A VALUE APPROACH: SOME NOTES TOWARD THE EDUCATIONAL/COMPETITIVE ASPECTS OF FORENSIC PROGRAMS

In discussing the spirit of campus life, Ernest Boyer in his work entitled "College: The Undergraduate Experience" stated:

The undergraduate college should be held together by something more than plumbing, a common grievance over parking or football rallies in the fall. What students do in the dining halls, on the playing fields, and in the Rathskeller late at night all combine to influence the outcomes of the college education and the challenge, in the building of community, is to extend the resources for learning on the campus and see the academic and non-academic life as interlocked.1

Clearly, the experience in forensics "holds together" the campus experience for a significant group of students. What these students do while on a forensic trip, in tournament competitions, in van discussions, and in fast food restaurants all combine to condition and influence the outcome of their college education. Yet, little is written concerning the "interlocked" academic and non-academic forensic experience. The focus of this paper will concern itself with the implications of the dual educational/competitive aspects of the collegiate individual events program.

In specifically pointing to the goals of undergraduate education, Boyer concluded:

but in the end, students must be inspired by a larger vision, using the knowledge they have acquired to discover patterns, FORM VALUES (emphasis added), and advance the common good. The undergraduate experience at its best will move the student from competence to commitment.2

With this goal of commitment in mind, it appeared crucial to examine the implicit and explicit values inherent in a co-curricular forensic program. The formulation of values that result from the educational/competitive implications of forensics should not be serendipitous.
ABSTRACT


This study attempted to investigate the educational/competitive values in co-curricular forensics programs. The study made two major assumptions (1) that individual events programs should be linked to the curriculum and (2) that the identification and development of educational values would contribute to the improvement of forensic instruction.

It was the purpose of this study to offer an examination of five current studies in higher education suggesting curricular reform. These studies included: (a) Involvement in Learning: Realizing the Potential of American Higher Education (1984), (b) Project on Redefining the Meaning and Purpose of Baccalaureate Degrees (1985), (c) The report entitled "To Reclaim a Legacy," (1984) (d) College: The Undergraduate Experience (1987), and (e) 50 Hours: A Core Curriculum for College Students. (1989)

In addition, the study's purpose was to design a perspective for the identification and development of specific values in co-curricular forensic instruction. Finally, the study provided an analysis of value-oriented teaching strategies and their implications for the forensic community. The study found that the traditional forensic tournament as an instructional model was affirmed, and that three clusters of values in the non-academic aspect of the forensic program were deemed important. These clusters included (1) a sense of trust, acceptance, and belonging, (2) a sense of responsibility and self-respect, and (3) a sense of accomplishment.
The Purpose of the Study: It was the purpose of this study to offer (1) an examination of the five current studies in higher education suggesting curricular reform - especially noting their recommendations for the teaching of values, (2) to provide a brief perspective for the identification and development of specific values into co-curricular forensic instruction and (3) an analysis of values strategies and their implications for the forensic community.

Higher Education's Response of Value Crisis

Recently, our mass media have been busy reporting some kind of ethical crisis. Scam artists appear to be everywhere. Business has witnessed Ivan Boesky and Clifford Irving, politics has seen John Tower, Jim Wright, and David Duke, and religion has viewed the ethical demise of such leaders as Jim & Tammy Baker and Jimmy Swaggart. Education has not been exempt. In an ABC special report entitled Lying, Cheating, and Stealing in America, Sam Donaldson reported that a college president, Diego A. Navarrette, Jr., in Tucson, Arizona was forced to resign following the claim that he had a Masters degree when records showed he didn't; Miss Florida State University, Kim Hughes, was forced to resign her title because a friend used a false identification card to take a math test for her, and, finally, university students in Ames, Iowa were accused of stealing state equipment to make hundreds of fake drivers licenses.\(^3\)

Throughout the 1980's colleges and universities have not been silent with regard to these highly publicized endless breaches of conduct in society. A series of reports have underlined strong measures to encourage more effective teaching efforts. These reports suggest that more and more people - especially young people at the undergraduate level - seem to be leading their lives without clear purpose or direction. All of these reports indicate that undergraduate education has not been responsive to the value needs of students. These national reports issued in the eighties appear to signal higher education's concern for the quality of education. The authors and titles of these major reports are (1) the Study Group on the Conditions of Excellence in American Higher Education report entitled "Involvement in Learning: Realizing the Potential of American Higher Education" (1984), (2) the Association of American Colleges Committee report entitled "Project on Redefining the Meaning and Purpose of Baccalaureate Degrees" (1985), (3) William Bennett's report entitled "To Reclaim a Legacy" (1984), (4) Ernest Boyer's College: The Undergraduate Experience (1987), and (5) Lynne V. Cheney's 50 Hours: A Core Curriculum for College Students. These five reports address the failures of undergraduate programs to meet the needs of their students, and each has offered specific remedies for higher education to follow. Each of these reports has dealt with the issue of values education either implicitly or explicitly.

