Year Sociology: The importance of theory. *Teaching Sociology*, 23, 48-52
- Harding, D.A. ((1995, Summer). Group Freud: Reinforcing interviewing skills. *Communication Teacher*, 9(3), 6-7.
- Hoecherl, A. (1985, Fall). Discussion interviews. *Communication Teacher*, 2-3.
- Isbell, T.L. (1993, Spring). The job interview: Watching both sides of the net. *Communication Teacher*, 7(3), 1-3.
- Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium (1992). *Interstate New Teacher Assessment and Support Consortium Principles*, Washington, D.C.: INTASC.
- Johnson, S.D., & Roelike, C.F. (1999). Secondary teachers and undergraduate education faculty members' perceptions of teaching effectiveness criteria: A national survey. *Communication Education*, 48(2), 127-38.
- McElhinney, J. (1994). Description of a task completed by a small learning group. Urbana, IL: ERIC Clearinghouse.
- Meister, D.G., & Melnick, S. A. (2003). The national new teachers study: Beginning teachers' concerns. *Action in Teacher Education*, 24(4). 87-94.
- National Communication Association (1988). *Communication Competencies for Teachers*, Washington, D.C.: NCA.

- Newton, D. P., & Newton, L.P. (2001, November). Choosing and judging teachers: What Heads and student teachers think matters. *Research in Education*, 66, 54-61.
- Renz, M.A. (1994, Winter). Job specific interviews. *Communication Teacher*, 6(2) 4-5.
- Rogovin, P. (1998). *Classroom Interviews: A World of Learning*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- Sax, L. J., Astin, A.W., Arredondo, M., & Korn, W. S. (1996). *The American College Teacher: National Norms for the 1995-'96 HERI Faculty Survey*. Los Angeles, CA: Higher Education Research Institute, UCLA Graduate School of Education & Information Studies.
- Sears, A. (1990). Enriching Social Studies with interviews. *History and Social Science Teacher*, 25, 95-98.
- Sharp, S. (1994, Winter). Varied approaches to teaching job interviewing. *Communication Teacher*, 8(2), 6-7.
- Steil, I. K., Braker, L. L., & Watson, K.W. (1983). *Effective Listening: Key to Your Success*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.
- Susskind, J. L. (1978, Spring). Teaching Ethnic Studies. *Social Studies Journal*, 7, 26-8.

***Nonverbal Communication:
A Frequent Guest on the Tonight Show with Jay Leno***

Amy J. Wolff

Instructor

Communication Studies

Winona State University

Winona, Minnesota 55987

awolff@winona.edu

Abstract

Contemporary research has demonstrated that educators must engage students by way of active learning strategies. Instructors must assist students in their journeys beyond recognition and regurgitation of theory to becoming dynamic educational participants. The following activity is a vehicle to explore different types of nonverbal communication via an active learning approach. More specifically, the activity asks collaborative student groups to identify and to recognize nonverbal communication behaviors within the monologue of The Tonight Show with Jay Leno. Explicit directions how to accomplish the activity are included. This activity is appropriate for inclusion in both hybrid communication courses and nonverbal communication courses.

Goal:

To explore the different types of nonverbal communication within an episode of the Tonight Show with Jay Leno via the use of collaborative learning groups.

Materials needed:

TV with VCR or DVD player.

A tape or DVD recording of Jay Leno's monologue (approximately 10 minutes long) from any episode of the Tonight Show.

Index cards

Time needed:

30-40 minutes

Rationale:

The following activity can be used in the basic introduction to communication course or as part of a nonverbal communication course. Furthermore, it will help students identify and recognize the different types of nonverbal communication.

This activity incorporates active learning into the course. Active learning is student-centered learning in which students move beyond the recognition and regurgitation of information. Kueker (2005) noted that an active learning approach should “engage students and then support their cognitive involvement in this learning process” (p. 11). Students move beyond their historically passive roles (like they might play in a traditional lecture session) to become dynamic educational participants.

This activity is also an example of collaborative learning. Collaborative learning, which is a type of active learning, assumes that participants actively construct knowledge rather than acquiring it from another person (Chen, Chung, Crane, Hlavach, Pierce, & Viall, 2001). This interactive process engages all participants in the shaping and testing of ideas created by the community of students.

What to do before the activity:

On each card list the name of one (1) type of nonverbal communication along with a short description of that type.

Set up VCR or DVD player.

Divide class into small groups (3-5 people).

What to do during the activity:

Distribute an index card to each group.

Ask one student in each group to share the definition of the nonverbal type (as noted on the index card) with their group members.

Play the recorded monologue.

Instruct students to identify at least three to five examples of that type of nonverbal communication they saw in the clip.

Following this, ask students to share their answers within their small groups.

Ask students to regroup into the large class and to share their two favorite answers with the group.

What to do after the activity:

Distribute one handout describing type the types of nonverbal communication to each member of the class. The student handout is included as Appendix A.

Give a few minutes for each person to peruse the handout

Instruct one member of each group to share the definition of the type of nonverbal communication they identified from the clip with the entire class.

Ask students to pair up and answer questions about nonverbal communication. Some example questions might include:

Which type of nonverbal communication was used the most during the monologue?

What kind of nonverbal communication do you find most important? Explain your answer.

Was there a type of nonverbal communication you had not considered before? Why do you think this is the case?

Explain whether you believe people in different cultures experience nonverbal communication differently. Support your answer with examples.

References:

- Chen, P., Chung, D.S., Crane, A., Hlavach, L., Pierce, L., & Viall, E.K. (2001). Pedagogy under construction: Learning to teach collaboratively. *Journalism & Mass Communication Educator*, 56(2), 25-42.
- Kueker, D. (2005, May/June). Inviting students to the active learning process. *Agricultural Education Magazine*, 11-13.
- Wood, J.T. (2003). *Communication in our lives*. Belmont, CA: Thompson/Wadsworth.

Appendix A

Types of Nonverbal Communication

Kinesics

Body positions and body motions, including those of the face (facial expressions)

Eye behavior and movement

Haptics

The study of nonverbal communication involving physical touch

Physical Appearance

Appearance

Physical qualities (sex, skin color, size, features)

Weight

Artifacts

Personal objects we use to announce our identities and personalize our environments.

Dress, jewelry

Objects we carry and use

Proxemics

The study of space and how we use it

Room arrangement of furniture (desks, chairs in an office)

Environmental Factors

Elements of setting that affect how we feel and act

Architecture, color, room design, lighting

Temperature

Sounds and smells

Chronemics

The study of how we perceive and use time to define identities and interaction

Punctuality

Paralanguage

Communication that is vocal but does not involve words themselves

Includes murmurs, gasps, laughing

Vocal qualities = volume, rhythm, pitch, inflection

Ums, ahs

Silence

Can communicate powerful messages

Can disconfirm others

Source: Wood, J.T. (2003). *Communication in our lives*. Belmont, CA: Thompson/Wadsworth.

16



CTAM Journal - Editor
Department of Speech Communication
Minnesota State University, Mankato
230 Armstrong Hall
Mankato, MN 56001

JOURNAL

Non-Profit Orgn.
U.S. Postage
PAID
Permit No. 202
Mankato, MN 56001

82*****MIXED ADC 565
CYNTHIA R. CARVER
2213 34TH AVE S
FARGO ND 58104-6562
|||