

Nick Whalen
History 530 - Minnesota 1862
Final Project Lesson Plan

Project Title: The Role of Civil War Letters and Historical Accuracy in Young Adult Historical Fiction

Project Type: Lesson Plan

Primary Sources:

Christie Family Letters. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society.
<http://www.mnhs.org/library/christie/intropage.php>

A collection of primary source letters written as correspondence between the three brothers from the Christie family and family members back at home during the Civil War.

Letters from Charles Goddard. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society. *Orrin F. Smith Family Correspondence.*

Direct Access: <http://www2.mnhs.org/library/findaids/P1434.xml>

Searchable Access:

<https://search.mnhs.org/?q=Charles+Goddard&tab=websites&Search.x=0&Search.y=0>

A collection of primary source letters written as correspondence between Charles Goddard of the First Minnesota Volunteers and his family, particularly his brother. Goddard is the subject of the fictional piece in the lesson, so these letters are critical reading.

Various Additional Primary Sources are featured within the books listed below, particularly in Basset's book and Carly's book. Additionally, primary source material is contained in Edward Longacre's article.

Academic Journal Sources:

Gannaway, Wayne. "The Perils of Peace: Frederick Douglass, Winona, and Civil Rights in Minnesota after the Civil War." *Minnesota History*, Vol. 66, No. 2 (Summer 2018). pp. 74-84. <http://collections.mnhs.org/MNHHistoryMagazine/articles/66/v66i02p74-84.pdf>

This secondary source focuses on the town of Winona during the post-war period as it struggled with many of the questions of Reconstruction and race relations. Winona was, coincidentally, Charles Goddard's hometown.

Longacre, Edward G. (ed.), "'Indeed We Did Fight', A Soldier's Letters Describe the First Minnesota Regiment Before and During the First Battle of Bull Run." *Minnesota History*, Vol. 47, No. 2 (Summer, 1980). pp. 63-70.
<http://collections.mnhs.org/MNHHistoryMagazine/articles/47/v47i02p063-070.pdf>

A primary source collection from the correspondence of Jasper N. Searles, a member of the First Minnesota Volunteers Infantry. The source focuses primarily on the early experiences of the regiment.

Larson, Douglas E. "Private Alfred Gales: From Slavery to Freedom." *Minnesota History*, Vol 57, no. 6 (Summer, 2001). pp. 274-283

A secondary account of the experience of Alfred Gales, a probable escaped slave who served with the Union, which includes information about his life in Minnesota after the war.

Newson, Mary Jeannette. "Memories of Fort Snelling in Civil War Days." *Minnesota History* 15, no. 4 (1934). pp. 395-404. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/20161148>.

A primary source account of the experiences of a family member of someone who served in the military at Fort Snelling during the Civil War. The source is written by Mary Jeannette Newson, daughter of Thomas McClean Newson, who was a volunteer.

Sartin, Jeffrey S. "Infectious Diseases during the Civil War: The Triumph of the 'Third Army'." *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (1993). pp. 580-84. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/4457020>.

This article is an in-depth study of the prevalence and effects of infectious diseases during the Civil War.

Scher, Adam. "Long Remember: Minnesota at Gettysburg and Vicksburg." *Minnesota History* 63, no. 6 (2013). pp. 220-35. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/43492618>.

This secondary article focuses on several of the Minnesota regiments from the Civil War, but focuses specifically on their actions at the Battle of Vicksburg.

Tholl, Perry Thomas. "THE TYPOGRAPHICAL FRATERNITY of the FIRST MINNESOTA VOLUNTEERS." *Minnesota History* 62, no. 7 (2011). pp. 258-67. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/23066803>.

This secondary account incorporates some primary sources in order to demonstrate the unusual activity undertaken by the First Minnesota Volunteers: printing a newspaper to share experiences of the regiment.

Books:

Atkins, Annette. *Minnesota and the Civil War: The War that Touched Us All*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2007.