In the opening paragraphs of the text "Involvement in Learning: Realizing the Potential of American Higher Education" the authors explicitly stressed the importance of shared values in society and education. In this opening section entitled "A Matter of Trust", the report stated:

We write from a set of shared values about higher education in the United States. These values guided our discussion and shaped our analysis, conclusions and recommendations. They form the cornerstones of our renewal we hope will result from our efforts. The goals and the tasks our readers will share with us.

The United States must become a nation of educated people. Its citizens should be knowledgeable, creative, and open to ideas. Above all, they should learn how to learn so they can pursue knowledge throughout their lives and assist their children in the same quest.

To assure excellence, our colleges, community colleges and universities should establish and maintain high standards of student and institutional performance....\(^4\)
The major thrust of the report details the learning outcomes, goals, and directions in higher education for student involvement, educational institution's commitments toward realization of expectations, a system for assessment and providing feedback, and, finally, the implications of the conditions for excellence.

Thus, the report "Involvement in Learning: Realizing the Potential of American Higher Education" explicitly stressed that "shared values" form the cornerstone of the renewal of excellence in higher education. These values should guide the direction of students, institutions and faculty in their attempts to realize the full potential of higher education.

One year later, a second panel addressed the undergraduate curriculum and called for its immediate reform. The panel represented the Association of American Colleges and included such esteemed members as Ernest Boyer, president, Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching. David W. Benceman, president, Kalamazoo College, and Mark H. Curtis, president, Association of American Colleges. This report was entitled "Project on Redefining the Meaning and Purpose of Baccalaureate Degrees"; it called the bachelors degree "meaningless" and asked professors to lead in its restoration.6

In the section of the report outlining minimum requirements, the panel reported its concern for the teaching of values in the undergraduate program. In addressing the importance and the method of teaching values, the authors warned: "Students must learn to make real choices, assume responsibilities for their decisions, be comfortable with their own behavior, and know why."6

Continuing to point to the importance of values education for students, the report stated, "They must embody the values of a democratic society in order to fulfill the responsibilities of citizenship. They must be equipped to be perceptive and wise critics of that society, repositories of the values that make civilized and humane society possible."7

Stressing the importance of teaching value choice, decision, and judgement in a course of study, the report suggested:

We may be wary of final answers, but we cannot avoid the necessity of choice, decision, judgement. The curricular opportunities are legion: Abraham Lincoln willing to accept a constitutional amendment protecting slavery in the South in order to frustrate secession; Captain Voss wrestling with complex issues of innocence and justice, good and evil in Billy Budd: the tension between neighborhood and urban renewal in the city of your choice; Who owns the Elgin marbles? equity in the tax structure; barriers to voter registration, immigration, and import, Vietnam, Iran, Grenada - the choices and values; Holocaust - evil and guilt; Los Alamos - a scientific community in the real world, an inquiry into human tragedy in literature; crime and punishment.8

Accusing teachers, the report stated:

The opportunities are there, but they are too seldom taken by teachers so far gone into specialization and into the scientific understandings of their specialties that the challenges of bringing students into humanistic relationship with their subjects, into values and choice and judgement, are beyond their interest and capacity.8

In providing a remedy, the report stated:

Recruiting teachers with a professional commitment to teaching may be one way to focus subject matter on life, its quality, the agonies and joys, the demands and choices of growing up.10

Thus, a major contention in this report called for a more meaningful undergraduate degree. The teaching of values - choice, decision, and judgement were deemed crucial to the restoration of integrity in the bachelors degree. The report urged professors to use the opportunities provided by the curriculum to teach value decisions that profoundly affected history, literature and other courses of study.

In the third report, William Bennett's publication entitled "To Reclaim a Legacy", Bennett assailed the state of humanities on campus. In this report, the recommendation's section entitled "What Should Be Read" appeared to be of
importance to values education and in particular to the speech - communication teacher. Bennett's list included The Federalist Papers (as a list of editorials), speeches from Lincoln, King, Twain and Faulkner, and the Lincoln-Douglas debate.

Although Bennett does not explicitly argue for values education, the report argued for the teaching of values (1) contained in selected works, (2) in the transmission of culture and (3) found in the intellectual legacy of Western civilization. Indeed, writers like Nelson, Hirsch, Krauthammer, and Lipset have argued that culture - especially American culture - acts as a principal source of learned values.