This book provides a narrative and an account of how the war was experienced by Minnesotans of all different backgrounds, including soldiers, civilians, people of diverse races, and women.

Basset, M.H. *From Bull Run to Barstow Station: Edward H. Bassett*. St. Paul, MN: North Central Publishing Company, 1962.

A primary source collection from the correspondence of Edward H. Bassett. The collection was compiled and published by Edward Bassett's son.

Carly, Kenneth. *Minnesota in the Civil War: An Illustrated History*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2006.

This book contains a variety of both primary source materials from each of the Minnesota regiments that served in the Civil War as well as secondary narratives of the events of the Civil War experienced by each regiment.

Leehan, Brian. *Pale Horse at Plum Run: The First Minnesota at Gettysburg*. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2002.

A comprehensive secondary source documenting the actions of the First Minnesota Volunteers at the Battle of Gettysburg.

Moe, Richard. *The Last Full Measure: The Life and Death of the First Minnesota Volunteers*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2001.

This source follows the First Minnesota Volunteers throughout their service during the Civil War.

Wright, James A. *No More Gallant a Deed: a Civil War Memoir of the First Minnesota Volunteers*. Edited by Steven J. Keillor. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2001.

A collection of primary sources that are compiled to form a memoir of the life James A. Wright, a soldier in the First Minnesota Volunteers.

(Historical Young Adult Fiction Piece, book):

Paulsen, Gary. *Soldier's Heart*. New York: Dell Publishing, 1998.

The fictionalized story of the lived experiences of Charles Goddard. Goddard served in the First Minnesota Volunteers and was injured at Gettysburg.

Description of Lesson Plan/Justification:

My plan for this lesson plan or unit would be to have students begin by reading an example of young adult fiction about the Civil War. Gary Paulsen's Soldier's Heart follows the story of Charles Goddard, a boy from Winona who lied about his age to join the Minnesota First Volunteers at age 15. The author acknowledges at the end of the book that the book is not just based on Goddard's experiences, but rather the experiences of Civil War soldiers more generally. In this lesson, or rather unit, students would engage with primary source materials, excerpts from books about the Minnesotans' experiences in the Civil War, and academic journal articles that analyze Civil War realities. I would ask students to find common themes, focusing specifically on life in camp or at Fort Snelling, disease and medicine, the experience of battle, emotions and philosophy towards war, interactions with other people outside of and within the war, and experiences of Black Americans and/or enslaved persons. Then, students would revisit their notes from their readings of Soldier's Heart to begin their analyses. The goal would be to find parallels between the fictional depiction of Charles Goddard and the real, lived experiences

of the soldiers in the primary sources, which include Goddard's letters, as well as the books and academic articles of scholarship on the topic. **My primary learning goal is for students to recognize and analyze the presence of actual historical research in creating stories that teach children about an event like the Civil War.** Students may also question how popular depictions of the Civil War depart from the reality experienced by soldiers. In conjunction with my primary learning goal, students will address goal areas 5 and 7 from the specific learning outcomes from MNSU. These goals are satisfied by engaging with the variety of primary and scholarly materials compiled, and applying knowledge through analysis and explanations relating to that analysis. Goal 7 appears specifically in the third of the series of lessons, while goal #5 is present throughout the series.

This series of lessons would be the culminating project for the course, so the workload seems manageable and reasonable. However, it is likely that students will require at least a couple of weeks, mainly during time outside of class, to complete the full assignment.

Lesson Plan, Objective #1

Reading Source: Paulsen, Gary. *Soldier's Heart*. New York: Dell Publishing, 1998.

Goal: *Students will identify key components of Civil War experience and reality as demonstrated the fictionalization of the Minnesota First Volunteers soldier Charles Goddard. Students will complete a guided notes organizer to document examples in the story in several major categories. These notes will be used to compare the fictionalized character's experiences against the historical experiences presented in primary and secondary sources that they will analyze after reading the book.*

Anticipatory Set:

- 1) Conduct a brief class discussion of the following questions:
 - a) Have you ever read a piece of historical fiction? If so, did you read it for pleasure or as a requirement for a class?
 - b) How much actual historical value is there in works of historical fiction?
 - c) Should works of historical fiction, therefore, be used in the process of historical inquiry for young learners with limited historical knowledge? Why or why not?

New Information:

- 1) Distribute copies of Soldier's Heart by Gary Paulsen to the class.
- 2) Contextualize the book by explaining that the main character, Charles Goddard, did actually exist. Goddard did lie about his age to be able to join the First Minnesota Volunteers, and fought in many of the major engagements in which his regiment was involved. However, because there is no feasible means through which to accurately attributed all of Goddard's actions and experiences in the book, the character is shaped by records of soldiers in that and other regiments more generally.
- 3) Finally, explain that authors of historical fiction depend on primary and secondary sources to create accurate historical depictions in many of the same ways that historians do when creating non-fiction, secondary scholarship.

Application:

- 1) Students will read Soldier's Heart by Gary Paulsen.
- 2) Students will use the attached guided notes sheet to record instances and examples from book that fit, depict, or describe information about the following categories:
 - a) Descriptions and/or examples of life and activities in camp.
 - b) Descriptions and/or examples of battles including Bull Run and Gettysburg.
 - c) Descriptions and/or examples of encounters with Black Americans, enslaved persons, or Black soldiers.
 - d) Descriptions and/or examples of correspondence with individuals (particularly family members who remained at home) through letters.
 - e) Descriptions and/or examples of soldier-to-soldier interactions.
 - f) Descriptions and/or examples of internal emotions, morale, and health.
- 3) Students will submit guided notes once they are complete for review by the instructor.

Goal Review/Conclusion:

- 1) Students will complete a brief (one page) reflection that describes how the presentation of the Civil War in Soldier's Heart either confirmed or challenged beliefs they already held about the life of soldiers in the Civil War.

Name: _____

Guided Notes Organizer: *Soldier's Heart* Descriptions and Examples (Student Form)

Use the following notes organizer to record information about Charles Goddard's experiences during or descriptions of key concepts from the Civil War. Remember to record page numbers for your reference. Your descriptions can be direct quotations or your own paraphrasing.

Life and activities in field camps or at Fort Snelling	
Realities of battles *include Bull Run and Gettysburg	

<p>Encounters with Black Americans and/or enslaved persons, or experiences of Black soldiers</p>	
<p>Corresponding with others through letters</p>	

<p>Interactions between soldiers</p>	
<p>Internal emotions, morale, and health</p>	

Lesson Plan, Objective #2

Reading Sources: *Primary source selections chosen by students from the following options; must select "Letters from Charles Goddard" and at least two (2) additional primary source collections:*

Letters from Charles Goddard. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society. *Orrin F. Smith Family Correspondence*.

Direct Access: <http://www2.mnhs.org/library/findaids/P1434.xml>

Searchable Access:

<https://search.mnhs.org/?q=Charles+Goddard&tab=websites&Search.x=0&Search.y=0>

Plus at least two (2) collections from the following:

Basset, M.H. *From Bull Run to Barstow Station: Edward H. Bassett*. St. Paul, MN: North Central Publishing Company, 1962.

Christie Family Letters. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society.

<http://www.mnhs.org/library/christie/intropage.php>

Longacre, Edward G. (ed.), "'Indeed We Did Fight', A Soldier's Letters Describe the First Minnesota Regiment Before and During the First Battle of Bull Run." *Minnesota History*, Vol. 47, No. 2 (Summer, 1980). pp. 63-70.

<http://collections.mnhs.org/MNHHistoryMagazine/articles/47/v47i02p063-070.pdf>

Newson, Mary Jeannette. "Memories of Fort Snelling in Civil War Days." *Minnesota History* 15, no. 4 (1934). pp. 395-404. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/20161148>.