The fourth major report of the eighties was Ernest Boyer's College: The Undergraduate Experience. The goal of the report according to Boyer was "to consider the undergraduate experience in America," and "to pay particular attention to the way the structures and procedures of colleges affect the lives of students." In this quest, attention to values appeared to surface in at least three major areas of discussion-the college's mission statements, the academic program, and the campus life. In the discussion of the mission statements of American colleges, Boyer found repeatedly two powerful traditions - individuality and community - were at the heart of the undergraduate experience. Expressing the value of these two traditions, Boyer concluded:

"The college, at its best, recognizes that although we live alone, we are deeply dependent on each other. Through an effective college education, students should become personally experienced and also committed to a common good."

In the discussion of the undergraduate academic experience, Boyer cited one of the courses found at Saint Anselm College for excellence. The course was built on the theme "Portraits of Human Greatness." This interdisciplinary program which views general education from a historical perspective focuses on moral and ethical questions surrounding selected periods in history and studies the vocations of influential people.

In the discussion of campus life, Boyer appeared to suggest that value's education was an appropriate responsibility for the entire college. Boyer wrote, "The undergraduate college should be held together by something more than plumbing, a common grievance over parking, or football rallies in the fall. What students do in their halls, on the playing fields, and in the raikheller late at night all combine to influence the outcome of higher education, and the challenge, in the building of community, is to extend the resources for learning on the campus and to see academic and non-academic life as intertwined."

Probably the most directive curricular reform was provided by Lynne V. Cheney's 50 Hours: A Core Curriculum for College Students. This National Endowment for the Humanities study argued for requiring 15 hours in Cultures and Civilization, 12 hours in foreign language, 6 hours in concepts in mathematics, 8 hours in foundations of the natural sciences and 6 hours in the social sciences and the modern world. It should be noted speech communication was specifically omitted from this required list. Although the oratory of Webster, Lincoln, Chief Joseph, and King and the poetry of Whitman, Dickinson and Frost were mentioned as recommended studies in American civilization, the teaching of these traditionally speech communication kinds of studies was left to teachers of history and literature.

In addition to these five major reports in the 1980's, individuals have responded to the perceived values problems in higher education. In an interview in U.S. News and World Report, Steven Muller, President of Johns Hopkins University undoubtedly overstated the case when he said that "universities are turning out potentially high skilled barbarians" and proceeded to go on to cite the lack of values teaching and that the university has lost its "source for a coherent value system as causes for these kinds of problems."
In speaking of the lack of ethical conduct and standards for college football, the deposed coach of Oklahoma University, Barry Switzer, joined President Muller in overstatement when he stated:

My student handbook at Oklahoma has a code of conduct and I never thought about saying Don't shoot your roommate, don't deal drugs, and don't rape.22

Yet, all three violations actually occurred on the Oklahoma team in the late 1980s.

The most pertinent and balanced look at the problem seemed to be found in Richard Morrill's book entitled Teaching Values in College. Sketching the history of values education in college, Morrill stated:

The mission of American colleges and universities has been strongly shaped by a historical commitment to moral education. This special attention to moral education has emerged from a variety of sources and has appeared in countless forms and under many names. It was inspired by the venerable inheritance of Greek philosophy, informed by the wisdom of European thinkers and practitioners, guided by the model of the British schools and colleges, and implemented in the characteristic American spirit of moral activism.23

Although Morrill offered this picture linking the historical development of moral education to the mission and history of higher education, Morrill extended his analysis to a sketch of the renewed emphasis on moral education and its most apparent goals. Arguing the goals that moral education attempts to achieve, Morrill listed:

1. introduce normative inquiry into higher learning, in order to supplement the typically narrow and value-free methodology of contemporary academic skepticism;

2. revitalize federal education, especially the humanities, and restore the integrative focus that has been lost;

3. provide students with an effective and rigorous preparation for dealing adequately with critical human choices, especially those that have moral consequences;

4. provide an education that affects both conduct and thought, the formation of character as well as the development of intellect.24

Thus, higher education has witnessed a society confronting significant issues of value. National reports on education have underscored the importance of teaching values in the classroom. It would appear the teaching of competitive speech has not escaped ethical issues in its practice.

VALUES AND THE INDIVIDUAL EVENTS INSTRUCTION

Forensics has not been immunized against this societal value disorder. McBath25 and Parsons26 each reported on ethical issues touching forensics. More recently, the National Forensic Association's statement on plagiarism27 and the discussion concerning the drafting of a statement "protecting literary integrity" at the 1990 National Individual Events tournament's coaches meeting28 seemed to suggest ethical questions surround both the public speaking and the interpretative events.