Wright, James A. *No More Gallant a Deed: a Civil War Memoir of the First Minnesota Volunteers*. Edited by Steven J. Keillor. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2001.

Goal: *Students will analyze primary source materials from the Civil War as written by soldiers and relatives of soldiers. Through their analyses, students will identify parallels to and departures from the descriptions offered of comparable aspects in Soldier's Heart by Gary Paulsen. Using an additional copy of the notes organizer, students will record references and examples evident in the primary sources they have selected. This is the second lesson in the series or unit.*

Anticipatory Set:

- 1) Conduct a brief class discussion of the following questions:
 - a) What are the key differences between a primary and a secondary source?

- b) Why are primary sources so valuable to historians or to anyone studying events or people from the past?
- c) Do any pitfalls, dangers, or difficulties exist when analyzing primary sources? If so, what are some examples of these?

New Information:

- 1) Provide students with their choices of primary source materials from which to make their reading selections.
- 2) Explain that the Goddard family letters are the one required primary source collection, but they may select two additional primary source collections from the remaining options.
- 3) Students' analyses of the primary sources should focus on the same categories targeted while reading Soldier's Heart, so that they are able to make comparisons at the end of the series of lessons.

Application:

- 1) Students make primary source material selections. They must select at least three total primary source collections, including the required reading from Charles Goddard's letters. Students must only analyze as many individual sources from each collection as is necessary to have multiple examples (a minimum of three) of each of the six focus areas.
- 2) While reading the primary sources, students should complete the attached guided notes organizer, much like they completed while reading Soldier's Heart. The guided notes organizer will again ask students to identify, record, and include citation information for the following categories:
 - a) Descriptions and/or examples of life and activities in camp.
 - b) Descriptions and/or examples of battles including Bull Run and Gettysburg.
 - c) Descriptions and/or examples of encounters with Black Americans, enslaved persons, or Black Soldiers.

- d) Descriptions and/or examples of correspondence with individuals (particularly family members who remained at home) through letters.
 - e) Descriptions and/or examples of soldier-to-soldier interactions.
 - f) Descriptions and/or examples of internal emotions, morale, and health.
- 3) Students will submit guided notes once they are completed to the instructor for review.

Goal Review:

- 1) Students will be provided with class time to discuss their findings in a “jigsaw” style in groups of three or four individuals.
- 2) This group time should be used to share examples of the key focus areas identified on the guided notes organizers from the variety of sources provided.
- 3) Students should be encouraged to incorporate the findings of their peers into their own if others identified strong references that were missed by individuals, as well as to challenge the findings of their peers if they feel another’s interpretation of a primary source is inconsistent with what the author actually meant.

Name: _____

Guided Notes Organizer: *Primary Source Descriptions and Examples (Student Form)*

Use the following notes organizer to record information from your primary sources regarding experiences during or descriptions of key concepts from the Civil War. Remember to record citations including source and page or date. Your descriptions should be direct quotations.

Life and activities in field camps or at Fort Snelling	
Realities of battles *include Bull Run and Gettysburg	

<p>Encounters with Black Americans and/or enslaved persons, or experiences of Black soldiers</p>	
<p>Corresponding with others through letters</p>	

<p>Interactions between soldiers</p>	
<p>Internal emotions, morale, and health</p>	

Lesson Plan, Objective #3

Reading Sources: *Secondary source selections chosen by students from the following options; students must select at least three journal articles in addition to at least one book from the following options:*

Books (1):

Atkins, Annette. *Minnesota and the Civil War: The War that Touched Us All*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2007.

Carly, Kenneth. *Minnesota in the Civil War: An Illustrated History*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2006.

Leehan, Brian. *Pale Horse at Plum Run: The First Minnesota at Gettysburg*. St. Paul: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2002.

Moe, Richard. *The Last Full Measure: The Life and Death of the First Minnesota Volunteers*. St. Paul, MN: Minnesota Historical Society Press, 2001.

Academic Journal Articles (3):

AT LEAST ONE OF:

Gannaway, Wayne. "The Perils of Peace: Frederick Douglass, Winona, and Civil Rights in Minnesota after the Civil War." *Minnesota History*, Vol. 66, No. 2 (Summer 2018). pp. 74-84. <http://collections.mnhs.org/MNHHistoryMagazine/articles/66/v66i02p74-84.pdf>

Larson, Douglas E. "Private Alfred Gales: From Slavery to Freedom." *Minnesota History*, Vol 57, no. 6 (Summer, 2001). pp. 274-283

PLUS ONE OR TWO OF:

Sartin, Jeffrey S. "Infectious Diseases during the Civil War: The Triumph of the 'Third Army'." *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, Vol. 16, no. 4 (1993). pp. 580-84. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/4457020>.

Scher, Adam. "Long Remember: Minnesota at Gettysburg and Vicksburg." *Minnesota History* 63, no. 6 (2013). pp. 220-35. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/43492618>.

Tholl, Perry Thomas. "THE TYPOGRAPHICAL FRATERNITY of the FIRST MINNESOTA VOLUNTEERS." *Minnesota History* 62, no. 7 (2011). pp. 258-67. <http://www.jstor.org.ezproxy.mnsu.edu/stable/23066803>.

Goal: *Students will complete a final analysis in this series of lessons by identifying examples and descriptions of the six categories previously identified regarding Civil War experiences. The secondary sources, particularly the academic journal articles, provide specific information that is*

especially targeted at specific aspects to which students have paid attention. At least two of these sources will provide strong information about Black soldiers and their experiences after the war, helping to satisfy Goal Area 7: Human Diversity. Again, students will be assisted by the now familiar guided notes organizer while targeting the same areas of focus as in previous lessons.

Anticipatory Set:

- 1) Students should respond to a writing prompt with a one paragraph answer. After recording their responses, students will share their paragraph with a partner in a turn and talk. The writing prompt to which students must respond: *What is the value of exploring multiple secondary sources when conducting historical inquiry?*

New Information:

- 1) Students will make their secondary source selections from the sources provided. Each student must select at least one book, one or both of the journal articles by Gannaway and Larson, and an additional one or two sources from the other journal articles for a total of three.
- 2) Explain that students will once more target their analyses at identifying passages that provide information regarding the six categories of focus from previous lessons.

Application:

- 1) While reading their secondary sources, students should complete the guided notes organizer much like they did when reading Soldier's Heart and their primary sources.
- 2) The guided notes organizer will again ask students to identify, record, and include citation information for the following categories:
 - a) Descriptions and/or examples of life and activities in camp.
 - b) Descriptions and/or examples of battles including Bull Run and Gettysburg.
 - c) Descriptions and/or examples of encounters with Black Americans, enslaved persons, or Black Soldiers.

- d) Descriptions and/or examples of correspondence with individuals (particularly family members who remained at home) through letters.
 - e) Descriptions and/or examples of soldier-to-soldier interactions.
 - f) Descriptions and/or examples of internal emotions, morale, and health.
- 3) Students will submit guided notes once they are completed to the instructor for review.

Goal Review:

- 1) Again, students will jigsaw knowledge with 2-3 other individuals in the class after completing their notes from the secondary sources.
- 2) Students should again be encouraged to incorporate the findings of their peers into their own if others identified strong references that were missed, as well as to challenge the findings of their peers if they feel another's interpretation of a secondary source is inconsistent with what the writer actually meant.
- 3) Students will have potentially read different sources. Therefore, it is important to provide time for students to share their knowledge with others in order to provide a more complete mastery of the concepts.

Name: _____

Guided Notes Organizer: Secondary Source Descriptions and Examples (Student Form)

Use the following notes organizer to record information from your secondary sources regarding experiences during or descriptions of key concepts from the Civil War. Remember to record citations including source/author and page. Your descriptions may be direct quotations or may also be paraphrased.