At least two dimensions of value teaching appeared relevant to the teaching of forensics. The first addressed the identification of certain values important to individual forensic programs, and the second spoke to the development of values within the forensic teaching model.

Identification. Milton Rokach noted that Kluckhohn's basic definition (conceptions of the desirable) is the most widely cited, his own definition refines and moves toward a more operational approach.

A value is an enduring belief that a specific mode of conduct or end-state existence is personally or socially preferable to an opposite or converse mode of conduct or end-state of existence. A values system is an enduring organization of beliefs concerning desirable modes of conduct or end-states of existence along a continuum of relative importance.29
Rokeach believed that there are values basic to all people. His value test included 18 terminal values, desirable end-states, and 18 instrumental values, means or standards. (See APPENDIX A).

It would appear several of these values are important to a wide variety of forensic programs, state forensic associations, as well as, national forensic associations. The National School Board Association considered the following values crucial to "a democratic and humane society" - altruism, compassion, courage, courtesy, generosity, honesty, industriousness, integrity, loyalty, obedience, punctuality, respect for authority, responsibility, self discipline, self respect, and tolerance. Although this list does overlap, and in some cases, repeat the terminal and instrumental values of Rokeach, they provided a perspective relative to teaching and education that appeared significant. Since forensic programs differ widely and are located in disparate kinds of colleges and universities across the United States, no attempt was made to attribute values to individual programs.

Development: Forensic instruction can be developed using value centered materials. In addressing this process, McCaleb and Dean cited the work of Harvard University's William Perry as a learning model. Perry (1970) devised a scheme of development that involved four major transitional phases: (1) dualism - simplistic thinking that is controlled by external authorities to whom the individual looks for the "right" answer, (2) multiplicity - recognition of a "right" process through which answers are sought, (3) relativism - shifting the focus of control from an external to an internal source so that personal responsibility is accepted for decisions made, and (4) commitment - realization of the interrelation between decision making and self identity and the acknowledgement of one's morality.

McCaleb and Dean used the forensic program to illustrate the Perry scheme. They wrote:

Many novices, in Perry's dualistic phase, rely absolutely on the opinions of the coach whom the novice views at "truth" or "right." By promoting multiplicity, the coach leads these eager learners from the "right" answer toward a command of effective processes that enable students to produce answers of their own.

Pointing to the final direction of the process, they concluded;

As the student gains in experience and confidence more decisions are made without consulting the coach (who has become less of an authority figure) and the competitor assumes greater responsibility for making decisions.

Clearly, the forensic community has had to address questions of ethics and values in its developmental conference as well as in its tournament practices. These questions of value are critical to forensic instruction. While forensic instruction is not and should not be substituted for courses in ethics, the values integrated in the study of forensics should be further identified and developed.

However, forensic instruction as a learning activity appears suited for the teaching of skills necessary for values education. Forensic instruction provides time for students to choose from alternatives, weigh consequences of each alternative, share and publicly affirm their choice and to evaluate and assess consequences of their public affirmation. This process has the design to encourage the development of student autonomy.

VALUE STRATEGIES AND THEIR PROGRAMATIC IMPLICATIONS

The recent studies on curriculum reform have caused colleges and universities to examine and assess their approaches to the teaching of values. These curricular
studies appear to have some significant implications for the co-curricular forensic community. It was felt these studies may be addressed by (1) an analysis of the implications for an individual forensic program and (2) an analysis of their impact on state and national organizations.

**INDIVIDUAL FORENSIC PROGRAM.** The individual forensic program appeared to be an excellent example of Boyer’s “interlocking academic and non-academic experience.” Recent studies in curriculum may help to clarify and underscore traditional values of the academic nature of individual events programs as well as their non-academic nature.

The Academic Life. The text of the report on excellence in undergraduate education entitled Involvement in Learning details the values of goal setting, student involvement, a system of assessment and feedback and conditions for excellence that appear to echo the traditional forensic tournament as an instructional model. The text of the report entitled Project on Redefining the Meaning and Purpose of the Baccalaureate Degrees pointed to the importance of teaching value choices, decision, and judgement in order to prepare for citizenship in a democratic society.

If responsible communication, basic to the American system is to serve democracy properly then forensic skills must be continued as essential educational disciplines. The Delphi study conceived to aid the Sedalia conference unanimously concluded: “Forensic directors should be more concerned about developing students abilities in analyzing controversies, building cases, developing communication skills, and less concerned with winning, developing reputations and collecting and processing information.” Bennett and Cheney, in their respective reports, called for studying specific kinds of persuasion, oratory, and approaches to poetry and literature. Forensic tournaments with their emphasis on communication analysis, public speaking and interpretative events appear to match those academic challenges.