Life and activities in field camps or at Fort Snelling	
Realities of battles *include Bull Run and Gettysburg	

<p>Encounters with Black Americans and/or enslaved persons, or experiences of Black soldiers</p>	
<p>Corresponding with others through letters</p>	

<p>Interactions between soldiers</p>	
<p>Internal emotions, morale, and health</p>	

Lesson Plan, Objective #4 (Final Product)

Goal: *Students have now completed the three preparatory steps required to be able to write about their findings overall. Throughout the first three lessons, students have read a piece of young adult historical fiction, as well as a variety of primary and secondary sources about the experiences of Civil War soldiers and the effects of the Civil War on individuals from different races in the United States at the time. As a final product for the series of lessons, students will be asked to write a comparative essay of at least five pages about the fictionalized depiction of the Civil War in Soldier's Heart and the primary and secondary accounts of the Civil War as presented in the sources they have analyzed. Ultimately, the questions that their thesis and subsequent paper should answer are: does Soldier's Heart hold enough real historical value as a piece of fiction to warrant its use as an introductory tool for a young person first learning about the Civil War? Where does the book offer the strongest parallels with historical reality? Where does the book most detrimentally depart from historical reality?*

Anticipatory Set:

- 1) A class discussion which focuses on two questions that will help students to consider their positions about two of the critical components of their essays:
 - a) *Where does Soldier's Heart offer the strongest parallels with historical reality?*
 - b) *Where does Soldier's Heart most detrimentally depart from historical reality?*

New Information:

- 1) Introduce the final product: a five page (minimum) essay that answers the three questions from the goal.
- 2) Display and distribute the assignment description and rubric (attached below) for grading that will be used to assess students' essays.

Application:

- 1) Students will write their essays.

Goal Review:

- 1) Assessment of students' essays using the attached rubric.

Assignment Sheet for Final Product: Soldier's Heart versus Historical Reality

Your task:

In an essay, take a position on the following guiding question: does Soldier's Heart hold enough real historical value as a piece of fiction to warrant its use as an introductory tool for a young person first learning about the Civil War?

In order to support your position, you must focus on providing examples of strengths and weaknesses of the historical value of the book by comparing your findings from your six categories from your notes about the book to your notes from your primary and secondary sources.

Requirements:

- 1) Minimum of five pages, double-spaced.
- 2) In-text citations using either MLA parenthetical citations or Chicago footnote citations.
- 3) A bibliography in either MLA or Chicago format listing your specific sources.
- 4) Each of the six areas of focus from the guided notes organizers must be addressed.
- 5) Guiding question is answered and supported

Rubric for grading:

	4 - Excellent	3 - Proficient	2 - Developing	1 - Beginning	0 - No Attempt
Required Components: citations, bibliography, length	All required components are present without errors.	All required components are present with minor errors.	Some required components are missing or some major errors	Many required components missing or frequent major errors	
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Life and activities in field camps or at Fort Snelling	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Realities of battles *include Bull Run and Gettysburg	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	

	fictionalization	fictionalization	strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization		
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Encounters with Black Americans and/or enslaved persons, or experiences of Black soldiers	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Corresponding with others through letters	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Interactions between soldiers	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	
Fiction/Non-fiction Comparison: Internal emotions, morale, and health	Comparisons offer a variety of examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer at least two examples and demonstrate strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons offer less than two examples or the examples do not explain the absence of examples of both strengths and weaknesses of fictionalization	Comparisons are weak or do not directly address the specific category of comparison.	
Strength of thesis and overall support of thesis	Thesis and support of the thesis are overall exceptional and convincing	Thesis and support of the thesis are overall strong and mostly convincing	Thesis and support have weaknesses and is somewhat convincing	Thesis and support are inconsistent, incomplete, or unconvincing	

Scale:

32-29: A

28-26: B

25-22: C

21-19: D

18-0: N