The Non-Academic Life. Although academic integrity is probably the core value in most forensic programs, the non-academic aspects of a forensic program are crucially important to its success as a campus activity. At least these value-oriented aspects of the non-academic aspect of a forensic program appear important to note.

1) Trust, Acceptance, and Belonging. The concept of team appears in the parlor, research and in our award assemblies. The values inherent in the building of a team concept in a forensic program can be a significant part of the success of an individual program. Clearly, the commonality of tournament experience contributes heavily toward this concept.

2) Responsibility and Self-Respect. The concept of understanding self, the forensic team, and the college is a difficult challenge for many students. Although the forensic coach is primarily a teacher, he/she may often be cast in the role of adviser, counselor, or mentor in the personal development of college students.

3) A Sense of Accomplishment. Rokeach argued the sense of accomplishment was one of the top terminal values for education. The concept of achieving and progressing in tournament competition under the educational guidelines of goals, involvement, assessment and challenging standards was deemed valuable in forensic activity. However, the social perspective derived from forensics sometimes calls for an understanding of how ability and award becomes casual rather than casual in their formation. This integration of conflicting values is a challenging situation for both student and coach.

**STATE AND NATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS.** These studies pose a unique challenge to state and national forensic organizations. The emphasis on the values inherent in pursuit of excellence and equality will require constant vigilance. The traditional forensic tournament model has been reaffirmed as a substantive educational paradigm. The creative or imaginative dimension of these organizations appeared to be the most vulnerable. The traditional events are not always adaptable to changing educational trends. A possible solution may be the adoption of a “creative event.” A creative event (experimental/wild card) that would address relevance, timeliness, and activeness of experimentation in the field. This kind of event may provide the organizations with a structure for adaptability and versatility required to meet future changes.
Younger: A Value Approach: Some Notes Toward the Educational/Competitive A

END NOTES


2 Ibid.

3 "Lying, Cheating and Stealing in America," ABC's Burning Questions aired June 1, 1989, Toledo, Ohio; Channel 24 WNWO.


6 Ibid. p. 13.

7 Ibid. p. 20.

8 Ibid. p. 21.

9 Ibid.

10 Ibid.


17 Ibid. p. 69.

18 Ibid. p. 95.

19 Ibid. p. 177.


22 Valerie Lynn Dorsey, "Update", USA Today, June 9, 1989, p. ISC.


24 Ibid. p. 7.


28 Personal notes of author.


32 Ibid.

33 Ibid.

34 Ibid.


36 Rokeach. p. 263.
APPENDIX A

The Value Survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Terminal Values</th>
<th>Instrumental Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A COMFORTABLE LIFE (a prosperous life)</td>
<td>AMBITIOUS (hard-working, aspiring)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AN EXCITING LIFE (a stimulating, active life)</td>
<td>BROADMinded (open-minded)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A SENSE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT (lasting contribution)</td>
<td>CAPABLE (competent, effective)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A WORLD AT PEACE (free of war and conflict)</td>
<td>CHEERFUL (light-hearted, joyful)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A WORLD OF BEAUTY (beauty of nature and the arts)</td>
<td>CLEAN (neat, tidy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EQUALITY (brotherhood, equal opportunity for all)</td>
<td>COURAGEOUS (standing up for your beliefs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAMILY SECURITY (taking care of loved ones)</td>
<td>FORGIVING (willing to pardon others)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FREEDOM (independence, free choice)</td>
<td>HELPFUL (working for the welfare of others)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAPINESS (contentedness)</td>
<td>HONEST (sincere, truthful)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INNER HARMONY (freedom from inner conflict)</td>
<td>IMAGINATIVE (imaginative, creative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MATURE LOVE (sexual and spiritual intimacy)</td>
<td>INDEPENDENT (self-reliant, self-sufficient)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATIONAL SECURITY (protection from attack)</td>
<td>INTELLECTUAL (intelligent, reflective)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLEASURE (an enjoyable, leisurely life)</td>
<td>LOGICAL (consistent, rational)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SALVATION (saved, eternal life)</td>
<td>LOVING (affectionate, tender)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELF-RESPECT (self-esteem)</td>
<td>OBEDIENT (docile, respectful)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOCIAL RECOGNITION (respect, admiration)</td>
<td>POLITE (courteous, well-mannered)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRUE FRIENDSHIP (close companionship)</td>
<td>RESPONSIBLE (dependable, reliable)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WISDOM (a mature understanding of life)</td>
<td>SELF-CONTROLLED (restrained, self-disciplined)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>